

The background of the cover features a complex, abstract pattern of thin, overlapping, swirling lines in a reddish-brown hue, creating a sense of movement and depth against the dark teal background.

anglistica^{aion}

AN INTERDISCIPLINARY JOURNAL



UniorPress

Anglistica AION
an interdisciplinary journal

A double blind peer-reviewed journal, published twice a year by the Università degli studi di Napoli
“L’Orientale”

Editor

Anna Maria Cimitile

Editorial committee

Rossella Ciocca

Donatella Izzo

C. Maria Laudando

Katherine E. Russo

Editorial assistant

Giuliana Regnoli

International Advisory Board

Philip Armstrong, University of Canterbury, NZ

Bill Ashcroft, University of New South Wales, Australia

Rey Chow, Duke University, Durham, USA

David Crystal, University of Wales, Bangor, UK

Richard Dyer, King’s College, University of London, UK

Susan Stanford Friedman, University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA

Simon Gikandi, Princeton University, USA

Paul Gilroy, King’s College, London, UK

Stuart Hall, The Open University, UK (2007-2014)

Isaac Julien, London, UK

Yamuna Kachru, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA (2007-2013)

Angela McRobbie, Goldsmiths, University of London, UK

Penny Siopis, Cape Town, SA

Sidonie Smith, University of Michigan, USA

Trinh T. Minh-ha, University of California, Berkeley, USA

Marina Warner, Birkbeck College, University of London, UK

Zoë Wicomb, University of Strathclyde, UK

Robyn Wiegman, Duke University, USA

Donald Winford, Ohio State University, USA

© Università degli studi di Napoli “L’Orientale”

ISSN: 2035-8504

Autorizzazione del Tribunale di Napoli n. 63 del 5 novembre 2013



Vol. 22, issue 2 (2018)

Translating LSP in Literature through a Gender Perspective

Edited by Eleonora Federici, Federico Pio Gentile and Margaret Rogers



Table of Contents

<i>Eleonora Federici and Margaret Rogers</i> Introduction: Translating LSP in Literature through a Gender Perspective	1
Literary Translations and Specialized Lexicon	
<i>Cristina Carrasco</i> (Post)Translation, Ideology and Female Body: The Translation of the Body in <i>Americanah</i> , by Chimamanda Adichie	5
<i>Emilio Amideo</i> Translating Gender and Race through Music in Jackie Kay's <i>Trumpet</i>	15
<i>Eleonora Federici and Luisa Marino</i> Literary Texts Crossing-Over: A Translation Proposal of Suneeta Peres da Costa's <i>Saudade</i> into Italian	29
Education for Gender Equality	
<i>Isabel Garcia Perez</i> Gender and Linguistic Sexism in Elisabetta Cametti's <i>I guardiani della Storia</i> and Its Translation into English and Spanish	43
<i>Maria del Pino Valero Cuadra and Antonio Lérida Muñoz</i> Women in Children's and Young Adults' Literature and Its Translation: Female Characters in <i>Manolito Gafotas</i> and <i>Kika Superbruja</i>	55
Literary Genres, Specialised Languages and Adaptations	
<i>Federico Pio Gentile</i> Crime and Gender as Popularised Discourse in Maureen Jennings' <i>A Journeyman to Grief</i>	69
<i>Nicolangelo Becce</i> Adapting George R. R. Martin's <i>A Game of Thrones</i> : A Corpus Linguistics Analysis from a Gender Perspective	83
<i>Eleonora Sasso</i> Subtitling Gender and Humour in Douglas McGrath's <i>Emma</i>	95

Marilicia Di Paolo

The Feminist Revolution of Words: Translating the Feminist Discourse through Newspapers

103

Reviews

Esterino Adami

A Review of Emilia Di Martino, *Celebrity Accents and Public Identity Construction: Analyzing
Geordie Stylizations* (London and New York: Routledge, 2019)

115

Lellida Martinelli

A Review of Julian Wolfreys ed., *New Critical Thinking: Criticism to Come*
(Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2017)

117

Notes on Contributors

119

Introduction.
Translating LSP in Literature through a Gender Perspective

Specialised or ‘LSP’ translation and literary translation have often been presented as two worlds apart. Scholars have in particular highlighted the differences between literary and specialised translation by underlining the creativity of the first and underplaying the technical complexity which often characterises the second. Literary translation and specialised translation have traditionally been considered as two research fields in their own right.¹ Highlighting the differences between the scope of the two fields Peter Newmark talks about a ‘divided’ profession – and, we could add, research landscape– where “one area is concerned with knowledge, facts and ideas, information, and reality; the other with human individuals, nature and the occupied planet in the imagination; the first with facts, the second with values; the first with clarity of information, the second with style as a reflection of character”.²

The present monographic issue aims to broaden the discussion on the supposed binary of literary-specialised translation starting from two premises: the first is that literature can be viewed as a specialised field in which the translator needs to acquire specific competences relating to literary genres that will enable him/her to shape their translations appropriately; the second is that specialised vocabulary pervades literary texts according to their content and topic. Indeed, literary texts engage with many aspects of our life from the banal to the sophisticated and include terms and expressions from various domains.

As for the first premise, the translator of a literary text needs some specific competences dealing with stylistics and narratology and should also be ready to do some archive work on the authors, to know who they are, where they live (or where they lived), their life-story, the works they have written and, last but not least, also which of their works have been translated and into which language/s. The translator needs to become closer to the author’s own culture in order to be able to detect anticipated intertextual references in the source text. From a linguistic but also ‘technical’ point of view, in order to translate effectively s/he must be able to recognise narrative styles, textual typologies, rhetorical figures, literary tropes and narrative elements recurrent in the source text be it prose, poetry or drama. Literature possesses its linguistic and rhetorical characteristics and specific textual forms, and from this perspective, can be considered ‘specialised’, or at least it shares with special-language texts a “common territory” of generic range, cultural features, readers, and the outcomes of the translator’s agency.³ Analysing literary translation, Cees Koster (2014) has recently identified ‘style’ as a ‘technical’ translation problem connected to concrete stylistic translation choices and has referred to a translational stylistics based on cognitive poetics.⁴ Moreover, translating a literary text means dealing with linguistic

¹ See Margaret Rogers, *Specialised Translation: Shedding the ‘Non Literary’ Tag* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2015); Khurshid Ahmad and Margaret Rogers, eds., *Evidence Based LSP: Translation, Text and Terminology* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2007); Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast et al., eds., *LSP Translation Scenarios*, Special Issue of *MuTra Journals*, 2 (2008).

² Peter Newmark, “Non-literary in the Light of Literary Translation”, *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 1 (January 2004), 8.

³ Margaret Rogers, “From Binaries to Borders: Literary and Non-Literary Translation”, in Helle V. Dam et al., eds., *Moving Boundaries in Translation Studies* (London and New York: Routledge, 2019), 151-167.

⁴ Cees Koster, “Literary Translation”, in Juliane House, ed., *Translation: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2014), 140-157.

peculiarities reflected in the narrative and with communicative frames, it means deciding how to translate (or not to translate) archaic, dialect and rare words, culturally bound terms, and idiomatic expressions, just to cite some of the many elements that have to be identified, interpreted and then translated in such texts. From this standpoint, a specialisation in the many linguistic, textual and cultural possibilities of literary texts is central to translation competence, as much as it is important for a translator of specialised texts to engage knowledgeably with LSP texts in the source and target linguacultures in both form and content, often negotiating linguistic, textual and cultural differences.

Moving on to the second premise, literary texts are fruitful ground for specialised vocabulary; their language often incorporates terms and expressions from specialised fields. For example, in science fiction novels the general-purpose lexicon is supplemented by vocabulary from engineering or medicine or astronomy; in a thriller, the language can refer to legal and medical domains. The use of LSPs can also extend beyond the lexical level to syntactic structures in which the terms are embedded.⁵ This integration of specialised lexicons and even higher-level features can be detected in all literary genres according to the topics and issues in the narrative. In addition, specialised terms in literary texts can also be understood as intertextual elements referring to the history and culture of the setting or settings of the work. Since texts belong to a specific time and space they are products of a specific culture and the task of the translator is to be able to recognise the web of discourses and references present in a source text, as a starting point for translation decisions to come. Intercultural awareness brings an interpretive capacity to the translating process and translation choices, because words are used in the particular linguistic and cultural context in which they are embedded and are part of a linguistic network governed by syntactic, semantic, lexical and cultural stylistic relations. These relations must be understood and perceived by translators to convey adequately and appropriately the meaning of those words in the target language. Thus, literary translation requires cultural and stylistic competences, and insufficient knowledge in syntactic, semantic or lexical areas can lead to mistranslation or inaccurate translation.

The new approach undertaken in this issue, however, moves beyond a focus on the ‘technical’ specificities of literary texts and an outline of how aspects of specialised languages present in literary texts can be recognised and translated. It also aims to discuss these issues from a gender perspective, or at least, through a gender-aware position. How can gender issues and gendered language affect the interpretation, translation and reception of a literary text incorporating some LSP features? In which ways can gender become a central issue in the translator’s work in this respect? How far do gender issues impact on the translation of LSP terms? From the mid-90s on, much has been written about translation and gender but very few studies have taken into account gender in specialised translation⁶ and none has approached the literary text as a specialised one and through a gender-aware perspective.⁷

This monographic issue brings together a range of contributions capable of depicting and reflecting on major contextualised examples of linguistic and textual features including LSP-type features that focus on stylistic, narrative and communicative frames, patterns and schemata. The issue consists of three sections, commencing with a consideration of the growing importance of LSP and Translation Studies within the field of Literature. The articles included highlight how LSP features can be traced in literary and cultural texts (such as films) and how gender issues and gendered language can affect the

⁵ Margaret Rogers and Michael White, *Thinking German Translation. A Course in Translation Method: German to English*, Third Edition (Routledge: Abingdon and New York, 2020), 217.

⁶ Mercedes Bengoachea, “Feminist Translation? No way! Spanish Specialised Translators’ Disinterest in Feminist Translation”, *Women’s Studies International Forum*, 42 (January 2013), 94-103; Emerk Ergun, “Bridging Across Feminist Translation and Sociolinguistics”, *Language and Linguistics Compass*, 4 (May 2010), 307-318; Olga Castro “Re-examinando horizontes en los estudios feministas de traducción. Hacia una tercera ola”, *MonTI* vol. 1 (2009), 59-86.

⁷ I am referring to Sherry Simon, *Gender in Translation: Cultural Identity and the Politics of Transmission* (London and New York: Routledge, 1996); Luise von Flotow’s *Translation and Gender: Translating in the Era of Feminism* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1997); Eleonora Federici, ed., *Translating Gender* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2011); E. Federici and V. Leonardi, eds., *Bridging the Gap between Theory and Practice in Translation and Gender Studies* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars, 2013).

reception of the original and/or the translated text.

The opening contribution by Cristina Carrasco in Section 1 (Literary translations and the specialised lexicon) analyses the body as a semiotic system where identities are articulated and translated. Starting from the specialised language of beauty and in particular of hair, the author demonstrates how the translation of specialised words connected to an ideal of women's beauty in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's representation of African women's appearance and hairstyles is not only due to prejudices against non-white women but is also the result of racist implications in a binary and oppositional relationship between white and black people. In so doing she demonstrates that gender narratives not only condition identity but also translate the existential circumstances in which black women live. Similarly, Emilio Amideo's article demonstrates how the specialised language of music can influence a literary work both thematically and structurally through the example of Jackie Kay's novel *Trumpet* – in which gender plays a key role for the central character – and its translation into Italian. In his analysis the author reflects on how a re-semanticisation of musical jargon adds new meanings and connotations to ordinary words and how this re-signification mirrors experiences that otherwise would be destined to remain unspeakable. The shadow of colonialism and ethnic difference is also at the centre of Eleonora Federici and Luisa Marino's essay on a proposed translation into Italian of Suneeta Da Peres Costa's novella *Saudade*, full of echoes and specialised lexical items connected to the history of colonial Angola. This contribution, which focuses on the practice of translation, demonstrates how a deep knowledge of the author, of her work, of the centrality of gender issues in the text and of the historic-cultural setting relating to the Angolan colonial past, so well depicted in the novel, are necessary elements to effectively translate all the nuances in the text, and particularly those embedded in the culture-based terminology.

The articles in Section 1 show how translation is a key issue in the transmission of values and ideologies and how specialised lexicons deeply influence either an author's style or his/her willingness to portray with precision a place, a history or a culture. Section 2 (Education for gender equality) includes two articles which focus on the importance of promoting gender equality in education. Isabel Garcia Perez's article demonstrates how awareness-raising on gender issues is the key to rejecting any kind of social prejudice including patriarchal sociocultural traditions and attitudes. Starting from the premise that any canonised codified form of language and the compilation of dictionaries can bring the writer to the legitimisation of gender inequalities, the author analyses the translations into Spanish and into English of Elisabetta Cametti's novel *I guardiani della storia*, highlighting the differences among the three languages regarding linguistic sexism. In her examination of the texts Garcia Perez skilfully outlines how gender inequality in the social and cultural spheres can influence the reception of the translated texts principally focusing on specific professional terms like 'lawyer' or 'manager'. Maria del Pino Valero Cuadra and Antonio Lérida Muñoz also deal with the education and transmission of gender inequalities and stereotypes considering two works for children and young adults, *Manolito Gafotas* by the Spanish writer Elvira Lindo, and *Kika Superbruja* by the German author KNISTER. In comparing the translation of these works into Spanish, German and English the authors reveal how the representation of characters leads the reader to understand both the mentality of a society and the conventions which drive it. They demonstrate how texts for children can change and be culturally adapted to recipients through translations, manipulations of the source texts and additions. From this perspective a gender-aware manipulation of gender stereotypes is argued to be welcome in order to teach children to think about gender differences in a more egalitarian way. In other words, translations which are more neutral are preferred to perpetuating binomic oppositions of femininities and masculinities.

Section 3 on Literary genres, specialised languages and adaptations, starts with Federico Pio Gentile's article focusing on a widely read literary genre, detective and crime fiction, taking as its case-study Maureen Jennings' novel *A Journeyman to Grief*, an interesting example of crime fiction and of the use of various specialised languages in the detective novel. The author underlines how language acts as a mirror of diverse communicative contexts ranging from the deployment of police procedural

forensic methods to mental patterns and sociolinguistic implicatures dealing with slavery, the definition of emotional and physiological differentiation, and issues of gender perspective. Nicolangelo Becce's contribution also dwells on a specific literary genre, fantasy, a choice quite popular among teenagers; he does so by analysing one of the most canonical TV series adaptations, *A Game of Thrones* taken from George R. R. Martin's *A Song of Ice and Fire* together with its comic rewriting, the graphic adaptation titled *A Game of Thrones. The Graphic Novel*. Utilizing corpus linguistic methodology Becce analyses gender power relations through an examination of the characters' use of language or of silence. Through the transposition from book to movie to graphic novel almost nothing changes in these respects: female characters are always relegated to a secondary role in spite of the possibilities of the genre that would permit a subversion of gender categories. Adaptation is analysed also in Eleonora Sasso's contribution based on the adaptation of a classic literary text into a movie, namely, McGrath's cinematic adaptation of Jane Austen's novel *Emma*. The author takes the discussion on gender, translation and literary text a step further by choosing to analyse and to investigate how gender and humour have been translated in this film and demonstrating how the specialised lexicon is an important part of cultural transmission. The section is closed by an investigation on literary journalism', a textual typology that seems able to welcome features of feminist discourses and language. Through an examination of Spanish newspapers, Marilicia Di Paolo demonstrates how feminist keywords and key-concepts can be introduced to newspaper readers thanks to the printed press.

Through the multifaceted and varied topics addressed in this special issue we want to follow and take a step further the work done by other scholars in "redefining, rethinking and reshaping literary translation theory and practice"⁸ not only through relations with other disciplines but also through a connection with specialised translation and a gendered approach. We hope this issue can be a beginning point in analysing the relation between aspects of specialised languages in literature, translation and gender issues.

⁸ Jean Boase-Beier et al., "Introduction", in Jean Boase-Beier et al., eds., *Literary Translation: Redrawing the Boundaries* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2014), 4.

(Post)Translation, Ideology and Female Body. The Translation of the Body in *Americanah*, by Chimamanda Adichie

Abstract: Nowadays, the traditional limits of Translation Studies are broadening. The emergence of concepts such as ‘post-translation’, introduced by Gentzler in 2017, has allowed the analysis of rewritings located in spaces other than conventional texts, as also pointed out by Bassnett (2012). Furthermore, Gender and Feminist Translation Studies have greatly expanded since their emergence in the ’80s, establishing relations with other areas, such as Social Studies of the Body. Considering this state of the arts, this article aims to study the translation of narratives and meanings in black women’s hair, as well as their social repercussions. In order to do so, it will analyse the novel *Americanah*, one of the best-known novels by author Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie. The academic works that will be used will primarily come from Feminist Translation Studies, Translation and Body Studies and Social Studies of the Body.

Keywords: *post-translation, black women’s hair, intersemiotic translation, race, Americanah, Chimamanda Adichie*

Translations themselves are metaphoric, multilingual, and multisensory, so too must translation studies include multisensory forms of analysis.
Edwin Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies*

1. Introduction

Over recent decades, the confluence of Gender Studies in translation research has massively increased. The first steps were made in the ’80s by Canadian feminist translators such as Susanne de Lobtinière-Harwood, Barbara Godard and Luise von Flotow, who worked hand in hand with a group of experimental female authors to subvert the patriarchal status quo. These Canadian translators are considered the pioneers in the building up of feminist translation theories. In particular, this article will explore the relation between Body Studies and Translation Studies within the framework of Feminist and Gender Translation Studies. In the last decades, there has been a growing interest in Body Studies in the Humanities and Social Sciences. In particular, this article will focus on the relation between the female body and translation, which is becoming a line of research per se in our discipline, as illustrated by recently published volumes such as *The Body Metaphor: Cultural Images, Literary Perceptions, Linguistic Representations*¹ and *Corps et Traduction, Corps en Traduction*.² The introduction of the body as a field for translation is possible because it is understood as a semiotic system of re-presentation.³ The body can translate meanings, which can be (re)translated. Consequently, the translation of narratives into body forms will be a type of intersemiotic translation.

¹ Eleonora Federici and Marilena Parlati, eds., *The Body Metaphor: Cultural Images, Literary Perceptions, Linguistic Representations* (Perugia: Morlacchi Editori, 2018).

² Solange Hibbs et al., eds., *Corps et traduction, corps en traduction* (Limoges: Lambert-Lucas, 2018).

³ África Vidal, “The Body as a Semiotic System of Representation”, in Federici and Parlati, eds., *The Body Metaphor*, 17-26.

With regards to the female body in particular, it must be remembered that identities are constructed through their re-presentation in different discursive codes. The body is a semiotic system where these identities are articulated and translated. As gender narratives condition identity, the study of the female body and its translation becomes a new path in the already established studies on gender in the translation field. In addition, these advances are understood in the context of broader definitions of translation presented by Susan Bassnett,⁴ Mona Baker,⁵ Edwin Gentzler⁶ and Susan Bassnett and David Johnston,⁷ who have opened up the field to new areas.

Considering this state of the arts in Translation Studies, this article will explore the translation of narratives in black women's hair. This is one of the main points of interest of Nigerian author Chimamanda Adichie. Our hypothesis predicts that different meanings are translated and (re)translated in black women's hair. We presume that these meanings define a hierarchy of power in society. In order to defend this hypothesis, we will analyse the novel *Americanah*, by Chimamanda Adichie.⁸

2. Hair: A Semiotic System of Re-presentation and Translation

As previously pointed out, we need a broad definition of translation to understand the translation of the body. Over the past few years, a series of theorists have put forward more open visions of our field. Gentzler places the texts that have traditionally been labelled as 'rewritings' or 'adaptations' at the centre of the discipline. These texts had been relegated to the margins. In today's world, where discourses constantly cross over different contexts, these texts "may tell us more about the nature of translation than the central paradigm".⁹ In addition, they probably outnumber traditional translations. We are moving towards the era of "post-translation studies",¹⁰ where texts that have not been considered translations are in the spotlight, because, in fact "all writing is a rewriting, or better said, a rewriting of a rewriting of a rewriting, and translation – intralingual, interlingual, and intersemiotic – plays a significant role in that process".¹¹ We therefore understand translation as a broad process where meaning is rewritten. This idea allows us to analyse the changes performed in black women's hair as a type of translation, provided that hair carry out sense, which can thus be reinterpreted, recontextualised and reevaluated. We will then see that different narratives are translated in it and, at the same time, it (re)translates other narratives.

As we have mentioned in the introduction, the body is a semiotic system of representation. Therefore, it can be understood as a text. The conception of the body as a text has been explored by many sociologists, philosophers and cultural theorists, both implicitly and explicitly. Already in 1961, the philosopher and semiologist Roland Barthes advanced in his essay "Towards a Psychosociology of Contemporary Food Consumption"¹² that the body was a semiotic system. Later on, Spivak¹³ said that the body is a text that signifies. Hall¹⁴ presented it as a signifier, a place where discursive practices are

⁴ Susan Bassnett, "Translation Studies at a Cross-Roads", *Target*, 24.1 (2012), 15-25.

⁵ Mona Baker, "The Changing Landscape of Translation and Interpreting Studies", in Sandra Bermann and Catherine Porter, eds., *A Companion to Translation Studies* (Chichester, West Sussex: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, 2016).

⁶ Edwin Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies* (London and New York: Routledge, 2017).

⁷ Susan Bassnett and David Johnston, "The Outward Turn", *The Translator, Special Issue Call for Papers*, forthcoming, <http://explore.tandfonline.com/cfp/ah/rtrn-cfp-outwardturn>, accessed 20 March 2018.

⁸ Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, *Americanah* (London: 4th State, 2013).

⁹ Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies*, 2.

¹⁰ Stefano Arduini and Siri Nergaard, "Translation: A New Paradigm", *Translation: A Transdisciplinary Journal*, Inaugural Issue (2011), 8-17; Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies*.

¹¹ Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies*, 10.

¹² Roland Barthes, "Towards a Psychosociology of Contemporary Food Consumption" (1961), reprinted in Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik, eds., *Food and Culture* (London and New York: Routledge, 2013), 23-30.

¹³ Gayatri Spivak, *Outside in the Teaching Machine* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993), 20.

¹⁴ Stuart Hall, "Introduction: Who Needs Identity?", in Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay, eds., *Questions of Cultural Identity* (London: Sage, 1996), 11.

constructed, and Falk¹⁵ described it as a communication code that signifies. Therefore, if we consider the body to be a semiotic system that re-presents identities and reality, it can be translated as well. In this regard, Vidal argues that “[the body] is never neutral and is never only the body, but a true semiotic system, of representation and of signification, a locus of economic, political, intellectual and sexual struggles”.¹⁶ In the same line, other translation scholars have started to consider the body as a text as well. Federici¹⁷ states that the body is shaped by discourses, and Coppola¹⁸ applies this notion to literary works where women translate their past painful experiences to their body. As we can see, our body speaks for ourselves in a language that can be translated.

The textuality of the body cannot be understood without referring to the importance of re-presentation for Translation Studies. According to Vidal, reality exists because it is re-presented through different discursive codes. These re-presentations condition the way societies build meanings. Therefore, “there is not *one* reality but multiple realities”¹⁹ depending on the meaning a society attributes to a particular re-presentation. Going back to Gentzler's ideas, the act of giving a certain meaning to a particular re-presentation of reality is a form of translation – it is a “rewriting of a rewriting”.²⁰ At the same time, meanings inscribed in the body are often (re)translated. This conditions the identity of the individual. In other words, meaning, articulated through re-presentation, defines the individual. If meaning is translated to fit different needs, its re-presentation is (re)translated. Consequently, the identity of the individual is articulated through language and translated as well.

If we talk about re-presentation, discourses and meaning, we cannot forget to discuss ‘power’. The body is a textual site for the inscription of power. This has been stated by Foucault: “The body is also directly involved in a political field; power relations have an immediate hold upon it; they invest it, mark it, train it, torture it, force it to carry out tasks, to perform ceremonies, to emit signs”.²¹ In particular, women's bodies have always attended men's interests throughout history. In her 1976 essay “The Laugh of the Medusa”,²² Hélène Cixous reflected on how women have to endure the confiscation of their own body. She rebelled against it, calling on women to free themselves from living *within* male discourses and to take ownership of their bodies and their sexuality. She asks women to *write themselves* through their bodies. In doing so, women's bodies, as semiotic systems of re-presentation, would speak their truth. Therefore, Cixous understands the body as a text that can subvert the dominant male discourses. This idea is also defended by Bordo, who declares that “if the body is treated as a pure text, subversive, destabilizing elements can be emphasized and freedom and self-determination celebrated”.²³

Moreover, women's identity is very much defined by their body, due to the patriarchal structures of power that condition it. The female body reproduces certain beauty standards associated with certain meanings. In this regard, Bordo wonders “[w]hat, after all, is more personal than the life of the body?” and declares that women's lives are very much centred on the body, “both [on] the beautification of one's own body and the reproduction, care, and maintenance of the bodies of others”.²⁴ However, the body patterns that have served male interests throughout history can be subverted. This is possible when

¹⁵ Pasi Falk, “Written in the Flesh”, *Body & Society*, 23.1 (2010), 97.

¹⁶ Vidal, “The Body as a Semiotic System of Representation”, 20.

¹⁷ Eleonora Federici, “Speaking Bodies: Ursula K. Le Guin's Linguistic Revision of Gender”, in Federici and Parlati, eds., *The Body Metaphor*, 7.

¹⁸ Manuela Coppola, “Scars, Tattoos, Hairstyles: Redressing Pain in the Poetry of Patience Agbabi”, in Federici and Parlati, eds., *The Body Metaphor*.

¹⁹ África Vidal, “Re-presenting the ‘Real’: Pierre Bourdieu and Legal Translation”, *The Translator*, 11.2 (2005), 260.

²⁰ Gentzler, *Translation and Rewriting in the Age of Post-Translation Studies*, 10.

²¹ Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish* (London: Allen Lane, 1975), 25.

²² Hélène Cixous, “The Laugh of the Medusa”, trans. by Keith Cohen and Paula Cohen, *Signs*, 1.4 (Summer 1976), 875-893.

²³ Susan Bordo, *Unbearable Weight* [1993] (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003), 38.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, 17.

women take over the control of their own bodies, because “just as repressive power relations are encoded in our bodies, so they can be challenged by alternative somatic practices”.²⁵

Translation plays a crucial role in this process of subversion. It is an activity that modifies representations and exerts power. Although it may become a source of domination and help maintain social hierarchies, it may also do the opposite – transform male narratives into female (and feminist) narratives. Male ideologies have been translated in women's bodies heretofore, but, in the last years, translation scholars such as Federici,²⁶ Coppola,²⁷ and Vidal²⁸ have been studying the work of artists and writers who reconceptualise women's bodies by translating narratives that free them from the traditional male-gazed re-presentations. We cannot forget that the work of these translation scholars helps translate the patriarchal meanings inscribed on the female body as well.

One of the writers who is subverting the beauty canons imposed by the dominant patriarchal ideologies is Nigerian author Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie. She belongs to a generation of women writers who are transforming African women's image, offering alternative perspectives on different issues. Other members of this generation are Sefi Atta, Helen Oyeyemi, Unoma Azuah, Chika Unigwe or Promise Okeke. Chimamanda Adichie has published a collection of poems, a play, three novels, a collection of short stories and two short essays so far. She has also written many newspaper articles in different media and given talks that have reached millions of viewers online. Her development of certain topics —such as race, migration, ideology, stereotypes, hybridity, feminism and identity transformation, among others— questions the current status quo, opening the way for researchers to explore them through different lens. As a consequence, her works have been subject of study by scholars from diverse areas, such as African Studies,²⁹ Black Studies,³⁰ English Studies,³¹ Feminist Studies,³² Postcolonial Studies³³ and Translation Studies.³⁴ This academic interest fostered the publication of *A Companion to*

²⁵ Richard Shusterman, “Somaesthetics and the Body/Media Issue”, in Lisa Blackman and Mike Featherstone, eds., *Body & Society*, 16 (2010), 36.

²⁶ Eleonora Federici, “Women and Cyborgs: Transformations and Developments of a Cultural Icon”, in Vita Fortunati et al., eds., *The Controversial Women's Body* (Bologna: Bononia U.P., 2007); Federici, “Speaking Bodies”.

²⁷ Coppola, “Scars, Tattoos, Hairstyles”.

²⁸ África Vidal, *La magia de lo efímero. Representaciones de la mujer en el arte y la literatura actuales* (Castelló de la Plana: Universitat Jaume I, 2003); África Vidal, *La feminización de la cultura. Una aproximación interdisciplinar* (Salamanca: Consorcio Salamanca, 2002).

²⁹ Anthony C. Oha, “Beyond the Odds of the Red Hibiscus: A Critical Reading of Chimamanda Adichie's *Purple Hibiscus*”, *Journal of Pan African Studies*, 1.9 (2007); Ogaga Okuyade, “Changing Borders and Creating Voices: Silence as Character in Chimamanda Adichie's *Purple Hibiscus*”, *Journal of Pan African Studies*, 2.9 (2009); Patrycja Koziel, “Narrative Strategy in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's Novel ‘Americanah’: The Manifestation of Migrant Identity”, *Studies of the Department of African Languages and Cultures*, 49 (2015); Rita Kiki Edozie, “African Perspectives on Race in the African Diaspora: As Understood by Chimamanda Adichie's *Americanah*”, in James L. Conyers, Jr., ed., *The Black Family and Society* (London and New York: Routledge, 2017).

³⁰ Chinenye Amonyeye, “Writing a New Reputation: Liminality and Bicultural Identity in Chimamanda Adichie's *Americanah*”, *Journal of Black Studies* (April-June 2017).

³¹ Heather Hewett, “Coming of Age: Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie and the Voice of the Third Generation”, *English in Africa*, 32.1 (2005), 73-97; Elena Rodríguez Murphy, “New Transatlantic Writing: Translation, Transculturation and Diasporic Images of Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie in *The Thing Around Your Neck* and *Americanah*”, *Prague Journal of English Studies*, 6.1 (2017), 93-104.

³² Rodríguez Murphy “Nuevas escritoras nigerianas. Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, feminismo(s) africano(s) y ‘El Peligro de una sola historia’”/ “New Nigerian Women Writers: Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, African Feminism(s) and ‘The Danger of the Single Story’”.

³³ Cristina Cruz-Gutiérrez, “Hair Politics in the Blogosphere: Safe Spaces and the Politics of Self-Representation in Chimamanda Adichie's *Americanah*”, *Journal of Postcolonial Studies* (2018).

³⁴ Elena Rodríguez Murphy, “‘I Have Taken Ownership of English’: Translating Hybridity in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's Transcultural Writing”, in Karen Bennett and Rita Queiroz de Barros, eds., *Hybrid Englishes and the Challenges of Translation* (London and New York: Routledge, 2019); Elena Rodríguez Murphy, *Traducción y literatura africana. Multilingüismo y transculturación en la narrativa nigeriana de expresión inglesa* (Granada: Comares, 2015).

Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie,³⁵ where authors from different areas and places offer a comprehensive insight into her creative production. Furthermore, Adichie has been awarded several literary prizes, such as the Chicago Tribune Heartland Prize and the National Book Critics Circle Award, in particular, for her novel *Americanah*. This is the work we have chosen for our analysis. The main character is Ifemelu, a young Nigerian woman who emigrates to the United States to build herself a career there, breaking away from her Nigerian teenage boyfriend, Obinze. After many years living apart, where Ifemelu lives many different life experiences, she moves back to her homeland, where she faces the challenge to readjust herself to life in the country where she was raised.

In the course of the novel, Adichie deeply reflects on questions of African identity and race, which are often translated in black women's hair. It holds such a key position because it is an especially sensitive "identity marker"³⁶ or "ethnic signifier"³⁷ for black women. It holds many meanings. In this regard, Mercer argues that:

Hair is never a straightforward biological "fact" because it is almost always groomed, prepared, cut, concealed and generally "worked upon" by human hands. Such practices socialize hair, making it the medium of significant "statements" about self and society and the codes of value that bind them, or don't. In this way hair is merely a raw material, constantly processed by cultural practices which thus invest it with "meanings" and "value".³⁸

Furthermore, its great malleability makes it a particularly good site for translation. Hair re-presents meaning. Therefore, it *translates* meaning. Adichie often reflects on these meanings in her works. Several stories from Adichie's collection *The Thing Around Your Neck*³⁹ deal with hair, as well as some fragments in *Half of a Yellow Sun*.⁴⁰ However, *Americanah* is the book which draws more attention to the topic of hair. The whole first part takes place in a hair salon and it is a recurrent topic throughout the story. In general, the author is very engaged in vindicating black women's natural hair, as she has proven in many of her interviews. She challenges the lack of visibility of issues regarding black women's hair by reflecting extensively on the topic in the novel. It is charged with a lot of historical meanings. In the United States, the issues surrounding black women's hair began with the Atlantic Slave Trade. From that moment on, the female beauty canon was established to be that of white women. However, hair had been considered an identity marker since the 15th century, "when hairstyles were markers denoting sex, tribal affiliation, age or occupation among West African tribal groups".⁴¹ According to Cruz-Gutiérrez, we are now in the third wave of the hair movements, after the first one in mid-60s and a shorter one in the late 90s. These movements started in the United States and spread across the world. Their aim was to make visible the role of black women's hair. The third wave started in the mid-2000 and it differs from the previous ones by the key role that social media played in its expansion. However, despite the rising of this movement, the situation is of course ambivalent: some black women wear straight hair and other rejects the Western imposition and wear dreadlocks or leave it natural. In both cases, they are translating meanings. This is precisely what we will address in the analysis section.

³⁵ Ernest M. Emenyonu, ed., *A Companion to Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie* (Melton: James Currey, 2017).

³⁶ Coppola, "Scars, Tattoos, Hairstyles", 226.

³⁷ Kobena Mercer, "Black Hair/Style Politics", *New Formations*, 3 (1987), 36.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 34.

³⁹ Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, *The Thing Around Your Neck* (London: 4th State, 2009).

⁴⁰ Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, *Half of a Yellow Sun* (London: 4th State, 2006).

⁴¹ Cruz-Gutiérrez, "Hair Politics in the Blogosphere", 2.

3. Hair, Race and Translation: An Analysis of the Novel *Americanah*

In this section, we will apply the previous theoretical background to explore the rewriting of meanings in black women's hair. In order to do so, we have compiled all the passages focusing on hair and we have selected those where such rewriting of meanings was particularly clear.

We will start by presenting a dialogue which takes place during the first years Ifemelu spends in America. Aunt Uju and her talk about the need to translate the symbolic meanings written in Aunt Uju's hair to increase her chances of success in a job interview for the position of a doctor:

Later, she said, "I have to take my braids out for my interviews and relax my hair. Kemi told me that I shouldn't wear braids to the interview. If you have braids, they will think you are unprofessional."

"So there are no doctors with braided hair in America?" Ifemelu asked.

"I have told you what they told me. You are in a country that is not your own. You do what you have to do if you want to succeed".⁴²

In this extract, we see that Aunt Uju does not want to wear braids to the interview because they convey the message of unprofessionalism in a medical setting, which shows how the body is a text that signifies. This is why Aunt Uju tells Ifemelu about her decision to take them out and relax her hair. Straight hair means professionalism and, therefore, more chances to succeed in a physician's job interview. These kinds of connotations, which are subject of translation, are defined as "second-order meanings" by renowned semiologist Roland Barthes.⁴³ Consequently, the character decides to translate these meanings to succeed in that context. Here we are applying a broad definition of translation, as over the last years the discipline "has sought to incorporate within its remit various types of non-verbal material".⁴⁴ At the same time, Ifemelu feels that her aunt is *changing*, as if her identity was being translated to fit American expectations: "Sometimes, while having a conversation, it would occur to Ifemelu that Aunt Uju had deliberately left behind something of herself, something essential, in a distant and forgotten place".⁴⁵

Although it is not explicitly pointed out, we believe that Ifemelu thinks that straight hair holds other meanings for her Aunt besides success in America. It also means leaving behind her Nigerian past and identity.

A few pages later, Ifemelu gets an interview for a public relations job. She calls her friend Ruth to give her the good news. Her friend's response was:

"My only advice? Lose the braids and straighten your hair. Nobody says this kind of stuff but it matters. We want you to get that job."

Aunt Uju had said something similar in the past and she had laughed then. Now she knew enough not to laugh. "Thank you", she said to Ruth.⁴⁶

In fact, the same recommendation was given by Adichie's sister when she went to a job interview in the United States. She declared that, from that moment on, she started wondering why she had to straighten her hair to look professional, who decides what constitutes professionalism and why it is defined so narrowly.⁴⁷ In this regard, Norwood points out that this is a reflection of "a racialized hierarchy, where features most akin to the European aesthetic are more valued, more revered, more compensated and just *mo better*" and notes that:

⁴² Adichie, *Americanah*, 119.

⁴³ Roland Barthes, *Mythologies* [1957] (New York: The Noonday Press, 1975), 109-119.

⁴⁴ Baker, "The Changing Landscape of Translation and Interpreting Studies".

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Ibid., 202-203.

⁴⁷ Adichie, "Chimimanda [sic] Ngozi Adichie: On Hair".

The hair typing or hair texture classification system commonly used in US African American communities, which classifies hair along a scale from 1 ("straight") to 4 ("kinky"), has been criticized as replicating racist classifications that deem Afrocentric features as less desirable.⁴⁸

This, evidently, is all about 'power' and the definitions imposed by others on women's bodies, as the body is never neutral. In this particular fragment of the novel, we see that after some years of living in the United States, Ifemelu learnt the language conveyed by black women's hair as well as the meanings it conveys. This time Ifemelu is willing to translate the meanings that her natural hair conveys in order to fit in the American definition of professionalism. She adapts herself to the contextual norms, she conforms to the status quo. However, she realises that she is also losing part of her Nigerian identity:

Her hair was hanging down rather than standing up, straight and sleek, parted at the side and curving to a slight bob at her chin. The verve was gone. She did not recognize herself. She left the salon almost mournfully; while the hairdresser had flat-ironed the ends, the smell of burning, of something organic dying which should not have died, had made her feel a sense of loss.⁴⁹

Here, we confirm that straight hair means 'American' and, therefore, losing part of her Nigerian identity. Ifemelu is very aware of the meanings of different hairstyles. This is illustrated in a conversation she has with her white American boyfriend:

"Why do you have to do this? Your hair was gorgeous braided. And when you took out the braids the last time and just kind of let it be? It was even more gorgeous, so full and cool."

"My full and cool hair would work if I were interviewing to be backup singer in a jazz band, but I need to look professional for this interview, and professional means straight is best but if it's going to be curly then it has to be the white kind of curly, loose curls or, at worst, spiral curls but never kinky." ...

Later, after she breezed through the job interview, and the woman shook her hand and said she would be a "wonderful fit" in the company, she wondered if the woman would have felt the same way had she walked into that office wearing her thick, kinky, God-given halo of hair, the Afro.⁵⁰

As we can see, hair conveys different meanings according to the context. Braids and Afro denote unprofessionalism in a public relations job setting. Ifemelu would probably not have got the job had she turned up with braids or an Afro. She would not have been a 'wonderful fit' for the company. Meaning is articulated through re-presentations and it conditions our identities, as pointed out in the theoretical section. Although Ifemelu's degree of professionalism is the same whatever her looks, her hair defines it because it conveys meanings. Although Afro means 'coolness' for her boyfriend, the job interviewer would not think the same, because it carries opposite meanings in that particular setting. Therefore, she needs to translate these meanings so that she can access the job.

Later on, taking the advice of a friend, Ifemelu decides to leave her hair natural because relaxers are making it fall out. This takes her great effort, as she does not find herself beautiful:

"I look so ugly I'm scared of myself"

"You look beautiful. Your bone structure shows so well now. You're just not used to seeing yourself like this. You'll get used to it," Wambui said ...

"She bought oils and pomades, applying one and then the other, on wet hair and then on dry hair, willing an unknown miracle to happen. Something, anything, that would make her like her hair" ...

She reached the phone and sent Wambui a text: I hate my hair. I couldn't go work today.⁵¹

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Adichie, *Americanah*, 203.

⁵⁰ Ibid., 204.

⁵¹ Ibid., 208-209.

These reflections are related to the meaning of 'beautiful', a topic that we will address later on. Ifemelu has to bear some impolite comments for having her hair natural – for example, while being with her boyfriend, a man says to her “you ever wonder why he likes you looking all jungle like that?”.⁵² In addition, she knows that this hairstyle does not mean prestige nor professionalism in the United States, but the opposite. However, it also conveys other meanings that she likes, such as health or Nigerian identity. On this basis, one day she decides to totally accept her hair:

On a remarkable day in early spring – the day was not bronzed with special light, nothing of any significance happened, and it was perhaps merely that time, as it often does, had transfigured her doubts – she looked in the mirror, sank her fingers into her hair, dense and spongy and glorious, and could not imagine it any other way. That simply, she fell in love with her hair.⁵³

During her time abroad, Ifemelu writes a blog called “Raceteenth or Various Observations About American Blacks (Those Formerly Known as Negroes) by a Non-American Black”. She uses this platform to reflect on racism in the United States. One of her posts deals with hair. The beginning of the blog post is particularly relevant because it talks about makeover shows and the definition of beauty in the United States:

A Michelle Obama Shout-Out Plus Hair as Race Metaphor

So it is me or is that the perfect metaphor for race in America right here? Hair. Ever notice makeover shows on TV, how the black woman has natural hair (coarse, coily, kinky, or curly) in the ugly “before” picture, and in the pretty “after” picture, somebody’s taken a hot piece of metal and singed her hair straight?⁵⁴

Makeover shows perform intersemiotic translations. In the case of hair, they translate the meanings associated with natural or braided black women’s hair into those associated with white women’s hair. These TV shows convey the idea that black women’s natural or braided hair means ‘ugliness’, as it is described in the fragment above. Black aesthetics have always been associated with ugliness all across the world, according to Norwood.⁵⁵ Women participating in them want to attain ‘beauty’, which also means ‘prestige’. They seek to move a step upwards in the American social ladder. In order to do so, “racialized bodies are erased”.⁵⁶ Furthermore, these TV shows convey the already widespread idea that black hair means ugliness. Participants do not want to be ugly. Instead, they want to be beautiful, together with all the other meanings associated with this characteristic, such as high social status. This happens because identities are built through language and according to the meanings associated with representations.

Later on in the blog post, Ifemelu reflects on the meanings of straight and braided/natural hair in black women:

Some black women, AB [American Black] and NAB [Non American Black], would rather run naked in the street than come out in public with their natural hair. Because, you see, it’s not professional, sophisticated, whatever, it’s just not damn normal. (Please, commenters, don’t tell me it’s the same as a white woman who doesn’t color her hair). When you DO have natural Negro hair, people think you “did” something to your hair. Actually, the folk with the Afros and dreads are the ones who haven’t “done” anything to their hair. You should be asking Beyoncé what she’s done. (We all love Bey but how about she show [sic] us, just

⁵² Ibid., 212.

⁵³ Ibid., 213.

⁵⁴ Ibid., 296-297.

⁵⁵ Norwood, “Decolonizing my Hair, Unshackling my Curls: An Autoethnography on What Makes my Natural Hair Journey a Black Feminist Statement”, 73, 78.

⁵⁶ Cressida J. Heyes, “Cosmetic Surgery and the Televisual Makeover: A Foucauldian Feminist Reading”, *Feminist Media Studies*, 7.1 (2007), 21.

once, what her hair looks like when it grows from the scalp?) I have natural kinky hair. Worn in cornrows, Afros, braids. No, it's not political. No, I am not an artist or poet or singer. Not an earth mother either. I just don't want relaxers in my hair – there are enough sources of cancer in my life as it is.⁵⁷

As we can see, natural or braided hair in black women means lack of professionalism, sophistication or normality. These are the meanings conveyed in this kind of hair by society, which associates them with other values, as those of artists, poets or singers. Therefore, these kinds of hairstyles are not associated with physicians or public relations professionals, as we saw in previous fragments. In addition, braided/natural hair in black women also means health, as we previously established.

Lastly, we would like to mention Michelle Obama's hair, to which Ifemelu alludes in the last part of the blogpost:

Imagine if Michelle Obama got tired of all the heat and decided to go natural and appeared on TV with lots of woolly hair, or tight spirally curls.... She would totally rock but poor Obama would certainly lose the independent vote, even the undecided Democrat vote.⁵⁸

Adichie made the same statement after *Americanah* was published, in an interview held at the Tenement Museum of New York City in 2014. This statement is extremely important for our discipline because it highlights the post-translation effect of black women's hair, which is Obama's victory. If Michelle Obama had translated different meanings in her hair, the post-translation repercussions may have been very different. Therefore, we can confirm that these translations are not at all innocent.

4. Conclusions

The analysis of *Americanah* has provided evidence that meanings and discourses are translated and (re)translated in the body and that language is involved in the process. After moving to the United States, Ifemelu realises that her hair is political. Although at the beginning she even laughs at this idea, she then becomes aware of the need to accept it in order to belong to particular contexts. This enables her to deeply reflect on the meanings conveyed by hair and to connect these ideas with her own identity. Her hair plays a key role in defining who she is. She uses it as a way of self-determination, but it is also used by others to categorise her. Post-translation studies legitimise the analysis of border texts such as hair, which is traditionally not considered to be a space where translation could be possible. Thanks to today's broader views in Translation Studies, the focus on texts such as *Americanah* is now deemed legitimate for translation scholars. Its analysis has proved to be insightful. On the one hand, it has helped us decode the power interests conditioning black women's role in society. The structures of power, both in the United States and in the whole world, strictly demarcate those who hold power and those who do not. In this case, hair is one of the re-presentations of these categorisations. The different meanings conveyed by hair re-presentations settle who holds power and who does not. In addition, they set the discipline which needs to be maintained in order to attain it, such as hair straightening. On the other hand, this analysis has increased the interest of Translation Studies, which can incorporate knowledge from other fields in order to grow. Thanks to the advances in our field, translators are increasingly aware that they translate meanings, whatever their re-presentation might be. This analysis is evidence of this.

As we have seen, Ifemelu decides to stop straightening her hair at a certain point in the story, rejecting the status quo. She starts a natural hair transition, which unfolds to be a deeply emotional process of translation for her. This decision is not innocent. Instead, Ifemelu is very aware of the meanings her natural hair will convey. She knows that some of them set her further behind in the social race. However,

⁵⁷ Adichie, *Americanah*, 297.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

natural hair has certain meanings that are more important for her, such as health or Nigerian identity. In addition, this hairstyle enables her to gain autonomy, as she will not have to care about losing hair due to relaxers. The analysis of this process of translation is a means to show academia how traditionally discriminated black women are fighting against the meanings that relegate them to an inferior role. They are subverting the system by translating their hair re-presentations and their associated meanings. In addition, the post-translation effects of these translations are also highly relevant. This is one of the most revealing points in Gentzler's argument. The analysis of *Americanah* has shown us that translation has effects in society. It has short-term consequences in Ifemelu's life, but, most importantly, it has far-reaching effects for society. Black women who refuse to straighten their hair are changing society, and they are doing so thanks to translation, understood in metaphorical terms. It is true that some of these women transition in order to gain autonomy, rather than to empower themselves. However, in any case, the result is that they are writing themselves. By translating the meanings written in their hair, they are modifying the dominant-dominated dichotomies that have been the norm in the world for centuries. This is a key post-translation effect, which will surely open the door to fascinating new research in our discipline in the future.

Translating Gender and Race through Music in Jackie Kay's *Trumpet*

Abstract: *Trumpet* is the 1998 debut novel by Scottish writer and Scots Makar Jackie Kay. It narrates, through the “language of music”, the life story of a black transgender jazz musician who, born anatomically female, lives his entire life as a man. Jazz music, encapsulated by the figurative image of the trumpet, contributes not only to shape the novel thematically and structurally, but it is also employed by Kay as a linguistic ‘instrument’ capable of expressing a more fluid conception of gender and racial identities. As a matter of fact, the novel’s discursive pattern is characterised by some basic elements borrowed from jazz music such as variations on a theme, repetitions, improvisation and even, at the level of the linguistic register, by the resemanticisation of its jargon. In other words, even the language itself is altered through a process of linguistic creativity which involves the re-contextualisation and re-signification of specific terms belonging to jazz music in order to express an anti-essentialist notion of both gender and race categories of belonging.

Drawing on a theoretical framework influenced by translation and gender studies, critical race theory and the interdisciplinary field of music as discourse, this essay investigates the author’s attempt to de-essentialise the self with regard to gender and race through the use of the language of music (jazz in particular) considered as specialised discourse. The exploration of the translation choices made in the Italian translation of the novel (by Sandro Melani for La Tartaruga, 1999), together with the proposal of alternative solutions on the basis of the aforementioned critical reflection, is then aimed at showing the fruitful insight that the intersection of specialised discourse, translation and gender studies can provide not only to the linguistic interpretation and fruition of literary texts, but also to their translation into other languages.

Keywords: *translation, music as discourse, specialised discourse, transgender, race, literature*

Music can [...] either align itself with the time of the clock, enact it, celebrate it, affectively identify with it – or struggle with it, rebel against it, subvert it.

Theo van Leeuwen, *Speech, Music, Sound*

1. Introduction: Music, Language and Power

Music has always played a pivotal role in every society. For the ancient Greeks it was indissolubly coupled with language – so much that the two concepts were designated by the same term *musiké* – and even after their separation into *logos* (language, reason) and *harmonia/rhythmos* (pertaining to performance techniques or *techné*), it continued to enjoy a prominent role in conveying affective aspects of communication, that ‘too much’ of a situation that cannot be exhausted by words alone.¹

Linguist, social semiotician and former jazz pianist Theo van Leeuwen somehow recovers the original unity of music and language when he invites us to pay attention to the descriptive and discursive aspect of music (i.e., music as discourse) – more than to a mere melodious one – and to consider the way in which music can endorse or subvert institutionalised beliefs:

¹ As Roger Savage explains, for the ancient Greeks the original unity of music and language (i.e., *musiké*) served to place the soul in harmony with itself and with the rest of the universe. The subsequent separation of language (*logos*) from harmony and rhythm (*harmonia* and *rhythmos*) stripped music of its vital essence, of its educational meaning (*paideia*), and reduced it to mere performance techniques (*techné*), thus placing it in a fundamentally lower status, beyond language and reason. See Roger W. H. Savage, *Hermeneutics and Music Criticism* (New York: Routledge, 2010), 36; John Neubauer, *The Emancipation of Music from Language: Departures from Mimesis in Eighteenth-Century Aesthetics* (New Haven, CT: Yale U.P., 1986), 22-23.

Music is ... an integral part of social, political and economic life. It can create emotive allegiance to powerful nation-states, religions and other social institutions, and it can express the values these institutions stand for and rally people behind then ... But music can also be subversive and challenge power.²

National anthems, religious hymns, but also non-diegetic sounds in films (e.g., the soundtrack), are all examples of forms of emotive allegiance to a cause, an institution or a specific message. Music, or sound more generally, participates in the definition of what we consider socially acceptable or unacceptable based on a hierarchy of internalised values.³ If for some social actors religious hymns and marching songs can create group unity and cohesion, for others they may be perceived as threatening, thus showing how music and sound enable an evaluation of social order/disorder and can implicitly signify distinctions based on race, gender, religion or class both as forms of oppression and as resistance.⁴

The triangulation of music, language and power and the importance of considering it as a multimodal discourse is likewise evident in a number of colonial contexts, like the one described by Kofi Agawu in a 2009 distinguished lecture in which he discusses how the introduction of European music to Africa in the nineteenth century contributed to the colonisation of African music.⁵ In that lecture, held at the Centre for Interdisciplinary Research in Music Media and Technology (Montreal, Canada), Agawu associates the musical concept of tonality – a term used to describe the hierarchical arrangement of relations between tones in a musical work – to the system of the colonial enterprise. He says: “Tonality, understood as a hierarchically organized system of relations animated by desire, accompanied Europe’s ostensibly civilizing mission to Africa from the 1800s on”.⁶ As he connects music to language and associates them with Western epistemological truth claim over the cultures of Africa, he describes how the standards (read the system) of European music (and language) were not only completely new to the African groups, but they could hardly be recognised, and only with great difficulty achieved, in indigenous tone languages.⁷ Agawu maintains:

So, this is musical violence of a very high order ... For the colonizer they [the religious hymns] were a means of exerting power and control over native populations by making them speak a tonal language that they had no chance of mastering. A language, moreover, whose reassuring cadences and modest trajectories would prove alluring, have a sedative effect, and keep Africans trapped in a prison-house of diatonic tonality.⁸

The imposition of a European diatonic tonality over the African one, which is mostly pentatonic, encapsulates the whole process of cultural colonization and domination of European nations over African ones according to a procedure that long pre-dates the nineteenth century and that originally saw the enslavement of African people and their deporting to the Americas, where they underwent a process of complete de-humanisation meant to completely annihilate their identities, languages and beliefs,⁹ and

² Theo van Leeuwen, “The Critical Analysis of Musical Discourse”, *Critical Discourse Studies*, 9.4 (2012), 319-328, 319.

³ See Daniel Bender et al., eds., “Editor’s Introduction. Sound Politics: Critically Listening to the Past”, *Radical History Review*, 121 (January 2015), 1-7.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ On the importance of considering music as a multimodal discourse see Lyndon C. S. Way and Simon McKerrell, “Understanding Music as Multimodal Discourse”, in *Music as Multimodal Discourse: Semiotics, Power and Protest* (London: Bloomsbury, 2017), 1-20, 8.

⁶ Kofi Agawu, “Tonality as a Colonizing Force in African Music”, distinguished lecture (Canada: CIRMMT, 2009), <https://www.cirmmt.org/activities/distinguished-lectures/agawu>, accessed 22 October 2018.

⁷ This issue recalls Homi Bhabha’s discussion of mimicry, with “the Other” being the subject of a difference which is almost the same, but not quite (with all its implications in the shifting relation between power and resistance). See Homi Bhabha, “Of Mimicry and Man: The Ambivalence of Colonial Discourse”, in *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), 85-92.

⁸ Agawu, “Tonality”.

⁹ Oriana Palusci, “Crossing the River: New Stories to Be Told”, *Cycnos*, 32.1 (2016), 141-156, 142.

that, by reducing them to pure matter or flesh, ungendered them in the process.¹⁰ An ungendering of blackness that, as Riley Snorton recognises, “became a site of fugitive maneuvers wherein the dichotomized and collapsed designations of male-man-masculine and female-woman-feminine remained open – that is fungible – and the black’s figurative capacity to change form as a commoditized being engendered flow”.¹¹ Once they arrived on the other side of the Atlantic, as part of what came to be known as the Triangular Slave Trade or Middle Passage, enslaved African people were often converted to Christianity. Their conversion often meant – among other things – that they were induced to accept their condition, thus avoiding rebellions, as they were sedated by the reassuring cadences of European music, but also of its languages and cultural systems. Nevertheless, despite systematic attempts at dismantling their cultural belonging, a number of West African cultural traits were retained, constituting a form of resistance to cultural assimilation and subjugation. Similarly, as Snorton notes, the ungendering of blackness produced sites of resistance inasmuch as it enabled the creation of spaces for gender and racial re-articulation of identity beyond Western necessarily limiting dichotomous categories and definitions.

Jazz music emerges from this exact context. Evolving from hollers, slave songs and spirituals performed by African slaves in American plantations, it bears in its origin forms of cultural resistance through the cross-fertilisation of different cultural and musical traditions: Christian and folk songs from Europe, drumming from Africa, European diatonic and African pentatonic scales and harmonic patterns, hence being inherently a hybrid, fluid genre which resists being fitted into either/or categories or definitions. As a matter of fact, spirituals were often used as discursive practices of indirection inasmuch as African slaves would often encode in the form of metaphors and intertextual references secret messages – unintelligible to their European masters – with the aim of planning revolts and/or escapes to the North.¹² Additionally, influenced by the African American musical tradition, jazz often subverts the metronomic time typical of Western music – and Western classic order of time – by anticipating or delaying the beat or by superimposing triple or duple times on one another in limited polyrhythmicity.¹³ It thus makes explicit how, as the exergue to this essay cites, music can align itself with the time of the clock or subvert it.

Jazz originates from the cultural tradition of the black diaspora which has always considered of pivotal importance conceptions of language and identity as performances, as fluid, since they represented the most suited survival strategy against a language-system that constantly tried to annihilate black people. As such, it represents a counter discourse to the linearity of Western official historiography and its essentialist notions of identity crystallised around the Enlightenment idea(l) of the Western *cogito*, that is the all rationalist Euro-American white heterosexual man as the privileged subject of knowledge.

It is in this sense that the Scottish writer of mixed Scottish and Nigerian parentage and Scots Makar Jackie Kay uses music in her first novel *Trumpet*, published in 1998. In her novel, Kay draws on the way black music, and jazz in particular, has changed over time and on how identity is likewise constantly changing, shifting, fluid. In her words:

jazz ... interests me because it's such a fluid form and it comes from the blues and I like the idea that black music has shifted and changed. It's like identity in that way, identity's something that's fluid, it's not

¹⁰ Hortense Spillers, “Mama’s Baby, Papa’s Maybe: An American Grammar Book”, *Diacritics*, 17.2 (Summer 1987), 64-81.

¹¹ C. Riley Snorton, *Black on Both Sides: A Racial History of Trans Identity* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2017), 59.

¹² These discursive practices of indirection or diversion, as E. Patrick Johnson explains, formed part of a long list of means of resistance employed by African slaves that included a number of embodied performances going from the simple lying to the master or pretending to misunderstand his orders to cheating, stealing from him, mutilating themselves in order to escape work, etc. See E. Patrick Johnson, “Black Performance Studies: Genealogies, Politics, Futures”, in D. Soyini Madison and Judith Hamera, eds., *The Sage Handbook of Performance Studies* (Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2006), 446-463, 453; Monique Allewaert, *Ariel’s Ecology: Plantations, Personhood, and Colonialism in the American Tropics* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2013), 107.

¹³ Van Leeuwen, *Music, Speech, Sound* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1999), 58.

something that's static and fixed ... I think the wonder part about certain pieces of music is that when we're listening to them we can lose ourselves in them, but we can also find ourselves in them, that music defines us, but it also help [sic] us to lose our definitions.¹⁴

Drawing on the capacity of (jazz) music to define us and simultaneously helping us to lose our definitions, Kay uses the "language of music" in order to advance an anti-essentialist conception of both gender and race, inasmuch as said language enables the black transgender protagonist (Joss Moody) to express forms of gender identity that are more fluid, shifting, unmoored from the male/female dichotomy. The aim of this essay is therefore to investigate Kay's use of musical discourse in her text, that is to say how she employs the specialized discourse of (jazz) music in order to enable the articulation of alternative forms of gender identification and belonging, which are otherwise of difficult expression through common uses of language alone. The expression "language of music" works on different levels in the novel inasmuch as the narrative is not only influenced by jazz music both thematically and structurally, but presents as well a resemanticisation of its jargon or, in other words, it offers a re-signification of specific terms belonging to jazz music in order to express something different, in this specific case the way Joss Moody expresses his trans* identity by stripping himself of all the racialised and gendered attributes attached onto him by society, to then recreate a more fluid conception of identity, just as Kay suggests with her image of music defining us but also helping us losing our definitions.¹⁵ It will then explore excerpts of the Italian translation of the novel by Sandro Melani, published with the same title by the Italian feminist publishing house La Tartaruga in 1999, in which the specialised discourse of jazz music is mostly overlooked. The final aim is to show the importance that LSP (language for specific purposes) or specialised discourse can play not only in the encoding of gender issues in a text, but also in the interpretation of a literary text and its translation into other languages.

2. Jackie Kay's *Trumpet*

Trumpet was inspired by the life story of Billy Tipton, a white American pianist and saxophonist who was born Dorothy Lucille Tipton in Oklahoma City in 1914 and who lived for all of his life as a male jazz musician. Intrigued by the fact of living one's whole life as the opposite sex, Kay builds up her narrative around the life story of the fictive deceased black jazz musician Joss Moody who, born anatomically female, lives his entire life as a man. The story reconstructs Joss's life and dwells on a secret (i.e., his trans* identity) that is in fact a revealed secret, inasmuch as the reader learns about it in the very first pages of the novel. The story of Joss's life slowly emerges through the recollection of the fragmented memories of a series of people who did not know the truth about his trans* identity and the only one who did, that is his widow Millie (Millicent MacFarlane). Therefore, Kay weaves a polyphonic narration, in Bakhtinian terms, mainly through the accounts of Joss's wife Millie, their adopted son Colman, the tabloid journalist Sophie Stones – who wants to write a book about "the secret" concerning his life – and to a lesser extent through those of other minor characters. In this sense, the novel finds an antecedent in the 1976 novel *Coming through Slaughter* by the Sri Lankan-born Canadian writer Michael

¹⁴ Jackie Kay, "Jackie Kay Interview", *The Poetry Archive*, (2005-2016), <http://www.poetryarchive.org/interview/jackie-kay-interview>, accessed 22 October 2018.

¹⁵ My use of the term "trans*" follows Kai Green's usage in order to emphasise a movement away from the typical perception of trans-gender and/or trans-sexual identity as a passage from one gender to another, which thus recognises and reinforces gender polar oppositions (i.e., male or female), and toward an idea of trans* identity as a "multidirectional, unpredetermined set of embodied motions that [...] affect and are affected by structures of governmentality", see Kai M. Green, "The Essential I/Eye in We: A Black TransFeminist Approach to Ethnographic Film", *Black Camera* 6.2 (Spring 2015), 187-200, 192. This alternative idea of trans* identity can also be thought of as an assemblage, see Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. by Brian Massumi (London: Continuum, 2003 [1980]).

Ondaatje who recreates the life story of Buddy Bolden through the perspective of the people who were closest to him, each one narrating the events in their own voice.

In opposition to 'monologism' – which is characteristic of traditional writing and thought – in which a single narrator imposes their standpoint over the narrated events, 'polyphony' (or 'dialogism') enables the emergence and recognition of a multiplicity of voices and perspectives developing individually.¹⁶ Interestingly enough, Bakhtin borrows the term 'polyphony' from music. Hence, if we consider the importance of music as social interaction, we can make a distinction between 'monophony', signalling "social unison", and 'polyphony', as an instance of "social pluralism".¹⁷ In "social unison" all participants sing and/or play the same notes indicating either solidarity or conformity and lack of individuality, while in "social pluralism", different melodies are simultaneously played or sung, each on its own, yet all fitting harmoniously together, therefore representing a form of interaction in which all participants are 'equal but different'.¹⁸

An instance of polyphony (and as such of "social pluralism") is the musical interaction pattern known as "call and response" which is typical of African and Afro-diasporic musical traditions, including jazz which, as already mentioned, does not only influence the narrative structure of *Trumpet*, but represents as well an important instrument of interpretation and fruition of the novel and, as such, should be taken into consideration in the translation of the text.

In fact, the very narrative structure of the novel reflects jazz music inasmuch as it offers the reader an account of the same story (that of Joss) which is improvised time and again and told through different perspectives, just like jazz is made up of a refrain and improvised new melodic solo parts.¹⁹ Kay reflects on this issue in a 1999 interview for the literary magazine *Bold Type* in which she states:

I wanted to tell a story, the same story, from several points of view. I was interested in how a story can work like music and how one note can contain the essence of the whole. I wanted to write a novel whose structure was very close to jazz itself.²⁰

Indeed both jazz music and Celtic folks songs – which are interestingly characterised by the pentatonic scale typical of jazz music and African music more generally – represent an important influence in Kay's writing, as a result of her exposure to them while growing up in Glasgow with her white adoptive parents Helen and John Kay, who were passionate about jazz and Scottish poetry and music.²¹

3. The translation of music as LSP in *Trumpet*

The chapter "Music", on which I will focus my analysis, emblematically occupies the central part of the novel and describes Joss's 'en-trance' into the music: the experience of playing seems in fact to take him

¹⁶ See Mikhail M. Bakhtin, *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*, trans. and ed. by Caryl Emerson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999 [1984]), 5-46. Ibid.

¹⁷ Van Leeuwen, "The Critical Analysis of Musical Discourse", 322.

¹⁸ Van Leeuwen notes that "social unison" is usually found in 'leaderless' societies where consensus and conformity prevail but also in more complex societies (like Western one) in the pub, the sports stadium, the church, the school or the army. He also notes how in European music polyphony started to develop in the ninth century to then being supplanted by homophony (or "social domination") during the industrial revolution, when it culminated in the symphony orchestra. Another issue that he explores, drawing on Max Weber, is the interesting relationship between the orchestra and the factory, and how the industrial revolution paralleled the development of the symphonic orchestra where the same division of labour and rhythmic cadence seemed to occur. See also Max Weber, *The Rational and Social Foundation of Music* (Edwardsville: Illinois U.P., 1958 [1911]).

¹⁹ Kay, "Interview: Jackie Kay in Conversation to Maya Jaggi and Richard Dyer", *Wasafiri*, 14.29 (1999), 53-61, 56.

²⁰ Kay cit. in Lars Eckstein, "Performing Jazz, Defying Essence: Music as a Metaphor of Being in Jackie Kay's *Trumpet*", *ZAA*, 54.1 (2006), 1-15, 7.

²¹ Kay, "Interview with Jackie Kay" interviewed by Laura Severin, *Free Verse: A Journal of Contemporary Poetry and Poetics*, 2 (2002), http://english.chass.ncsu.edu/freeverse/Archives/Spring_2002/interviews/J_Kay.html, accessed 22 October 2018.

literally into a state of trance. It traces, to use Kay's words in the previously mentioned 2005 interview, the capacity of music to define us, but also to help us losing our definitions.²² As a matter of fact, the experience of playing jazz music enables Joss to blur temporal, gender and racial categories and, in order to highlight this process, Kay shows the reader the collapsing of language (as a system) itself: specialised terms belonging to jazz music are re-signified and re-contextualised in order to break down the language and recompose it in a way that can better reflect specific experiences otherwise destined to remain unspeakable.²³ In this sense, Kay's experimentation with language parallels the approach in translation known as feminist translation, inasmuch as the latter seeks to etymologically dismantle conventional vocabulary and to introduce a new lexicon capable of expressing the experience of women in a patriarchal society governed by phallogocentrism.²⁴ As Hatim puts it, in feminist translation:

Language is fragmented at will and conventional syntactic and semantic structures are not simply disregarded, but rather examined more closely for concealed meanings. Put differently, language becomes a political weapon and conventional discourse targeted, since it is here that power is thought to reside.²⁵

While the so-called womanhandling – consisting in making the feminist translator visible in the target text, in making her/him “an active participant in the creation of meaning”²⁶ – is often used to mitigate forms of misogynist discourse in the source text and to introduce a feminist angle on it, its use in a feminist source text remains still relevant as it prevents a loss of meaning or, in other words, the loss of the potential for subversion which is already intrinsic in the text.

Kay's chapter presents in fact a complex discursive pattern which aims at reflecting, both semantically and syntactically, the peculiar experience of losing, deconstructing and recreating one's identity markers pertaining both to gender and race through (the language of) music. At the lexical level, it comprises different types of specialised terms that include musical terms, professionalisms and jargonisms, as well as general words (e.g., colloquialisms, general slang, etc.) that have entered specialised musical discourse through resemanticisation. An example is the expression “to get down” – originally indicating an invitation to dance, then diachronically used to connote the act of participating in an activity with other people, the fact of being at ease with a situation, and later on still assuming also a sexual connotation – which is resemanticised in musical term so as to mean “to play exceptionally well, with abandon”.²⁷ Other instances of specialised language include musical terms (e.g., “growl” and “false fingering” indicating a specific playing technique, or also a singing technique in the first case; “to blow” synonym for “to play” as related to any wind instrument; “swing” indicating both the quality of a jazz performance and a specific style of jazz which started to become popular in the 1930s; “rip” a type of glissando; etc.), professionalisms (e.g., “jam” for “jam session”) and jargonisms (e.g., “cat” meaning “musician”; “horn” meaning “wind or brass instrument” and “chops” indicating the musician's strong abilities and endurance).

I will concentrate on a series of examples in order to show – through a comparative analysis of the source text in English (on the left column) and its Italian translation (the target text on the right column)

²² Kay, “Jackie Kay Interview”.

²³ For a discussion on the way music, within the context of the black diaspora and therefore as an expression of Black aesthetics, enables the blurring of boundaries and troubles notions of subjectivity and sovereignty see, among the others, Alexander G. Weheliye, *Phonographies: Grooves in Sonic Afro-Modernity* (Durham: Duke U.P., 2005); Fred Moten, *Black and Blur* (Durham: Duke U.P., 2017); Nadia Ellis, “Out and Bad: Toward a Queer Performance Hermeneutic in Jamaican Dancehall,” *Small Axe* 35 (July 2011), 7-23.

²⁴ See Basil Hatim, *Teaching and Research in Translation*, Second Edition (Harlow, UK: Pearson, 2013), 57.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 57-58.

²⁶ Barbara Godard, “Theorizing Feminist Discourse/Translation,” *Tessera* 6 (1989), 42-53, 50.

²⁷ All About Jazz, “Jazz Slang”, (2018), www.allaboutjazz.com/jazz-slang-by-aaj-staff, accessed 22 October 2018.

– how the acknowledgment of specialised terms can affect both the textual interpretation and the ensuing translation strategies adopted.

The description of Joss's journey through music begins with these words:

When he gets down, and he doesn't always get down deep enough, he loses his sex, his race, his memory. He strips himself bare, takes everything off, till he's barely human. Then he brings himself back, out of this world. Back, from way. He has to get to the centre of a whirlwind, screwballing in musical circles till he is very nearly out of his mind. Getting there is painful. The journey is so whacky, so wild that he sometimes fears he'll never return sane. He licks his chops. He slaps and flips and flies. He goes down, swirling and whirling till he's right down at the very pinpoint of himself. A small black mark. The further he goes, the smaller he gets. That's the thing. It's so fast, he's speeding, crashing, his fingers going like the hammers, frenzied, blowing up a storm. His leather lips. His satchelmouth.²⁸

Quando scende giù, e non sempre scende giù abbastanza a fondo, perde il sesso, la razza, la memoria. Si denuda, si spoglia di tutto, fino ad essere a malapena umano. Poi torna in sé, fuori da questo mondo. Da molto lontano. È doloroso arrivarci. Deve arrivare al centro di una tromba d'aria, roteando in cerchi musicali fino a perdere quasi la testa. Il viaggio è così pazzesco, così scatenato che talvolta ha paura di non riacquistare più la ragione. Si lecca i baffi. Con un colpo secco e uno scatto si libra in aria. Scende giù, turbinando e frullando finché non si ritrova al nucleo stesso del suo essere. Un piccolo segno nero. Quanto più avanza, tanto più rimpicciolisce. È così che dev'essere. È tutto così rapido, e lui sfreccia veloce, precipita, le sue dita si muovono decise come i martelli, eccitate, scatenano una tempesta. Le sue labbra di cuoio. La sua bocca a sacco.²⁹

In the incipit, the expression “to get down” means “to play with abandon” in jazz terms and connotes the experience of losing oneself in music, the text continues in fact with a description of the loss of the identity markers of race and gender as produced precisely by this experience of playing and losing oneself in music. While this seems to be the main message the author wants to convey, it remains slightly overlooked in the target text where jazz terminology is not taken into account. By literally translating “gets down” with “scende giù”, the translator seems in fact to highlight a different aspect – namely the capacity of music to generate introspection, hence signalling Joss's descent into his innermost self – thus inevitably neglecting the whole experience of jazz music engendering a dissolution and reconstitution of the self which characterizes the chapter.

After the description of the painful, vertiginous, speeding journey into the music, the expression “licks his chops” may signify, as the target text suggests, anticipation and eagerness (as in “to lick one's lips” or in Italian “leccarsi i baffi”). Yet, if jazz as LSP is taken into consideration, it could also mean something different. In jazz terms the word “lick” signals “a short motif or formula inserted into an improvisation when the context permits or when invention lapses”,³⁰ while “chops” stands both for the lips of a brass player and more broadly for that player's strong technical ability or endurance.³¹ Taking everything into account, the sentence may thus signal eagerness to play, or express the way Joss is playing, that is by showing his abilities, by improvising and enduring.

Following in the text, the expression “He slaps and flips and flies” has been translated into Italian with “con un colpo secco e uno scatto si libra in aria”. In this instance, the target text might attempt to make more coherent a source text that has a very complex syntactic structure and presents difficulties even at the lexical level. The choice operated by the translator might have been to connect this sentence with the previous expression (“leccarsi i baffi”) and – by recalling the actions of a cat (a word that in jazz terms also indicates a jazz player) – providing the reader with the idea of something more instinctual,

²⁸ Kay, *Trumpet* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1998), 131. From now on quoted in the text as *Trumpet*.

²⁹ Kay, *Trumpet*, trans. by Sandro Melani (Milano: La Tartaruga, 1999), 135. From now on quoted in the text as *Melani*.

³⁰ Robert Witmer, in Barry Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove Dictionary of Jazz*, vol. 1 A-K (London: Macmillan Press Limited, 1988), 40-41.

³¹ Witmer, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 208.

happening outside of this world: "He strips himself bare, takes everything off, till he's barely human. Then he brings himself back, out of this world" (*Trumpet*, 131). The connection with animality is in fact something that returns several times in the chapter (e.g., an umbilical cord is associated with a snake; the expression "galloping piano" is followed by "sweating like a horse"), and in the novel at large. If we consider the influence of jazz terminology in the novel, on the other hand, "slap" or "slap-bass" refers to an effect produced on the double bass when "the string is drawn away from, or across, the fingerboard at high tension and then released suddenly so that the resulting note is accompanied by a percussive click or slapping sound as the string hits the fingerboard";³² "flip" indicates a combination of two types of glissandos: a "lift" rising from the end of a note, followed by a "fall off";³³ and in jazz slang it also means "to go crazy" as a verb or it refers to an "eccentric" as a noun;³⁴ while "fly" in jazz terms is a synonym for "smooth" or "slick".³⁵ In this case the importance of considering jazz as LSP is particularly clear since it enables a reading of the sentence as a description of the specific way in which the musician plays by showing his ability and technique and, again, reflects his experience of losing himself into the music, until he becomes a "small black mark" (perhaps a musical note).

Later on in the text, the use of the word "blowing" brings together the act of playing an instrument (if "to blow" is considered as a musical term)³⁶ with the vertiginous experience – similar to a tempest – that ensues. The use of this term, together with the expressions "leather lips" and "satchelmouth" (which is also the way the famous African American trumpeter Louis Armstrong was nicknamed, sometimes shortened as "Satchmo"),³⁷ represent an instance of polysemy in the way Kay introduces – by way of camouflage and in order to say something different, therefore deploying the linguistic strategy of indirection – jazz terms in her novel.³⁸ Even if monoreferentiality has initially been considered one of the key lexical features of specialised discourse,³⁹ and reflects some of the desirable qualities of specialised discourse identified by Lothar Hoffman,⁴⁰ cases of ambiguity in the guise of polysemy can also appear, since specialised discourse employs words drawn from general language which undergo a process of specialisation and vice versa, that is, in some instances specialised terms become part of everyday lexis.⁴¹ In this case the polysemy is possible – and the same is true for a number of examples which I will highlight later on in the analysis – because jazz as LSP is used in a different context, that is in literature. Therefore, while monoreferentiality implies that only one meaning is allowed in a given context, its transposition in literature enables the possibility both of engendering metaphorical meanings and of carrying intertextual references.

The chapter includes other instances of polysemy as in the following lines:

And he is bending in the wind, scooping pitch, growling.... Running changes. Changes running faster, quicker, dangerous. A galloping piano behind him. Sweating like a horse. Break it down. Go on.

E si china nel vento, impostandosi, grugnendo.... Cambiamenti continui. Cambiamenti sempre più veloci, più rapidi, più pericolosi. Dietro di lui un piano al galoppo. Suda come un cavallo. Smetti. Dai, smetti.

³² Alyn Shipton, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove Dictionary of Jazz*, vol. 2 L-Z (London: Macmillan Press Limited, 1988), 465.

³³ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 390.

³⁴ All About Jazz, "Jazz Slang".

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Witmer, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 119.

³⁷ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 2, 416.

³⁸ See Celia M. Britton, *Édouard Glissant and Postcolonial Theory: Strategies of Language and Resistance* (Charlottesville: U.P. of Virginia, 1999), especially the chapter "Camouflaged Languages: Detour and Ruse".

³⁹ Maurizio Gotti, *Investigating Specialized Discourse* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2005).

⁴⁰ The desirable qualities of specialized discourse mentioned by Hoffman (1984) are: 1) exactitude, simplicity and clarity; 2) objectivity; 3) abstractness; 4) generalization; 5) density of information; 6) brevity or laconism; 7) emotional neutrality; 8) unambiguity; 9) impersonality; 10) logical consistency; 11) use of defined technical terms, symbols and figures. See Lothar Hoffman, "Seven Roads to LSP", *Special Language – Fachsprache*, 6.1-2 (1984), 28-38.

⁴¹ Gotti, *Investigating Specialized Discourse*, 30.

Break it down. It is all in the blood.... When he was something else. Somebody else. Her. That girl. The trumpet screams. He's hot. She's hot. He's hot. The whole room is hot. He plays his false fingers. Chokes his trumpet. He is naked. This is naked jazz. O-bop-she-bam. Never lying. Telling it like it is. (*Trumpet*, 131-132)

Sta tutto nel sangue.... Quando [lui] era un'altra cosa. Un'altra persona. Lei. Quella ragazza. La tromba grida. È eccitato. È eccitata. È eccitato. Tutta la sala è eccitata. Suona con le sue false dita. Soffoca la tromba. È nudo. Questo è jazz nudo. O-bop-she-bam. Non mente mai. Dice le cose come stanno. (*Melani*, 135-136).

This excerpt contains other examples of specialised terms re-contextualised. If it is true that Joss might be actually bending in the wind (as the target text suggests), the passage could also refer to Joss bending the note, a reading endorsed by the expression “scooping the pitch” as in raising the pitch, and “growling” recalling a specific playing/singing technique. As a matter of fact, in jazz as LSP the term “bend” indicates “a variation in pitch upwards or downwards during the course of a note”;⁴² “scoop” on wind instruments refers to “a glissando rising to the beginning of a note, achieved entirely with the embouchure”;⁴³ and the musical term “growl” denotes the production of a particular rough or “dirty” tone by brass and woodwind players and singers.⁴⁴ The three examples thus refer to the variation and improvisation that Joss introduces to the music while playing, something that anticipates the issue of gender variation.

The next example – the expression “Running changes. Changes running” – represents, through a repetition with inversion, a clear instance of resemanticisation typical of Kay's play with words. “Running changes” is an expression quite specific to jazz music: “running” is a synonym for “playing” and “changes” refer to “the harmonic progression of an existing theme on which a jazz performance is based”;⁴⁵ hence meaning “using suitable scales over each given chord of the tune”.⁴⁶ Yet, through repetition and inversion, the act of playing music introduces as well the issue of change, of transformation – in this case of gender identity – that is reflected in the text by the shifting pronouns, from male to female, and back again. In this case the expression “break it down” – a slang term meaning “get it hot” – introduces both the issue of the fragmentation of identity and the approaching important theme of “sex-change”, which has been building up in the narrative as a ‘crescendo’ through the attention given to Joss's peculiar way of playing, of experiencing music, as if in a trance.

The expression “The trumpet screams”, as a matter of fact, is an intertextual reference to the “trumpets pealing Truth!” in Virginia Woolf's *Orlando*. In this text, it is exactly while the trumpets resoundingly announce the ‘truth’ that the sex-change of the protagonist Orlando takes place, and the author declares “we have no choice left but confess – he was a woman”.⁴⁷ The expression “he was a woman” is repeated time and again in the novel becoming a sort of leitmotiv together with the other repeated expression “Running changes. Changes running”. This expedient is used by Kay not only to emphasise ‘change’ and ‘transformation’ as key words in her novel, but also in order to represent, just as Woolf did with Orlando, sex-change or gender-change as a common event that is part of the ever-changing process of identity transformation, hence avoiding forms of spectacularisation (something that, on the other hand, the tabloid journalist Sophie Stones constantly tries to do in the novel).

While it is not my intention to romanticise jazz or black music which, even in its most recent formulations continues to be interested by heterosexist and gender biased practices (one only has to think

⁴² Witmer, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 95-96.

⁴³ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 2, 430.

⁴⁴ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 455.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, 201.

⁴⁶ A Passion for Jazz!, “Glossary of Jazz Terms”, (2018), <https://www.apassion4jazz.net/glossary.html>, accessed 22 October 2018.

⁴⁷ Virginia Woolf, *Orlando: A Biography* (Ware: Wordsworth, 2003 [1928]).

about the fact that women still tend to be mainly vocalists in jazz) –⁴⁸ I do want to emphasize how it can be, and has similarly been in the past (e.g., the expression of lesbian desire by the blues singers of the 1920s), a space for transformation, for freedom, especially when considering the negotiation of space for the expression of “black female libidinality”,⁴⁹ and its use within a masculine-dominated arena.⁵⁰

In this context, and especially with regards to the translation, it is interesting to notice that since English is considered a “natural gender” language as opposed to a “grammatical gender” one (such as Italian, French or Spanish) – that is to say that English speakers usually refer to nouns with the male or female pronoun based on their being biologically male or female in the real world⁵¹ – the pronoun assumes a particularly important role in revealing the sex or gender of both names and the invariable adjectives. In the target text the Italian inflectional suffixes “-o” to indicate the masculine and “-a” for the feminine (“È eccitato. È eccitata. È eccitato”) are equivalent to the use of the pronouns “he” and “she” in the source text (“He’s hot. She’s hot. He’s hot”). On the other hand, while in English it is compulsory to specify the subject in a sentence like in “When he was something else” (*Trumpet*, 131), Italian leaves more space for indeterminacy through the (possible) elision of the subject: “Quando era un'altra cosa” (*Melani*, 135). In this case the subject could have been added also in Italian so as to emphasise even more the issue of gender transformation (e.g., “Quando [lui] era un'altra cosa”) according to the feminist translation procedure that seeks to make visible gender difference, even if at the risk, perhaps, of sounding slightly redundant.

Furthermore, while the term “O-bop-she-bam” is an expression that recalls the Bebop – a style of jazz developed by young players in the early 1940s,⁵² the other two terms “hot” and “false fingers” are another example of polysemy. In jazz terms “hot” is both used “to suggest the qualities of excitement, passion, and intensity” and “to differentiate ‘real’ jazz from the ‘sweet’ music played by the more commercial dance bands” by coining the term “hot jazz” to indicate the jazz of the early 1920s and swing periods in the USA,⁵³ while “false fingering” is a musical term that refers to a playing technique “of altered finger placement that produces tones or density of sound on horns that are not available by orthodox techniques”.⁵⁴ Yet the two terms, read in the context of this ecstatic, physical and emotional journey into music, assume other connotations as well. The experience narrated is certainly very physical, sexualised even, as an expression of black female libidinality building up in a crescendo of tension waiting to be released as suggested by the adjectives “faster”, “quicker” and especially “hot” and “naked”, the verbs “sweating” and “chokes”, and the reference to “false fingers” that may recall female autoeroticism. Also the sentence “It is all in the blood” lends itself to multiple interpretations: is it the blood beating, pumping through Joss’s veins and body or is it another type of blood, perhaps menstrual

⁴⁸ See, among the others, Paul Gilroy, *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness* (London: Verso, 1999 [1993]) and Weheliye, *Phonographies*.

⁴⁹ Weheliye, *Phonographies*, 186.

⁵⁰ Weheliye uses the term “black female libidinality” with regards to Tricia Rose’s discussion on the importance of voicing, making known and explicit through narration, forms of black female desire, intimacy and pleasure as a potential for liberation, since keeping them secret through a politics of moralism “will not reduce objectifying, male-empowering representations and treatment of women” (Tricia Rose, “‘Two Inches or a Yard’: Silencing Black Women’s Sexual Expression”, in Ella Shohat, ed., *Talking Visions: Multicultural Feminism in a Transnational Age* (Boston, Mass.: MIT Press, 1998), 315-324, 321). In the novel, as a matter of fact, if Joss is perhaps initially subjected to masculine protocols necessary for his emergence as Britain’s legendary trumpet player, he then uses that same system in order to express the potential for more fluid conceptions of identity, and he does so by undoing it from within, through a process of disidentification.

⁵¹ Suzanne Romaine, *Communicating Gender* (London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers, 1999), 73.

⁵² The Bebop is particularly associated with Charlie Parker, John Birks “Dizzy” Gillespie, Kenny Clarke, Charlie Christian and Bud Powell. It is characterised by a stressed instrumental ability expressed through rapid, busy, chord-progression-driven improvisations using irregular, syncopated phrasing with many tensions and alliterations. See A Passion for Jazz, “Glossary”.

⁵³ Eric Thacker, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 539-540.

⁵⁴ See Columbia University Centre for Jazz Studies (CJS), “Jazz Glossary” (2018), <http://ccnmtl.columbia.edu/projects/jazzglossary/>, accessed 22 October 2018; Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 1, 352-353.

blood? Here, while male gender identity and female anatomy intersect each other by breaking down the boundaries of heteronormative conception of gender and selfhood, Kay uses the polysemic potential of the “language of music” to express something unspeakable in contemporary Western heteropatriarchy, that is the possibility of female masculinity or male femininity, and the potential of queer forms of desire. Kay's play with jazz terms and their resemanticisation is lost in the target text where, probably for editorial reasons, a more literal, sanitised even, rendition of the text has been preferred over the feminist paradigm which praises the translator visibility and the “repossession of the word by women”.⁵⁵

Similarly, the expression “this is naked jazz” reflects both the expression of black female libidinality, the freedom of expression, and emphasises the process through which Joss strips himself of the layers of identity labels that society has attached onto him. In the process, the linear – chrononormative and as such heteronormative – conception of time starts to collapse, and Joss witnesses his own death before seeing his younger self in a flashback:

He's a small girl skipping along an old disused railway line in a red dress.... The picture changes with the light. He can taste himself transforming. Running changes. The body changes shape. From girl to young woman to young man to old man to old woman.... When he starts to come back from the small black point, he finds himself running along the old railway line that his mother never trusted although there were never any trains. Running along he realizes his mother was right never to trust that track. (*Trumpet*, 132-134)

[Lui] È una ragazzina che saltella con un vestito rosso lungo una vecchia linea ferroviaria in disuso.... Il quadro cambia con la luce. Si sente trasformare. Cambiamenti continui. Il corpo cambia forma. Da ragazzina a donna giovane a giovannotto a vecchio a vecchia.... Quando comincia a uscire dal piccolo punto nero si ritrova a correre lungo la vecchia linea ferroviaria di cui sua madre non si fidava mai, anche se non c'era mai nessun treno. Mentre corre sul binario, capisce che sua madre aveva ragione a non fidarsene mai. (*Melani*, 136-137)

Gender identity transformation continues to inform the text with Joss as a small girl (here the emphasis on the male pronoun could have been perhaps reinforced in the translation with “[Lui] è una ragazzina” in order to highlight the continuous transformation) skipping along an old disused railway line. A few lines after, the issue of transformation reappears with more intensity and it is introduced again by the expression “running changes” that, as mentioned before, combines the variation in music with that of gender identity. The sentence “From girl to young woman to young man to old man to old woman” traces the actual process of Joss's gender transformation, his trans* identity as, born a girl, he embraces a male gender identity during his life to then return a woman in the morgue where the medical discourse defines his body as anatomically female.

In this context the reference to the “railway line” holds perhaps a hidden meaning. In jazz terms a “train wreck” signals the “disagreement” of the musicians on their exact location in the tune they are playing; in other words, someone gets lost so the chord changes and the melody may get confused for several bars, but usually there are no fatalities and the journey continues.⁵⁶ As Joss runs along (read agrees) the railway line (which can be read as society's expectations or institutionalised knowledge and assumptions) she realises that the track (the railway, but also the musical tune or the recording)⁵⁷ is not to be trusted. Therefore the musical improvisation, granted by the “train wrack”, enables Joss to think about gender identity ‘off-beat’ in a certain sense, that is following alternative temporalities and ‘paths’ of expression. In the target text both the repetition and re-contextualisation of the term “running” (i.e., “running”, which is present three times in the excerpt, is rendered as “continui”, “correre” and “corre” respectively, so that the visual association of the act of playing, “running” in jazz terms, and of actually

⁵⁵ Godard, “Translating and Sexual Differences”, *Resources for Feminist Research* 13.3 (1984), 13-16, 14.

⁵⁶ See All About Jazz, “Jazz Slang”.

⁵⁷ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 2, 544.

running is lost) and the polysemy of the term “track” (e.g., “track” not only as “rail line”, but also as “recorded tune”, or “sequence of events”, or “way of life”, and so on) remains inevitably overlooked.

Indeed in the novel, it is exactly this alternative experience of time that ultimately enables Joss to deconstruct himself by refusing fixed and stable conceptions of identity (as reflected by the Western *cogito*), and then to recreate himself anew:

All his self collapses – his idiosyncrasies, his personality, his ego, his sexuality, even, finally, his memory. All of it falls away like layers of skin unwrapping. He unwraps himself with his trumpet.... Playing the horn is not about being somebody coming from something. It is about being nobody coming from nothing. The horn ruthlessly strips him bare till he ends up with no body, no past, nothing.... So when he takes off he is the whole century galloping to its close. The wide moors. The big mouth. Scotland. Africa. Slavery. Freedom. He is a girl. A man. Everything, nothing. He is sickness, health. The sun. The moon. Black, white. Nothing weighs him down. Not the past nor the future. He hangs on to the high C and then he lets go. Screams. Lets it go. Bends his notes and bends his body.... He just keeps blowing. He is blowing his story.... He lets it rip. He tears himself apart. He explodes. Then he brings himself back. Slowly, slowly, piecing himself together. (*Trumpet*, 135-136)

Tutto il suo io crolla – le sue idiosincrasie, la sua personalità, il suo ego, la sua sessualità, persino, infine, la sua memoria. Tutto ciò si stacca come strati di pelle che si stiano sfacendo. Si sfa insieme alla sua tromba.... Suonare la tromba non c'entra col fatto di essere qualcuno che arriva da qualcosa. Ha a che fare con il fatto di essere un nessuno che arriva dal nulla. La tromba lo mette spietatamente a nudo finché non si ritrova senza corpo, senza passato, senza niente.... Così, quando lui decolla, è l'intero secolo che galoppa verso la fine. Le ampie brughiere. La grande foce. La Scozia. L'Africa. La schiavitù. La libertà. È una ragazza. Un uomo. Tutto, niente. È la malattia, la salute. Il sole. La luna. Nero, bianco. Niente che lo appesantisca. Né il passato né il futuro. Si tiene aggrappato al do maggiore e poi molla. Grida. Lascia andare. Piega le note e piega il suo corpo.... Continua solo a suonare. Suona la sua storia.... La lascia filare. Lui va in mille pezzi. Esplode. Poi ritorna in sé. Ricomponendosi adagio adagio. (*Melani*, 139-140)

In the description, the collapse of all labels defining a person by their beliefs, sexuality or past is realised with the verb “unwrapping” that represents an intertextual reference to a different type of unravelling that takes place earlier on in the novel: when Joss unwraps the layers of bandages binding his chest and reveals his breasts to his future wife Millie for the first time. As such it stands for Joss's freedom to express his complex identity without the need to fit it into neatly separated boxes based, among other things, on dichotomous conceptions of gender. This process, as the whole chapter emphasises, is made possible through the act of playing music (and the trumpet in particular) as the sentence “He unwraps himself with his trumpet” suggests; something that results slightly overlooked in the target text where the proposition “with” translated as “insieme a” implies the dissolution of both the self and the trumpet.

The expression “he takes off” has been translated as “decolla” since it refers to the process of raising, of Joss lifting himself up through music, but at the same time it also recalls the action of removing (taking off) the bandages and sedimented layers of fixed identity traits as he unwraps himself free.

The terms “moors” and “big mouth” have been respectively translated as “brughiere” and “grande foce” in order to reflect the natural landscapes of Scotland and Africa. Yet, they also carry other implicit meanings, especially if we read them contextually with the words that follow in the text: 1) “moors” (with a capital ‘m’) is also a noun historically used to define Muslim people coming from North Africa and, in its variant “Moore” represents the surname that Joss's father received upon his arrival to Scotland – possibly from Africa – as a way of indicating that he was a black man; 2) “big mouth” or “large lips have historically been stereotypically associated with people of the African diaspora”⁵⁸ so much that the big-lipped African became a cornerstone of American minstrelsy – and were believed to be a visible

⁵⁸ Victoria Pitts-Taylor, ed., *Cultural Encyclopedia of the Body*, vol. 1 A-L (London: Greenwood Press, 2008), 325.

signal of “their underlying animal nature, just as the thin, defined lips of European were thought to be emblematic of a gentler, more refined nature”.⁵⁹

Terms represented as dualistic pairs are then mentioned (e.g., Scotland/Africa; slavery/freedom; girl/man; black/white; everything/nothing; etc.) in order to show the collapsing of such labels, as Joss “bends” not only his notes, but also his identity and the language in the process while he keeps on “blowing” (that is playing) his story, finally free to tell his own version. The musical term “rip” meaning “a loud, violent glissando rising to the beginning of a note”⁶⁰ has been translated as “filare” but perhaps better reflects the will of letting things be, of letting them go unrestrained and, again, the unwrapping (in a violent way, by ripping them) of the identity labels, as Joss tears apart himself (or better, tears apart the identity labels imposed on him) and then slowly recreates his identity anew.

4. Conclusions

Starting from an understanding of music as a multimodal experience and through an analysis of jazz music as LSP in Jackie Kay's *Trumpet*, this essay has outlined the importance of an awareness of specialised discourse both for the textual interpretation of literary texts and for their translation into other languages. Kay's re-contextualisation of some specific terms belonging to jazz music in her novel, or in other words her transposition of specialised language to another context – namely from a specialised musical context to literature – has enabled her to bypass some of the desirable qualities of specialised discourse (e.g., monoreferentiality, lack of emotion, transparency, etc.),⁶¹ qualities that are nevertheless not always applicable to all specialised language.⁶² Similarly, while a broad definition of specialised translation leaves aside literary texts,⁶³ this essay has postulated not only that literature may employ specialised language at length, but also that its translation can be deeply affected, to the extent of experiencing a loss of meaning, by its neglect.

This critical reflection is particularly important in a text such as Kay's *Trumpet* where the author employs the specialised language of (jazz) music in order to find a way to make up for the failure of common language in contemporary racialised heteropatriarchy to account for the experiences of subjectivities who are gendered and racialised through dichotomous systems of categorisation. In fact Kay draws on the potential of black music, as “the social organization of black time for revolution”,⁶⁴ in order to advance through its fluid ability to adapt, shift and change, the militant capacity to ‘bend’ the language – as if in bending a note – to multiply its semantic potential, as a way of reinventing not only music and language, but also identity in the process,⁶⁵ and eventually to find expression for fluid black and queer forms of belonging that hopefully would not be lost in translation.

⁵⁹ Ibid. See also Emilio Amideo, “Undoing Black Masculinity: Isaac Julien's Alternative Grammar of Visual Representation”, in Paul Baker and Giuseppe Balirano, eds., *Queering Masculinities in Language and Culture* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2018), 214.

⁶⁰ Kernfeld, in Kernfeld, ed., *The New Grove*, vol. 2, 380.

⁶¹ Hoffman, “Seven Roads to LSP”.

⁶² Gotti, *Investigating Specialized Discourse*.

⁶³ Maurizio Gotti and Susan Šarčević, *Insights into Specialized Translation* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2006).

⁶⁴ Tavia Nyong'o, *Afro-Fabulations: The Queer Drama of Black Life* (New York: New York U.P., 2019), 11.

⁶⁵ Kay, “Interview: Jackie Kay in Conversation”, 55.

Literary Texts Crossing-Over. A Translation Proposal of Suneeta Peres da Costa's *Saudade* into Italian

Abstract: The article intends to present a discussion on the practice of translation of a novella written by a young Australian author of Goan origins: *Saudade* by Suneeta da Peres Costa. Being aware that the translation, editing and publication of a text by a less known author belonging to a far-away cultural context is not an easy task, we will show how it can be reframed into a target cultural, historical and social panorama avoiding domestication and emphasising the 'unfamiliarity' of some of its peculiar features intended as core elements to present alternative narrations of coloniality. The translation of a culturally and linguistically hybrid text demonstrates how literary translation can be considered as the result of a specialised domain for which the translator needs very specific competences. In fact, as the structure and lexical choices embed the chosen text in the so-called postcolonial context, it is rich in historical, geographical and linguistic intertextual references that are not easily recognizable and need a translator specialised in colonial histories in order to be conveniently conveyed as part of the nature of the text.

Keywords: *literary translation, post-colonial translation, Suneeta Peres da Costa, Saudade, incommunicability*

1. Introduction

In this essay we want to propose and discuss the practice of translation into Italian of a brand-new novella, *Saudade*,² of a young but promising Australian writer, Suneeta Peres da Costa.

Saudade, the second book by Suneeta Peres da Costa was published by Giramondo in March 2018. Born in Australia from parents of Goan origin, Suneeta Peres da Costa is one of the numerous examples of contemporary writers who still experience the effects of colonialism and postcolonialism. Having been raised in a family whose members had the necessity to switch frequently from English to Konkani and vice-versa, she has always had not just the possibility to experience the interstitial space typical of bilingual and bicultural subjects, but also the effects of the power shift that derives from the relationships between dominant and dominated cultures, and that is conveyed through the use of language itself. *Saudade* tells the story of a Goan immigrant family which finds itself stuck in Angola, having to deal with both the idea of remaining loyal to the Portuguese colonial system and the wish to survive the Angolan subversion of the colonial rules.

The choice of a new literary product emerging from a post-colonial/decolonial space, and its rethinking through translation, moves towards a discussion of various issues connected to translation and publishing choices. Being aware that the translation, editing and the acceptance of publication of this text is not an easy task while being a challenging and rewarding experience, we will demonstrate how a text from a very different cultural context must clearly be reframed in our own cultural panorama. This process can take place avoiding the re-adaptation of its peculiar features and cultural elements which are the core of its structure, while on the contrary emphasizing its 'differences' and less known aspects. We know that translation is a practice which cannot be analysed as an isolated act but as part of an ongoing process of intercultural transfer: the translator is first of all a reader, an interpreter of texts, a

¹ E. Federici is lead author of sections 1, 2, 3 and 4 while L. Marino led on sections 5, 6 and 7.

² Suneeta Peres da Costa, *Saudade* (Sydney: Giramondo Publishing, 2018).

mediator between languages and cultures and his/her work becomes the bridge between the source text and the target text. While dialoguing between languages and cultures s/he carries on a transcultural interaction focusing on the communicative function of the text, what the author says, his/her themes, style, the register used and the lexicon. Evidently, the act of 'bridging', creates an intercultural practice which never occurs in a harmonious way, as we cannot assume languages and cultures are homogeneous entities, thus historical, social and ideological elements must be taken into account since they shape this interaction and can affect its results. The translating process does not involve a word, a paragraph or a text, but indeed the transmission of many cultural elements and the re-adaptation of a whole culture in which that text has been written and published.

It has been said that translation is one of the mechanisms to create and transmit cultural and ideological values, and translation choices (which author/text to translate and how) are strictly connected to a precise historical period, aesthetic values, the notion of the canon and literary traditions, the specificities of the target culture in which the text will be received.³ From this perspective, *Saudade* is a textual surface which demonstrates the interface of languages and cultures in contexts which have been colonized and whose linguistic and cultural imagery has been set layer after layer through centuries, as it is the case of Angola. Our aim in proposing a translation of the novella *Saudade* is not merely a linguistic transfer, but a cultural one that implies a deep competence on historical facts, geography and the cultural aspects of the source text which is clearly an example of linguistic and cultural hybridity.

Our methodological approach refers to Post-Colonial Translation theories, where the agency of the translator and the ideological standpoint has been widely problematised analysing postcolonial texts and contexts,⁴ and to the theoretical debate on transnational literatures.⁵ Being Suneeta Peres da Costa an Australian author of Goan origins, that is a transnational author embedded in many linguistic and cultural backgrounds, the translation of her novella requires an archival work on the places and the people represented in the text which is full of cultural-bound terms and intertextual references. Even if we cannot talk of specialized lexicon as it is commonly understood⁶ (Rogers, 2013; Gotti and Sarcevic, 2006) the text presents a specific terminology related to different territories, historical figures and events and the insertion of foreign words related to different domains. On the top of that, being aware of the

³ See Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere, eds., *Constructing Cultures: Essays on Literary Translation* (Philadelphia: Clevedon, 1998).

⁴ See Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, "The Politics of Translation", in Anne Phillips and Michèle Barrett, eds., *Destabilizing Theory: Contemporary Feminist Debates* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1992); Mona Baker, *In Other Words*, Second Edition, (London: Routledge, 1992); André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992); Lawrence Venuti, ed., *Rethinking Translation: Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology* (London: Routledge, 1992). Tejaswini Niranjana, *Siting Translation: History, Post-Structuralism and the Colonial Context* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992); Roman Alvarez and Africa Claramonte Vidal, *Translation, Power, Subversion* (Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters, 1996); Douglas Robinson, *Translation and Empire: Postcolonial Theories Explained* (Manchester: St. Jerome, 1997). Ovidio Carbonell, "Postcolonial (re) Versions. The Theory and Practice of Postcolonial Translation", *Revista Canaria de Estudios Ingleses*, 35 (1997), 245-254; Maria Tymoczko, "Post-Colonial Writing and Literary Translation" in Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi, eds., *Postcolonial Translation: Theory and Practice* (London: Routledge, 1999), p. 21; David Katan, *Translating Cultures. An Introduction for Translators, Interpreters and Mediators* (London: Routledge, 1999); Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi, eds., *Postcolonial Translation: Theory and Practice* (London: Routledge, 1999); Maria Tymoczko, *Translation in a Postcolonial Context: Early Irish Literature in English* (Manchester: St. Jerome, 1999); Sherry Simon and Paul St-Pierre, eds., *Changing the Terms: Translating in the Postcolonial Era* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 2000); Theo Hermans, ed., *Translating Others* (Manchester: St Jerome, 2006); Theo Hermans, *The Conference of the Tongues* (Manchester: St Jerome, 2007); Simona Bertacco, ed., *Language and Translation in Postcolonial Literatures. Multilingual Contexts, Translational Texts* (London: Routledge, 2013).

⁵ See Sandra Ponzanesi and Daniela Merolla, *Migrant Cartographies: New Cultural and Literary Spaces in Post-colonial Europe* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2005); Cecilia Alvstad et al., eds., *Literature, Geography, Translation: Studies in World Writing* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars, 2011); Peter Morgan, "Literary Transnationalism: A Europeanist's Perspective", *Journal of European Studies*, 47.1 (2017), 3-20.

⁶ See Maurizio Gotti and Susan Šarčević, eds., *Insights into Specialized Translation* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2006); Margaret Rogers, *Specialised Translation: Shedding the 'Non-Literary' Tag* (London: Palgrave, 2013).

differences between literary translation and specialised translation, we believe that the translation of a literary text requires a high competence on the textual typology and on the texture and a specialised competence on the context where the text was written and published and on the context in which it will be translated and read. Margaret Rogers'⁷ notion of a 'cross-over' terminology is helpful in considering the translation practice of literary texts, where a vocabulary connected to different domains is present.

The article will be structured in two sections: the first section makes it clear our theoretical and methodological background while presenting the author and the context in which she works and lives, whereas in the second section we present our case-study, engaging in possible translation strategies and offering possible solutions to the problems encountered during the translation practise. In order to do so, we will present some extract focusing on the theme of incommunicability that is one of the *topoi* of post-colonial narrations. Last, bearing in mind that our translation proposal could be one among many, we will offer our conclusions for a hypothetical translation of Peres da Costa's book into Italian.

2. Translating a text, a world and its culture

The following quotations, both taken from Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi,⁸ highlight how much the target audience and context are central to the translation of a text. In fact, beyond being a linguistic transfer, translation has become a metaphorical term for 'locational disrupture' in an era of migrant waves resulting from postcolonialism and diaspora: "Translations are always embedded in cultural and political systems, and in history" and "the strategies employed by translators reflect the context in which the texts are produced" (24). "In our age of (the valorization of) migrancy, exile and diaspora, the word translation seems to have come full circle and reverted from its figurative literary meaning of an interlingual transaction to its etymological physical meaning of locational disrupture" (12).

While the first quotation underlines the ideological and political choices involved in translation work, the second highlights the transnational stories, authors and books emerging as a result of people's movements across borders. Nowadays, Translation Studies are characterised by a substantial body of sophisticated theorisation about Post-Colonial translation and the translator's role as a linguistic and cultural mediator. It has been argued⁹ that the role of the translator as a mediator between cultures is central and that s/he must shift the meanings about representation, identity and power implicit in the source text. In addition, an unbalanced relation between "major and minor" literatures and cultures due to historical reasons has been recognized.¹⁰ Moreover, from a theoretical perspective, a whole new range of non-Western theories have enriched the debate on how to think about translation and its practices.¹¹

The theoretical debate is shaped, today, by the interweaving and dialogue with other fields of study such as Deconstruction, Postcolonial, Gender and Cultural Studies, which yielded new insights into translation issues. The 'Cultural Turn' gave new frames of research and demanded answers to many

⁷ Margaret Rogers, "From Binaries to Borders: Literary and Non-literary Translation", in Helle V. Dam et al., eds., *Moving Boundaries in Translation Studies* (London: Routledge, 2018).

⁸ Bassnett and Trivedi, *Postcolonial Translation*, 12, 24.

⁹ See Basil Hatim and Ian Mason, *The Translator as Communicator* (London: Routledge, 1997); José Santaemilia, ed., *Gender, Sex and Translation: The Manipulation of Identities* (Manchester: St Jerome, 2005).

¹⁰ See Eric Cheyfitz, *The Poetics of Imperialism: Translation and Colonization from The Tempest to Tarzan* (Oxford: Oxford U.P., 1991).

¹¹ See Marilyn Gaddis Rose, ed., *Beyond the Western Tradition: Essays on Translation Outside Standard European* (Binghamton: Center for Research in Translation, State University of New York at Binghamton, 2000); Naoki Sakai and Yukiko Hanawa, *Spectres of the West and the Politics of Translation* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong U.P., 2001); Shu-mei Shih and Francoise Lionnet, *Minor Transnationalism* (Durham: Duke U.P., 2005); Ning Wang and Sun Yifeng, *Translation, Globalisation and Localisation: A Chinese Perspective* (Clevedon, Multilingual Matters, 2008); Naoki Sakai, "How Do We Count a Language? Translation and Discontinuity", *Translation Studies* 2.1 (2009), 71-88; Rosamaria Bosinelli Bollettieri and Elena di Giovanni, eds., *Oltre l'occidente. Traduzione e alterità culturale* (Milano: Bompiani, 2009); Ning Wang, ed., "Translation Studies: Interdisciplinary Approaches", *Perspectives Studies in Translatology*, 11.1 (2010), 11-24.

questions about historical perspectives, translation conventions, strategies, contextual situations and the translator's role. All these theoretical perspectives and their methodologies have changed the attitude towards translating processes, which are not only seen as a non-neutral acts, but as practices in which the interpretation and subjectivities of translators play a meaningful role. If language permeates the way authors represent the world, the debate on Post-Colonial translation and, more recently, on transnational literatures, has outlined that translators need to deconstruct their own potential complicit positions in regards to imperialism, whilst conveying the disruptive power of resistance expressed in the notion of difference in the ST.

The translator's method is based on individual choices by which s/he shapes the structure of the text, reproduces the author's style, decides which lexis will be used, interprets and represents the original text. If the translator's aim is to decode the author's intentions in the source context, his/her ability to juggle among many linguistic and cultural references (to (re)produce the author's narrative world, culture and choices, conditioned by many ideological factors) clearly produces a 'located' reading of the work and affects the perception of the author in the target context. In the fundamental study *Postcolonial Translation: Theory and Practice*¹² Bassnett and Trivedi address the issue of the 'location' of the writer as something central in the process of writing/translating, conceiving translation as a battleground of the postcolonial context where the terms 'translational' and 'transnational' were strictly linked together. Nowadays, however, the issue of transnationalism has been included on the wider discussion about World literature, Global literature and Cosmopolitanism¹³ and scholars researching on the notion of transnational writers have emphasized the connection between life, writing and translation as means to talk about a plurilingual identity.¹⁴ Transnational literatures are today fundamental tools to understand "displacement, disorientation and agency in the contemporary world".¹⁵ The transition from Postcolonial to Transnational Studies has already taken place through works such as Paul Gilroy's *After Empire: Melancholia or Convivial Culture?*¹⁶ and Dipesh Chakrabarty's *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference*¹⁷ which are important studies for a rethinking of translation as a 'cross-category' challenging Eurocentric points of comparative reference. This line of thought demands a contextualized and historicized approach to translation and should be further developed to overcome European categories of thought and theoretical terminology.

First of all, it is important to investigate the ways in which World Literature introduces new global voices in Europe through translation, and how positioned practices of translation can reproduce power relations and colonial stereotypes in the translated text and thus in the reader receptions. Secondly, it is necessary to analyse the issue of cultural transmission through translation and to examine how the same text is differently received according to each context where it is published.

¹² Bassnett and Trivedi, *Postcolonial Translation*.

¹³ See David Damrosch, *What is World Literature?* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 2003); Dirk Delabastida, "Continentalism and the Intention of Traditions in Translation Studies", *Translation and Interpreting Studies*, 6.2 (2011), 29-42; Heniutuk Valerie, "The Single, Shared Text? Translation and World Literature", *World Literature Today* (January-February 2012), 30-34; Susan Stanford Friedman, "Towards a transnational turn in Narrative Studies", *Narrative*, 19.1 (2011), 1-32; Suresh Canagarajah, *Translingual Practice. Global Englishes and Cosmopolitan Relations* (London: Routledge, 2013).

¹⁴ See Steven Kellmann, ed., *The Translingual Imagination* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000); Steven Kellman, ed., *Switching Languages Translingual Writers Reflect on their Craft* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004); Isabelle de Courtivron, ed., *Lives in Translation: Bilingual Writers on Identity and Creativity* (London: Palgrave, 2003).

¹⁵ Azade Seyhan, *Writing Outside the Nation* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 2000), 7.

¹⁶ Paul Gilroy, *After Empire: Melancholia or Convivial Culture?* (London: Routledge, 2004).

¹⁷ Dipesh Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 2000).

3. Translating Suneeta Peres da Costa's world(s)

As history marches on, so thus language. All the terms are rendered inadequate by change: adjectives such as 'exilic', 'ethnic', 'migrant' or 'diasporic' do not sufficiently describe the complexity of contemporary experiences, identities and linguistic processes; the nuances in writing that emerge from the interplay of geographies, stories and cultural practices of authors like Suneeta Peres da Costa demonstrate this. While one may be correct to state that Da Costa's context (Australia) cannot be simplistically considered postcolonial, it is also true that *Saudade* carries many level-bending qualities which often overlap with post-colonial themes. *Saudade* displays many levels of hybridization and the choice to translate a text such as this opens the possibility to look back at some traces given by Post-Colonial scholars in order to decide to use translation strategies which emphasize all the connections the text tries to display with the context where it is born. As Gayatri C. Spivak underlined, "language may be one of the many elements that allow us to make sense of things, of ourselves [...and this] is what produces identity".¹⁸ Similarly, in his analysis on the Indian English novel, G. J. V. Prasad¹⁹ asserted that we use language as a lived practice and a means of choice so that shifts between languages in texts, code-mixing and code-switching are to be understood and then translated as a reflection of social meanings and communicative strategies, even when they are also identity markers signalling the geographical, cultural and social positions of the speakers, signs of the linguistic and cultural hybridity of the source text. In *Siting Translations*,²⁰ Teswaini Niranjana considered translation as a disruptive and disseminating activity since the deconstruction carried on by rewriting opens up a postcolonial space and makes it legible, understandable to a Western reader. Niranjana goes back to the notion of the intertextuality of translations, to the discussion about the canonical nature of some translations and their participation in the practice of subjectification. Post-Colonial Studies scholars have argued that the translated text should convey 'differences', that is to say linguistic features do not necessarily fit the mold of familiarity they have also underlined the necessity to re-translate and re-write history through an active critical reading as part of a cultural resistance. Their studies demonstrate that a text is a textual surface showing the interface of cultures in contexts which have been colonized and whose cultures embody the intermingling of languages.

4. A book entitled *Saudade*

In order to give Suneeta Peres da Costa's book a clear historical context, it is worth mentioning that both Goa and Angola were once Portuguese colonies. The first gained independence from Portugal in 1961 and was annexed to India, while the latter gained independence from Portugal in 1975, about fourteen years after the breakout of the first guerrilla war that devastated the country. Bringing to light an alternative narration of both the Portuguese colonial system and the processes of decolonization that started from the Angolan rebellion, *Saudade* can be understood as a way to propose a decolonizing narration of the processes which brought to the end of colonialism in Portuguese Africa. In fact, the narrator of the story is a woman belonging to an immigrant family, who lives in a country in which her family is considered 'foreign', whose father works for the Portuguese government perpetuating the colonial stigma in a country which is fighting for independence. Moreover, in the acknowledgements the author says she started to write the book inspired by the story of one of her aunts, and did not directly experience the colonial system herself. This means, both the writer and the narrator of the story can be

¹⁸ Spivak, "The Politics of Translation", 177.

¹⁹ G.J.V. Prasad, "The Case of the Indian English Novel", in Bassnett and Trivedi, *Postcolonial Translation*, 47.

²⁰ Niranjana, *Siting Translation*.

considered 'subaltern subjects' who offer a de-centered and de-centering point of view on coloniality and colonial narratives.

Speaking about de-centered and de-centering points of view, it is interesting to notice how the writer deals with women's position into the colonial society. In fact, even if the novella cannot be considered as an example of gendered narrative, the author addresses the issue of gender sketching feminine characters who are actually the depositaries of the stories which are told. There is not a single woman in the book who is not obliged to conform to the paternalistic way of exerting power in a colonial society, and yet Suneeta Peres da Costa makes them stand out indulging much more in their description and trying to give to the reader a deeper insight in their minds and attitudes. While men are presented as monads, women interact, bond, and weave the (colonial) memory of the nation. For this reason, even if it is not a story about women, *Saudade* is a story told by women, where women make a counter-narrative of colonial times. As shown in the following excerpt, the feminine pronouns provide the reader with a deep insight into the feminine universe under the colonial context. Through pronominal reiteration the writer does not just explore the attitudes and physical appearance of female characters but discloses the power of hearing, reshaping and telling the story, and this is made possible through the feminine pronouns:

I sat by her, watching Dona Angela blowing cool air on **her** tea and absentmindedly devouring one after the other until the *papos*, slightly scorched, had vanished. When Ifigênia had left, Dona Angela lowered **her** voice and said **she** was afraid to go to sleep at night. **She** said, We gave education, housing and hospitals to the blacks – where would they be without us? I looked at that moment from Dona Angela's face to my mother's: my mother's face was calm and serene. It was as though the sun was shining where **she** was; **she** seemed to be at once aware of what Dona Angela was saying and yet quite indifferent to it. **She** nodded, telling Dona Angela that **she** was quite right to be upset but meanwhile she was observing the plumes of smoke issuing from the bee boxes where Caetano was busy checking on the hives. I turned again to Dona Angela: **her** large body was cloaked in a heavy mantle of mourning; **her** hair was limp and thin; **her** brow was furrowed and a morsel of custard sat unflatteringly on **her** thick, lower lip. Perhaps **she** had been a young and pretty woman when **she** first came from Portugal, but now **her** face was ravaged – not only from the extraordinary misfortune of losing **her** husband but besieged by terror about an uncertain future, and all **her** gestures seemed colonized by this fear ... (Chap. 2, pos. 92 – 101)

Saudade consists of eleven short chapters told in first person by the protagonist herself, although the story occurs at a different time to that of the narration. The protagonist introduces the reader throughout her routine and that of her family, and peppers the narrative with subtle allusions and references to the political situation of colonial Angola. The eleven chapters are written with an informal and colloquial register mirroring conversation and orality. The rhythm of the narration is characterised by a non-standard use of punctuation, the insertion of repetitions and a specific syntactic structure made of short sentences. The translator finds him/herself facing a text that presents repetitive patterns which not only creates the narration rhythm but emphasize the characters' physical and behavioural traits: "[y]et he was not filled out: he was notional, with a notional head of hair and notional eyes, a notional body and a notional sex, all of which could appear and disappear as mercurially as an idea" (Chap. 6, pos. 397).

In regard to the lexicon the author often resorts to evocative language, visible in detailed descriptions of places, people and events.

Papá was often away on business and so Caetano drove – and as we passed from the new district into the old district of the city, I read the street names: Rua do Senado da Câmara; Rua de Dom João II; ua de António Enes. I recited them to myself with wonder, as Galileo might have recited the relation of the the earth to the sun and the planets rotating in their vast orbits: Avenida dos Combatentes da Grande Guerra; Rua do Coronel de Paiva. I did not know they were merely set out on the same grid as Lisbon, being a

mirror of the colonial imaginary. And now that the names of the streets have changed, I wonder would I recognise them or be lost when moving through them again? (Chap. 4, pos. 213)

5. Translating *Saudade*

Saudade is a deceptively complicated book to translate, and requires more than just a few readings of the text, if the translator wishes to do justice to its compact and multi-layered narrative. The brief length and the accessible language of the novella might make it easy to read, however these elements do not simplify the work of the translator, who is faced with the responsibility of preserving references, nuances, and linguistic choices found in the ST, and communicating them to its target readership. In order to ‘access’ the layered meanings of such a text, we started the translation process by devoting a certain amount of time to a critical reading of the book. By doing so, we were able to detect and identify linguistic and cultural idiosyncrasies of the text which may need to be reformulated in the Italian translation.

As preliminary research, we began by familiarizing ourselves with the historical and geographical context of the story. We collected all the elements that referred to geographical sites and historical figures related to the movements of Independence of Portuguese Africa, and organized them in two tables. The first table (Tab. 1) displays all the geographical sites mentioned in the text; the story is mainly situated between Angola and Goa, but for the sake of historical accuracy, it is important to look into territories that were once part of the Portuguese colonial dominions and are, today, part of the Post-Colonial project of the so-called Lusophony. The second table (Tab. 2) contains the names of all the historical figures mentioned in the text who took part in the historical events referred in the book:

Geographical Sites	
ANGOLA	PORTUGAL AND <i>ULTRAMAR</i> TERRITORIES
Benguela	Lisboa
Uigé (Province of Angola)	Algarve (Region of Portugal)
Luanda	Coimbra
Baixa de Cassanje (Region of Angola)	Alentejo (Region of Portugal)
Ambriz (Municipality in the Bengo Province)	Cova de Iria (A quarter in the city of Fátima)
	Cabo Delgado (Province of Mozambique)
	Maputo
	Madeira
	Cabo Verde
	São Tomé
	Guiné-Bissau
	Brazil
	Goa

Tab. 1: Geographical sites mentioned in the text

Historical Figures
Captain Henrique Galvão (Portuguese officer, opponent of the Portuguese Estado Novo)
FNLA (Militant organisation and then political party that fought for Angolan Independence. Nationalistic, conservative)
Che Guevara (In the 1960s, Guevara and Castro's Cuba started relationships with Angola in order to bring Marxism–Leninism to Africa)
Agostinho Neto (Leader of the MPLA during the war for Angolan Independence. First president of Angola)
António de Oliveira Salazar (Portuguese statesman, responsible for the Estado Novo regime)
Kaúlza de Oliveira de Arriaga (General and politician in the years of the Estado Novo)
MPLA (Political party that fought for Angolan Independence. Communist, Marxist-Leninist)
Pepetela (Angolan writer and member of the MPLA during the guerrilla war for Angolan independence)
Viriato da Cruz (Angolan poet and member of the MPLA during the guerrilla war for Angolan independence)
António Jacinto (Angolan poet, fought for Angolan independence joining the MPLA in 1973)
Mário Pinto de Andrade (Angolan poet, founder of the MPLA in 1956)
Amílcar Cabral (Leader of the African Party for the Independence of Guinea and Cape Verde (PAIGC), co-founder of the MPLA)
PIDE (Political secret police of the Estado Novo)

Tab. 2: Historical Figures mentioned in the text

The first table helped us schematize space in 'Angola' and 'Portugal and *Ultramar* Territories' (Portugal and its colonial dominations), while the second table helped us visualize and interpret the personalities who took part in the historical events that move the plot forward. With the data collected in Tab. 1 and Tab. 2, we built our archive and began focusing on the linguistic stratification of the text. In order to get an idea of the complex cultural make-up of territories that have suffered long periods of domination we spotted all the foreign words the author inserted in the novella highlighting them in italics. Then, we created a third table (Tab. 3) in which we arranged the foreign words in two columns, Portuguese and Hindi ones.

FOREIGN WORDS	
PORTUGUESE	HINDI
Bruxas	Kohl
Recheado	Karma
Papos de anjo	Sari
Morna	Chole
Beijos	Bindu
Zimbo	Kolhapuris
Mestiça	Mando
Funje	Devanagari
Azulejo	Dekhni
Fidalgos	Cafrail
Frango <i>with</i> piri piri	Sadhus
Pé de moleque	Dhotis
Calulu de peixe	Salwar Kameezes
Musseques	Thalis
Quitaba	Puris
Fado	Beedis
Alferes	Mangalasutra
Kitetas	Mehndi
Saudade	Paise
Umbigada	Kulchi codi
Kifula	
Pão	

Tab. 3: Foreign Words mentioned in the text

Tab. 3 was neither drawn up with the aim of creating a glossary, nor with the intent of studying its content from a terminological point of view. Instead, it was to clearly identify those semantic areas in which the author chose to make 'contamination' more evident in the source text. It turned out Portuguese words were linked, most of all, to the categories of food and music, while Hindi words had stronger links to the semantic areas of clothes, make-up and jewelry and food.

As well as being a consistent part of the preparatory work, the realization of the three tables gave us the opportunity to reflect on the specialized competences a literary translator would need to do justice to a text containing many intercultural and historical references. A translation in which any 'unfamiliar elements' are omitted or domesticated would undermine the theme of incommunicability that permeates colonial contexts, misrepresenting the source text.

6. Translation in practice: focusing on the theme of incommunicability

Following our preliminary work, we chose and translated some excerpts from the novella in order to provide a hypothetical publisher with both a sense of the author's style and the crux of the story. The first excerpt is taken from the beginning of the first chapter of the book. Here the protagonist, who is also the narrator of the story, describes the bond she has with her mother:

Although I was old enough – three years old, perhaps four – I seldom spoke at this time. No one really remarked of this fact nor how I hung off every one of

Anche se ero abbastanza grande – tre anni, forse quattro – in quei giorni parlavo di rado. Nessuno sembrava preoccuparsi realmente di questo né del fatto

my mother's words. Indeed, I could have continued in this same vein for an aeon or more, unaware of the peril of what might lie ahead. That her words could come to have a dangerous sway over me – that they might make me look this way and that, only in vain, only to be met by a darkness which was also unnamable – I could not have conceived, for I was more contented by the fact of her voice than what she had to say. At that time, there were so many things I did not know; my mind and body were like a *tabula rasa* on which much would be written, even if later I might want it all to be erased too... (Chap. 1, pos. 40-46)

che pendeva dalle labbra di mia madre. In effetti, avrei potuto continuare in questo modo per un secolo o più, inconsapevole del rischio che poteva derivarne. Che le parole di mia madre potevano finire per avere un'influenza negativa su di me – che potevano spingermi a guardare in questo o in quel modo, senza alcuno scopo, per poi farmi scontrare con un'oscurità altrettanto indefinibile – non potevo ancora capirlo, perché ero più felice di ascoltare la sua voce piuttosto che quello che diceva. A quel tempo c'erano così tante cose che non conoscevo; la mia mente e il mio corpo erano una *tabula rasa* su cui molto sarebbe stato scritto, anche se poi avrei voluto lo stesso cancellare tutto...

The choice to include this paragraph in the proposal was informed by the idea of presenting *Saudade* as a narrative built around the alternation of voice and silence. It is important to notice that in *Saudade* silence is not always an absence of voice but often comes from the difficulty in making voices meet; that is to establish a communication with the Other. The author tries to convey this idea by portraying a protagonist who hardly speaks in the first years of her life and experiences a constant sense of alienation, even in familiar spaces. The task of the translator, for this paragraph, is to preserve the syntax of the source text, since it conveys the author's style and makes the text look like a 'confession'. Preserving the syntactical structure of source text as much as possible, we managed to convey in Italian the effect of a thought that is gaining shape while it is told. The punctuation remained the same, for example the hyphens of the source text were preserved in the Italian version as they function like pauses that give emphasis to the thoughts of the narrator, just like she was actually 'reflecting with' and 'speaking to' the reader. With respect to the linguistic register, this excerpt is quite peculiar. Here, in fact, the author tends to use a more formal register in comparison with other parts of the book, as it is suggested by the adverb 'seldom' or by the insertion of the Latin expression '*tabula rasa*'. We decided to preserve this vocabulary, but we chose to translate the verbs 'hung off' (pendevo) and 'could come to have' (potevano finire) with the Italian 'indicativo imperfetto' instead of the 'congiuntivo imperfetto' (pendessi e potessero finire) in order to be more coherent with the rest of the text, in which the author uses a more colloquial register.

The second excerpt is probably the one in which the aspect of incommunicability becomes more evident:

She told me to come nap with her but the mosquitoes, humming in the dusky air, kept me awake, so I wandered onto the front porch where it was cooler, waiting for some deathly footsteps, but only the postboy came, whistling a Cape Verdean folk song; it must have been a *morna* of Eugénio Tavares. When he lifted the catch to put the letters in the box he looked up, saw me and laughed. Admittedly I must have been an odd sight: my hair were wet with sweat; my mouth agape. He then started to say something; I could not understand what he was saying because he spoke in Creole. I did not imagine that he was giving voice to a private thought, derisive or mocking, one that he in any case did not care to share with me; I was happy to hear him speaking, to hear this other voice with its unusual cadences...

Mamma mi aveva detto di fare un pisolino con lei ma le zanzare, che ronzavano nell'aria umida, mi tenevano sveglia, perciò camminai fino al portico anteriore dove faceva più fresco, aspettando di sentire dei passi mortali, ma venne solo il postino, fischiettando un motivo folk capoverdiano; doveva essere una *morna* di Eugénio Tavares. Quando sollevò lo sportello per mettere le lettere nella cassetta alzò lo sguardo, mi vide e rise. A essere onesta dovevo proprio essere una brutta visione: i capelli madidi di sudore; la bocca spalancata. In quel momento prese a dire qualcosa; non riuscivo a capire cosa stesse dicendo perché parlava in creolo. Non immaginavo stesse dando voce a un pensiero privato, derisorio o di scherno, un pensiero che in ogni caso non si era curato di condividere con me; ero felice

One of Ifigênia's friends, Philomena, whom she called Memu, came by; I could hear them talking in lowered voices in Kimbundu. Ifigênia had been told to speak Portuguese in my company but she often forgot and spoke Kimbundu anyway. Though I could understand only a smattering, I found Kimbundu, with its spirited rhythms, beautiful. And if it did not occur to me that they may have been talking about me, this was less because of humility than because it had not yet dawned on me that Kimbundu might be the language, as I might be the source, of some of their complaints and grievances. When this became evident I might find Kimbundu a cacophony, at the first sound of which I would reach for pliable beeswax to stop up my ears! (Chap. 2, pos. 117-131)

di ascoltarlo parlare, di ascoltare questa voce altra con le sue cadenze inusuali...

Arrivò una delle amiche di Ifigênia, Philomena, che lei chiamava Memu; riuscivo a sentirle mentre parlavano in kimbundu a bassa voce. A Ifigênia era stato detto di parlare in portoghese in mia presenza, ma spesso se ne dimenticava e parlava lo stesso in kimbundu. Sebbene riuscissi a comprenderne solo un po', trovavo bello il kimbundu, con il suo ritmo vivace. E se non mi era venuto in mente che loro potessero star parlando di me, non era tanto per una questione di umiltà ma perché non avevo mai pensato che il kimbundu poteva essere la lingua, così come io potevo essere la fonte, di alcune delle loro lagnanze e lamentele. Quando questo diventò evidente cominciai a trovare cacofonico il kimbundu, tanto che al primo suono mi mettevo a cercare della cera d'api per tapparmi le orecchie.

The excerpt is taken from the second chapter of the book, after one of the protagonist's neighbours is violently killed during the rise of independence turmoils. It is also the first time in the book in which the narrator reflects upon the co-existence, in her world, of several languages which correspond to just as many codes people use to interact or to exclude other people from their interactions. To approach the translation of this excerpt, it was useful to make a distinction between the languages of the story, that is the languages in which the characters of the story speak (Portuguese, Konkani, Kimbundu, Cape Verdean Creole, Hindi, Mahrati) and the language of the narration, that is the language in which the author writes the story (English). In fact, even if the excerpt is neither complex from a syntactic point of view, nor difficult to reproduce into Italian in terms of vocabulary and register, it is certainly a key passage for the description of the linguistic situation in Portuguese Angola. We inverted the order adjective/noun to translate the English expression 'this other voice' so to drive the attention of the Italian reader to the ideas of otherness and estrangement, while reading 'questa voce altra' (that in Italian stresses the idea of 'Otherness') instead of 'quest'altra voce' (which in Italian means just 'another voice'). Here English is not just the language in which the story is told, it's the space in which the writer shows how the subaltern speaks and how the language s/he speaks is a form of resistance to colonization. Thus, we had to find a way to translate from English all the colonial voices to which the author tries to give visibility. In order to do so, we reproduced in the Italian translation all the repetitions of the word 'kimbundu' (five times in five clauses) because by repeating these words, the writer emphasizes the presence of an alien language that intrudes on the 'official' one, even if the reader cannot experience it directly, confronting with Kimbundu words. Last but not least, in our third example, the languages of the story and the language of the narration do not meet only metaphorically, but actually clash within the narration:

Like most things about this new country, this *terra incognita* which I hesitate to call home, it came to me only later, after much bewilderment and angst. Other women moved about me: their *saris* and *salwar kameezes* rustling, their anklets and bangles tinkling like bells. They gawped and smiled and their presence was at once intimidating and comforting as, assuming I understood, they rapidly fired off conversation in Hindi or Mahrati. Out of pity for my incomprehension or my poor appetite or perhaps my being alone, they

Come molte delle cose di questo nuovo Paese, questa *terra incognita* che stento a chiamare casa, ci sono arrivata solo in seguito, dopo molta perplessità e angoscia. Altre donne si muovevano intorno a me: con i loro *sari* e i *salwar kameez* fruscianti, le cavigliere e i bracciali tintinnanti come campane. Mi fissavano e sorridevano e la loro presenza era allo stesso tempo intimidatoria e confortante mentre, dando per scontato che io capissi, conversavano speditamente in Hindi o Marhati. Mosse a compassione dalla mia incapacità di

offered me sweets from their *thalis*; I took them but they were sickly, saturated with ghee. Eventually I learnt some words – to ask for water, to ask for fruit, to ask what day it was... Time seemed to slow or to have halted. They asked me my name and I lied. Masquerading, I said, My name is Saudade, and, to my surprise, no one unmasked me. I was so lonely yet not at all alone – a paradox I thought of while taking the last of the *puris* out to feed the birds on the balcony. From here I would watch the huge dusty crows vying for crumbs with the small, undaunted sparrows. A few fair-skinned women were here too; they were hippies, I discerned from their dreadlocks. They kept to themselves and were often to be found asleep in the old, bowed cane chairs or sleepwalking, barefoot, to bum *beedis* from the wardens. The acrid smoke would drift in with all the other strong smells: frying food, incense and factory emissions – and the alien noises: the call to prayer, a cricket bat thwacking a ball and children running and laughing... Later, when I was let out, I played games of rummy and draughts with a few of these children. They showed me the rules and I observed them closely, like a spy deciphering a code. One girl my age called Mira befriended me; she told me she was coming home from the Gulf where she had been sent to see her husband. She was so young I did not believe she was already married, but she showed me the proofs by way of her *mangalasutra* and the intricate but faded designs of the *mehndi* on her hands. (Cap 11, pos. 768-783)

comprenderle o dal mio scarso appetito o forse dal fatto che ero sola, mi offrivano dolci dal loro *thali*; io li prendevo ma erano stucchevoli, pieni di ghi. Dopo un po' imparai alcune parole: a chiedere dell'acqua, a chiedere della frutta, a chiedere che giorno era... Sembrava che il tempo avesse rallentato o si fosse fermato. Mi chiedevano il mio nome e io mentivo. Fingendo, dicevo, Mi chiamo Saudade, e con mio stupore, nessuno se ne accorgeva. Ero sola eppure non lo ero per niente, un paradosso pensai mentre prendevo l'ultimo dei *puri* per dar da mangiare agli uccelli sul balcone.

Da lì si vedevano gli enormi corvi grigi lottare per le briciole con i piccoli, impassibili passerai. C'erano anche alcune donne dalla pelle chiara; erano delle hippie, lo capivo dai loro dreadlock. Se ne stavano sulle loro e spesso le si trovava addormentate sulle vecchie sedie di bambù piegate o mentre camminavano nel sonno, a piedi nudi, o mentre scroccavano *beedi* ai guardiani. Il fumo acre si mischiava con tutti gli altri odori forti: cibo fritto, incenso e fumi delle fabbriche – e con i rumori estranei: la chiamata alla preghiera, una mazza da cricket che colpiva una palla, e bambini che correvano e ridevano... Più tardi, quando mi è stato permesso, ho giocato a ramino e a dama con alcuni di quei bambini. Loro mi mostravano le regole e io li osservavo da vicino, come una spia che sta decifrando un codice. Una ragazza della mia età di nome Mira diventò mia amica; mi disse che stava tornando a casa dal Golfo dove era stata per vedere suo marito. Era così giovane che non credevo fosse già sposata, ma lei me ne mostrò le prove col suo *mangalasutra* e con i disegni del *mehndi* intricati ma sbiaditi sulle mani.

In this excerpt, taken from the last chapter of the book, when the protagonist is sent to Goa to stay with her grandparents because of the rise of the guerrilla war in Angola, the insertion of foreign words into the English text, stressed by the use of italics, represents a violent 'intrusion' of one of the languages of the story upon the language of the narration. In this case, the difficulty for an Italian translator stands in deciding between the possibility to let Italian 'host' the foreign words without further explanations (as the author does in the source text), and to provide an explanation of the terms, for example through the creation of a glossary. We opted to keep the Hindi words untranslated and unexplained since they contribute to the sense of linguistic and cultural bewilderment experienced by the protagonist of the story, who finds herself immersed in the language and the culture of her ancestors without being able to communicate. That language and that culture are her legacy, and yet she is unable to relate to it.

7. Conclusions

To conclude, we would like to offer a few thoughts on the title of the book: *Saudade*. A title is the first thing translators are confronted with, as readers, and, usually, the last word(s) to be translated (in consultation with the publisher). It may be probably known '*saudade*' is a Portuguese, untranslatable

word which recalls an idea of nostalgia and homesickness and does not really have an 'equivalent' in other languages and cultures. What an average reader may not know is that a great part of the Portuguese colonial rhetoric was based on the so-called 'myth of the *saudade*'.

In one of his best known works, entitled *O Labirinto da Saudade: Psicanálise mítica do destino português*,²¹ the Portuguese philosopher Eduardo Lourenço explains how the experience of colonization was for the Portuguese colonial regime a desperate attempt to recuperate a glorious past of discoveries in order to build a national narrative that could take Portugal out of its position of marginality on the world stage. Even after the end of their colonial empire, in fact, the celebration of the achievements of national icons like Vasco da Gama and Luís Vaz de Camões kept the Portuguese people stuck into the idea that they were the 'elected people', capable of building an empire extending from Portugal to the Far East, as long as this prevented them from looking back at the disastrous colonial project they had undertaken and failed in. With basis in Lourenço's work, we found in the title the link among the various levels of language detected in the book; that is to say it helps recollecting and connecting the story of several peoples and nations to the narrations of a fictional character, and, at the same time, it maintains its emotional charge in spite of translation and cultural shifts, and helps reframing into Italian a 'not-so-known' narrative of colonization.

Thus, in Suneeta Peres da Costa's book, *saudade* means much more than just nostalgia, it is the place in which the languages of the story (Hindi, Konkani, Kimbundu, Portuguese, Cape Verdean Creole, Mahrati), the language of the narration (English) and the language of the translation (Italian) ideally meet. These last observations convinced us of the necessity, for a text like *Saudade*, to be submitted for translation with a thorough paratextual apparatus, contemplating a preface and a translator's note as we suggested at the beginning.

On the one hand a preface would be the space in which the translator could locate the text in a specific socio-historical moment, providing the reader with the right means to grasp all the intertextual and extratextual references present in the book. On the other hand, a translator's note could be a way to explain some of the choices made showing how the process of translation is not the result of a neutral linguistic transfer but a never-ending interaction which can reshape non-neutral narratives like colonial ones by recuperating and disseminating subaltern, marginal voices/narratives of coloniality.

Saudade is a literary text which crosses over, being full of terminology from different domains like history, politics, geography, and cultural-bound words from different languages which visualize the hybridity of the Angolan context, for this reason its translation can only be possible after having acquired all the specific competences a text like this demands. In our article we included only few of the many examples that could have been proposed as examples of the translation process and we are aware that our translation of the entire text is just one possibility among many. Nonetheless, we believe that this proposal can open up a discussion on a young transnational author who is representative of new literary voices emerging in countries that carry post-colonial legacies whose works are broadening and redefining the concept of Post-Colonial itself.

²¹ Eduardo Lourenço, *O labirinto da saudade. Psicanálise mítica do destino português*, Fourth Edition (Alfragide: Dom Quixote, 1991).

Gender and Linguistic Sexism in Elisabetta Cametti's *I guardiani della Storia* and Its Translation into English and Spanish

Abstract: Language is one of the strongest and most valuable tools that is within our reach and that allows us to communicate in society. However, through both written and spoken language, a certain gender inequality can usually be perceived. Nonetheless, there are some considerable differences depending on the languages. While Spanish and Italian are rooted in a patriarchal society, English seems to be more neutral when it comes to gender. Some nouns used to designate professions clearly represent the best examples of sexist language and dictionaries are a fair reflection of this. In order to deepen the topic from a gender translation perspective, this work will analyze some of the jobs that appear throughout the novel *I guardiani della Storia*, written by the Italian author Elisabetta Cametti, and its translation into Spanish (by Claudia Conde) and into English (by Scott P. Sheridan). Therefore, this analysis will present a study of the differences among the three languages regarding linguistic sexism as well as examine how gender issues can influence the reception of the translated texts.

Keywords: *Elisabetta Cametti, gender inequality, jobs and professions, linguistic sexism*

The elimination of sexist language is a necessary condition for eliminating sexism in any society.
Sara Shute, *Sexist Language and Sexism*¹

1. Introduction

It is commonly known that language is one of the strongest, most precious and useful tools that are within our reach and that allows us to communicate in society. Nonetheless, through both written and spoken language, a certain gender bias can usually be perceived. Such inequality may vary depending on different cultural and social factors.

Spanish and Italian societies present a long tradition based on dominance and submission and, consequently, their respective languages are influenced by strong androcentrism² characterized by a noticeable masculine perspective. Some nouns used to designate jobs and professions clearly represent examples of sexist language and dictionaries are a fair reflection of this. This is largely due to the almost non-existent role of women in the labor market until the 20th century:

Fino a metà del secolo scorso Stati e Chiese hanno riservato alla donna il compito esclusivo di essere sposa e madre. Le professioni più qualificate le erano escluse e questo spiega perché le posizioni che erano riservate all'uomo hanno creato termini solamente di genere maschile (come 'dottore', 'medico', 'chirurgo', 'giudice', 'sindaco', 'assessore').³

¹ Sara Shute, "Sexist Language and Sexism", in Mary Vetterling-Bruggin, ed., *Sexist Language: A Modern Philosophical Analysis* (Totowa: Littlefield, Adams & Co, 1981).

² According to Calero Fernández, androcentrism assumes that the measure of all things is taken from men and that, if women are taken into consideration, they are always treated as a deviation or separation from the standard, built on masculine patterns. Androcentrism leads to the underestimation and even concealment of the feminine; but it can also be accompanied by a misogynistic component. M^a Ángeles Calero Fernández, *Sexismo lingüístico. Análisis y propuestas ante la discriminación sexual en el lenguaje* (Madrid: Narcea Ediciones, 1999), 9.

³ Until the middle of the last century, being a wife or a mother were the only roles that States and Churches attributed to women. They were excluded from the most qualified professions and, as a result, the positions that were reserved for men have created

For centuries, it was a widespread notion that men were superior to women. Women have been considered lesser beings due to their physical nature. Traditional philosophers such as Rousseau, Diderot or Voltaire promulgated negative and harmful arguments against women in order to exclude them from the political, social and economic order. Based on such discrimination, patriarchy's power has predominated, placing the figure of the woman as dependent and submissive to the authority of a man, whether it is the father, the husband or any other male relative. Therefore, the role that the community has assigned to women has been none other than that of being mothers and wives and that of caring for sick relatives – whether they are children, parents or other family members – unable to benefit from any kind of privilege or right.

According to the feminist linguist Deborah Cameron, feminist theory has inevitably analysed the differences between women and men paying particular attention to the sexual division of labor:

Present to some degree in all known societies, in which some tasks are women's and others are men's. Men's work is economically and socially valued; women's usually is not. (The societies which most closely approach sexual equality seem to be those in which women control their own production, and men need the things they produce). Some feminists have looked particularly at women's obligation to do domestic work and childcare, suggesting that mothering, apart from its role in restricting women economically, may have consequences for the psychology of women and their children, reproducing the cycle whereby women mother and men do not.⁴

It is worth noting that the topic of sexism in language is probably the best known of all feminist linguistic concerns. Sexist language in nouns used to designate professions is inextricably linked to women's discrimination in the workplace and, as a result, there are different occupations associated to each gender (which are not interchangeable). Their subordinate role forces women into a marginalized and subservient position in all fields. All this has been discussed by M^a Ángeles Calero Fernández (1999) in her work *Sexismo Lingüístico*:

El rol social que se ha asignado tradicionalmente a la mujer es el de esposa y madre, lo que supone el cuidado del hogar y de la familia. Su formación iba destinada al buen cumplimiento de la función que le había correspondido dentro de la sociedad, de modo que no podía acceder a ningún trabajo cualificado como no tuviera que ver con las enseñanzas que había venido recibiendo. Esas enseñanzas reducían el abanico de posibilidades laborales a lo propio de la actividad doméstica: bordar, coser, servir, lavar, ocuparse de los niños y de los enfermos, cocinar, planchar. Estos oficios, al formar parte del universo femenino – juzgado como inferior –, quedaron estigmatizados, y fueron excluidos de la dinámica laboral de los varones.⁵

Calero Fernández proposes the following case: the definition of the word *criar* ('to raise') according to the *Diccionario de la Real Academia de la Lengua Española*:

'*Criar*': Nutrir o alimentar la madre o la nodriza al niño con la leche de sus pechos, o con biberón' (DRAE, 1992). Esta definición deja por sentado que un padre no se ocupa de criar a su hijo/a porque no lo nombra como individuo que pueda encargarse de ello. Bien es cierto que un varón no puede amamantar, pero sí que

terms only for masculine gender. Sergio Lepri, "Lepri. Le scorrettezze (culturali) del linguaggio", *Giulia Giornaliste* <http://giulia.globalist.it/attualita/articolo/2017/07/11/lepri-le-scorrettezze-culturali-del-linguaggio-2004659.html> (2013). In English the neutral form prevents this situation. Translation by the author.

⁴ Deborah Cameron, *Feminism and Linguistic Theory*, Second Edition (Hong Kong: Macmillan Press LTD, 1992), 5.

⁵ The social role that has traditionally been assigned to women is that of wife and mother, which involves the care of the home and the family. Their education was destined to the proper fulfillment of their role within society and, as a result, they could not access any qualified job as it did not correspond to the education they received. Thus, the range of job possibilities was reduced to domestic activity itself: embroider, sew, serve, wash, take care of children and the sick, cook, iron. These trades, being part of the female universe – considered as inferior – were stigmatized and excluded from male labor dynamics. Calero Fernández, *Sexismo Lingüístico*, 109. Translation by the author.

puede preparar y dar un biberón. Como se observará, la redacción es obsoleta y, a través de ella, se les ve el plumero a los académicos.⁶

Surprisingly, if we carry out the same search almost two decades later, we notice that the definition of the term *criar* offered nowadays by the RAE⁷ remains exactly the same. The Spanish language is commonly characterized by sexist prejudices which constitute the result of the role that women have been expected to adopt for centuries. Nowadays, Spanish and Italian languages continue to transmit messages that reinforce women's traditional status and ideas that preserve their subordination in speech. However, as Deborah Tannen notices, such cultural and rooted traditional model adopted by society must change: "Lo que hace falta para realizar cambios es la comprensión de los modelos de conducta humana tal como existen hoy en día, una apreciación de la complejidad de estos modelos y un respeto humano por los otros seres humanos".⁸

2. Dictionaries as a non-neutral tool

Throughout industrialization, women were gradually incorporated into the workplace but, evidently, without obtaining the same rights and working conditions as their male colleagues. Women had neither the opportunity to occupy certain social positions nor to take leadership roles and, therefore, in the case of Spanish language, nouns such as *la ministra*, *la alcaldesa* o *la jueza*⁹ were only used to refer to the minister's, mayor's or judge's wife. Even today, in some of the DRAE¹⁰ entries which contain both genders, the feminine is defined according to the masculine – as a colloquial use – 'wife of...' or 'woman who held the position of...'. This is another example of male dominance and supremacy throughout history. While men have been placed at the core of the entire working world because they are seen as superior beings, women are perceived as dependent on men, submissive and easier to mould.

Thus, despite being an exceptional tool – both from the lexical and cultural point of view – dictionaries are not neutral resources in that a strong ideological interference in lexicographical compilations can be clearly perceived. Another example of this can be found in the analysis carried out by Aurora Marco López.¹¹ Her analysis focuses on the study of how gender difference in the field of professions and positions is presented according to the DRAE.¹²

Among the slogans outlined by the author in her work and registered exclusively using feminine word endings, most of the cases have already found the masculine connotation as can be observed in the following terms collected in the DRAE:¹³ "aeromoza", "azafato,ta", "comadrón,na" o "costurero,ra".

⁶ Ibid., 96. According to the DRAE (1992), 'To raise' means the action of nourishing or feeding the child by the mother or the wet nurse with the milk of their breasts or a feeding bottle. In the words of Calero Fernández, this definition assumes that a father does not raise his child in that he is not mentioned as an individual who can handle this situation. It is true that a man cannot breastfeed, but he absolutely can prepare and give a baby bottle. As it will be observed, the writing is obsolete and, through it, one can unearth what the academics are implying.

⁷ Real Academia Española.

⁸ "What is needed to make changes is the comprehension of the human behavior models as they exist nowadays, an appreciation of the complexity of these models and a demonstration of respect amongst humans". Deborah Tannen, *Género y discurso*, (Barcelona: Paidós, 1996), 25. Translation by the author.

⁹ 'minister (f)', 'mayoress' or 'judge (f)'.

¹⁰ *Diccionario de la lengua Española* - Real Academia de la Lengua Española. Edición del Tricentenario. Actualización 2017, <http://dle.rae.es/?id=DglqVCc>, accessed 14 March 2018.

¹¹ Aurora Marco López, "Lenguaje, sexismo y educación", in M^a Isabel Sancho Rodríguez et al., eds., *Lengua, literatura y mujer* (Jaén: Universidad de Jaén, 2003).

¹² *Diccionario escolar de la Real Academia Española*, 1998.

¹³ Both dictionaries DRAE and DRAE have been compared. As Marco López points out, the DRAE edition analyzed is a reduced version of the *Diccionario de la lengua española de la Real Academia* (hereinafter called DRAE). Marco López, "Lenguaje, sexismo y educación", 20.

Nevertheless, many other terms proposed by Marco López, such as “carabina” or “chacha”,¹⁴ continue to hold the only feminine mark.

Regarding the Italian language, it is necessary to highlight the case of the terms *casalingo/casalinga* in order to reaffirm the fact that there seem to be appropriate professions for each sex which do not seem to be interchangeable. By consulting the *Treccani*¹⁵ we find the following definitions:

Casalingo *agg.* 1. Di casa, domestico, familiare. 2. Per la casa, per gli usi domestici: *oggetti c.*; anche sostantivato al plur.: *negozio di casalinghi*.

Casalinga *s.f.* 1. Donna che attende in casa propria alle faccende domestiche e non ha altra professione. 2. Lo stesso che *casalina*.¹⁶

As it can be observed, the only term that designates the profession of a person who carries out the household tasks is exclusively feminine. Consequently, does this mean a man cannot take charge of the house and devote himself solely to domestic chores? Once again, through a didactic tool such as the dictionary, endowed with a strong cultural and ideological burden, an unavoidable androcentric and patriarchal society is reaffirmed.

Fortunately, throughout the last decades, women have fought for absolute incorporation and integration into the labor market, becoming the main protagonists. Little by little, and especially from the second half of the 20th century, women have occupied traditional male environments thanks to their emancipation and autonomy as well as to their ongoing struggle for equality among men and women. Due to this constant and complicated battle, in which women have come up against major obstacles in the male-dominated labor market, nowadays we can refer to *la jueza* not as the judge's wife but as the woman who has authority and power to judge and sentence.¹⁷

Thus, social transformation reflects the change of women's role which is shown in the use of language regarding professions and trades: “al mismo tiempo que la sociedad va evolucionando hacia un modelo más igualitario, el lenguaje puede contribuir en gran medida a esta mudanza, haciéndonos visibles, porque queremos nombrar y ser nombradas desde nosotras mismas”.¹⁸

By comparing Italian and Spanish, it could be said that language gender inequality within the field of professions is even more palpable in Italian. Within the Spanish language, every time the use of feminine terms such as *abogada*, *ministra*, *jueza* or *médica* to refer to the woman who exercises each of these jobs is becoming more common.¹⁹ Even new terms have been invented such as *presidenta* which has been established by the RAE, in order to indicate the female gender of *presidente*.

In the case of the Italian language, due to various social, economic and cultural changes in recent years, there has been a growing need to create the feminine form of those professions that in the past were only reserved for men such as *il professore/la professoressa* (‘the male/female teacher’):

¹⁴ The male term *chacho* is also accepted by the DRAE (2017 edition) but with a very different meaning: *muchacho*, ‘boy’. However, the word *chacha*, exclusively feminine, is a synonym of ‘maid’, ‘babysitter’ with a somewhat negative and derogatory connotation.

¹⁵ *Treccani, l'enciclopedia italiana di scienze, lettere ed arti*. “Casalingo”, “Casalinga”, <http://www.treccani.it/vocabolario/casalingo/>, accessed 20 April 2018.

¹⁶ The masculine adjective *casalingo* is described as a synonym of homely, domestic, family. On the other hand, the feminine noun *casalinga* refers to a woman who does housework, as a synonym of ‘housewife’.

¹⁷ “jueza: la persona que tiene autoridad y potestad para juzgar y condenar”, DRAE (2017).

¹⁸ At the same time that society evolves towards a more egalitarian model, language can contribute to a large extent to this change, making us visible, because we want to name and be named from ourselves. Marco López, “Lenguaje, sexismo y educación”, 14, translation by the author.

¹⁹ Although the use of feminine professions is becoming more frequent, DRAE still holds the meaning of some terms such as *médica*, *jueza*, *ministra*, etc., as ‘the woman of’ (in a colloquial and disused sense).

Con l'ingresso della donna in alcune professioni certe potenzialità grammaticali hanno aiutato, nel passato, la soluzione del problema: col suffisso 'essa' ('professoressa', 'dottorressa'), col facile femminile della parola che è un participio passato (come 'deputata') o delle parole col finale 'era' ('infermiera', 'consigliera', 'bersagliera').²⁰

Nonetheless, there are many other cases in which professions that indicate a certain prestige or a high social status maintain the masculine invariable form. For this reason, although it is possible to use words such as *ingegnera*, *ministra*, *medica* or *soldata*, people usually decide to maintain the masculine form followed by the name and surname of the woman who exercises such profession: *l'ingegnere Giulia Verdi*, *il soldato Carla Tancredi*, *il ministro Tina Anselmi*. A second option is to add the word *donna* before or after the profession: *la donna soldato*, *il ministro donna*.

In Spanish, a similar situation can be found: one of the possible options of partial feminization consists of keeping the masculine name of the profession followed by the noun 'woman': *una mujer soldado*, *una mujer fiscal*.

In conclusion, language is a constantly changing tool that must be adapted to different social, economic and cultural changes. Any argument concerning linguistic sexism, the feminization of terms, the elimination of the generic masculine, etc., generates an inexorable atmosphere of controversy and debate. As a result, the translation of any type of text that includes words referring to professions in both genders will be a task of great complexity and diligence.

3. Elisabetta Cametti's *I guardiani della Storia*²¹ analysis

In order to deepen the argument from an applied discourse-analytical perspective, the different jobs appearing throughout Elisabetta Cametti's novel *I guardiani della Storia*²² will be analyzed. In order to have a large comparative framework, the analysis is based on a comparison between the translated Spanish²³ and English²⁴ versions and the official version in Italian. When it comes to translate words relating to jobs and professions from Italian – a language which is characterized by grammatical gender – into English – a language defined by a neutral gender – great difficulties are not expected, yet as Cameron notes, "the lexicon and grammatical system of English [also] contains features that exclude, insult and trivialize women".²⁵ On the other hand, particular attention will be given to the Spanish translation since it is a gendered language and more difficulties in translation may arise.

The profession that the Piedmontese writer Elisabetta Cametti bestows to the protagonist of her first novel represents a case of linguistic sexism. Katherine Sinclair is "direttore generale della 9Sense Publishing"²⁶ one of the most powerful global publishers located in London. Even though the word *direttrice* actually exists in Italian, the author has opted for the use of the generic masculine to refer to the profession exercised by the protagonist and which will be discussed throughout the entire novel. However, in the case of the Spanish version, the translator Claudia Conde preferred to use the feminine form of the word, that is, *directora*. Regarding the English translation, the term 'general manager' is

²⁰ Lepri points out the different ways of forming feminine words in Italian arising from the inclusion of women in certain professions. Those words can be formed by the use of suffixes such as '-essa' or '-era' as well as by the use of a feminine past participle as, for example, 'deputata'. Sergio Lepri, "Il femminile dei nomi che indicano cariche e professioni", <http://www.sergiolepri.it/il-femminile-dei-nomi-che-indicano-cariche-e-professioni/>, accessed 12 March 2020.

²¹ Elisabetta Cametti, *I guardiani della Storia* (Firenze and Milano: Giunti Editore, 2013).

²² *The Guardians of History* is a thriller full of intrigue and suspense. The story revolves around Katherine, a strong and determined woman who tries to solve an archaeological mystery by revealing innumerable secrets long buried by history.

²³ Elisabetta Cametti, *Los guardianes de la Historia* [2013], trans. by Claudia Conde (Barcelona: Editorial Planeta, 2015).

²⁴ Elisabetta Cametti, *The Guardians of History* [2013], trans. by Scott P. Sheridan (Seattle: Amazoncrossing, 2015).

²⁵ Cameron, *Feminism and Linguistic Theory*, 101.

²⁶ "General manager of 9Sense Publishing".

generally used. It is not easy to define the practice of translation, but it can be determined by the identity of the translator and this, in turn, can be partially detected from his/her strategies.

As is commonly thought by part of society, feminizing nouns referring to professions decreases the prestige of that particular occupation. Maybe for this reason, Elisabetta Cametti has decided to maintain the masculine form of *direttore*, with a view to maintain the prestige of the working position played by the protagonist in her job. Katherine’s role in her company is not simple at all: because she is a woman she must deal with many obstacles, one of them being the definitive dismissal from her job. On several occasions throughout the novel, references are made to the gender discrimination that often bursts into the workplace.

After analyzing the translation of the different professions that appear throughout the original novel, it is interesting to note the presence of some foreign words such as *manager* or *art director*. As indicated in Zanichelli’s web section *Aula di Lingue*,²⁷ “i nomi invariabili di origine straniera possono essere femminili, si dirà perciò: la manager, la leader, la designer, ecc”.²⁸

Nonetheless, in another case, the author Elisabetta Cametti again decides to use the masculine form to allude to one of her female characters as *un art director*. On the contrary, once again, the Spanish translator has opted to use a noun followed by an adjective that implies female gender: *una directora artística*.

Practical analysis I

Original version (IT)	(SP)	(EN)
direttore generale	directora	general manager
un art director	una directora artística	-

3.1. The term ‘manager’

The English word ‘manager’ is used several times by different characters and, as a consequence, different translations of this term have been offered in Spanish. Three examples – and their corresponding translation into Spanish – in which several characters use the word ‘manager’ to refer to Katherine are shown below:

1. Jethro addresses Katherine: “Voleva avere maggiori informazioni sulla tua relazione con Bruce. Ma io non ho potuto dargli grande soddisfazione: gli ho detto che era la prima volta che ti incontravo. E che, per quello che ho potuto notare, sei un manager di altissimo livello e di raro valore”.²⁹

“Quería más información sobre tu relación con Bruce. Pero yo no he podido satisfacer su curiosidad. Le he dicho que era la primera vez que te veía y que, por lo que he podido averiguar, eres una directiva de altísimo nivel y de enorme valor”.³⁰

²⁷ Zanichelli, “Le professioni”, *Aula di Lingue*, <http://aulalingue.scuola.zanichelli.it/benvenuti/2012/06/21/le-professioni/#comment-14061>, accessed 7 June 2018.

²⁸ In Italian, the invariable nouns of foreign origin can be feminine so the feminine article + the foreign word can be perfectly used.

²⁹ Cametti, *I guardiani*, 105. In the English version the term ‘manager’ is not used. The translator has chosen other strategies. A translation of this quote is: “He wanted to know more about your relationship with Bruce. But I told him that was the first time we had met. And that, from what I could see, you were quite a rare asset to 9Sense”. Cametti, *The Guardians*, 49.

³⁰ Cametti, *Los guardianes*, 95.

2. Lia, a worker of Katherine's company, affirms: "Siamo il team della donna manager³¹ che gli ha cagato in testa e che gli ha rifiutato il lavoro: ci segherà a uno a uno".³²
 "Somos el equipo de la ejecutiva que se rio en su cara y le negó un trabajo".³³
3. Katherine says: "Ed è questo il punto. Io non sono un 'manager da procedure standard' [...] Io sono il manager che ha segnato il cambiamento. Che ha portato l'azienda ai massimi storici".³⁴
 "Ahí precisamente está el problema. A mí no se me pueden aplicar procedimientos estándar, porque yo no soy una directiva estándar. ... Soy la persona que ha marcado y dirigido su gran transformación, la que ha llevado a la empresa a sus máximos históricos".³⁵

Practical analysis II

Original version (IT)	(SP)	(EN)
un manager	una directiva	quite a rare asset
donna manager	la ejecutiva	the woman manager
un 'manager	una directiva	-

As it can be observed in the three aforementioned examples, the translation of the word 'manager' varies depending on each case. Firstly, *un manager* has been translated as *una directiva*.³⁶ Secondly, the Italian author has decided to add the word *donna*. However, if we pay attention to the translation into Spanish, there are no traces of the word *mujer* since in Spanish it is much more appropriate to use a feminine noun as is the case of *ejecutiva*, 'executive'. Thirdly, we face two different cases. On the one hand, *manager* has been translated again as *directiva*; on the other hand, the term has been translated according to the following definition: "la persona que ha marcado y dirigido su gran transformación".

Once again, the term 'manager' has not undergone a feminization process since the author continues using the definite and indefinite masculine article.

3.2. The term 'avvocato'

The use of the term *avvocato* to refer to a woman who practices law is another case of linguistic sexism. The Italian term *avvocato* possesses two different feminine forms which represent different meanings or connotations: *avvocata* and *avvocatessa*:

La prima è di uso non comune, e per lo più ironico o scherzoso, con riferimento a donna che eserciti l'avvocatura ... La seconda forma, *avvocatessa*, è, invece, largamente usata per indicare, senza particolari connotazioni di registro, sia la donna che eserciti l'avvocatura sia la moglie dell'avvocato; può acquistare, diversamente, una sfumatura scherzosa quando sia riferita a donna dalla parlantina sciolta, risoluta nel sostenere le ragioni proprie o altrui.³⁷

³¹ Lia pretends to say that she belongs to the team of Katherine, 'the woman manager'.

³² Cametti, *I guardiani*, 175.

³³ Cametti, *Los guardianes*, 160.

³⁴ Cametti, *I guardiani*, 183.

³⁵ Cametti, *Los guardianes*, 168. Once again, in the English version the word 'manager' does not appear: "That's exactly my point. I deserve more than standard procedures. I've dedicated my life to this company and led it through a meteoric rise". Ibid., 89.

³⁶ Female senior manager.

³⁷ According to Denoto, the first meaning *avvocata* is of uncommon use, and mostly ironic or joking, with reference to a woman who practices law. The second sense, *avvocatessa*, is widely used to indicate – without particular register connotations – both the woman who practices law and the lawyer's wife. Otherwise it can also acquire a humorous tone when referring to a really talkative woman. Paolo Denoto, "Qual è il femminile di avvocato?", *Treccani, l'enciclopedia italiana di scienze, lettere ed arti*.

To all this, Paolo Denoto adds that, within legal language, it is commonly preferred the use of the masculine form ending in -o, especially in some phrases such as *avvocato fiscale* or *avvocato d’ufficio*,³⁸ to refer indistinctly to a man or a woman. In Spanish, the feminine form *abogada* is accepted by the RAE even in phrases such as *abogada de oficio*, *abogada del Estado*, *abogada fiscal* o *abogada general*.³⁹

Nevertheless, taking up Cametti’s novel, the author has decided not to feminize this term whereas the Spanish and English translator preferred to omit it:⁴⁰ “‘L’avvocato è in riunione in questo momento’. ‘Ho bisogno di parlarle subito. È molto importante’”.⁴¹ “‘En este momento la señora Bron está reunida’. ‘Tengo que hablar con ella enseguida. Es muy importante’”.⁴²

Practical analysis III

Original version (IT)	(SP)	(EN)
L’avvocato	la señora Bron	-

Even though in Spanish the use of the feminine term *abogada* is more common, other alternatives are also preferred. Indeed, the use of the generic masculine is still imposed as Almeida Suárez⁴³ shows in the following example of a job advertisement: “Se necesita abogado. Los interesados pónganse en contacto con la empresa llamando al número que se indica al lado”. In order to avoid the generic masculine (*los interesados*; *abogado*) the author raises the following alternative: “Se necesita abogada o abogado. Las personas interesadas pónganse en contacto con la empresa llamando al número que se indica al lado”.⁴⁴

Going back to the case of the Italian language, the alternative I suggest to Almeida Suárez’s example would be “Cercasi avvocato o avvocat”.⁴⁵ Nonetheless, after performing a quick online search, it can be observed how all web pages offering a job as a lawyer only refer to the male gender: *Cercasi Avvocato collaboratore*, *Funzionario avvocato cercasi*, *Avvocati cercasi*, etc. Thus, the unquestionable disuse of the term *avvocata* in Italian confirms Denoto’s contribution as well as Cametti’s decision in that, once more, the Italian author uses a masculine term to refer to one of her female characters.

Furthermore, through this last example drawn from Cametti’s work, it can be perceived how the use of masculine nouns designating professions can easily lead to different cases of ambiguity. If we only read: “L’avvocato è in riunione in questo momento”,⁴⁶ the reader can freely interpret the gender of the character. We must continue reading in order to verify that, indeed, it refers to a female lawyer, thanks to the use of the indirect pronoun: “Ho bisogno di parlarle subito”. Thus, as Uwe Kjaer Nissen notes, “When a language that shows grammatical gender marks gender syntactically in a way unavailable to a pronominal gender language, difficulties may arise for the translator as to how to supply the information about the sex of the person in question”.⁴⁷ Languages that do not mark gender in some constructions,

³⁸ ‘Tax lawyer’ or ‘public defender’.

³⁹ Referring to a woman: ‘public defender’, ‘district attorney’, ‘tax lawyer’ or ‘Advocate General’.

⁴⁰ This part is omitted in the English version.

⁴¹ Cametti, *I guardiani*, 168.

⁴² Cametti, *Los guardianes*, 154.

⁴³ Manuel Almeida Suárez, *El sexismo en el lenguaje. Guía para una práctica no sexista de la lengua*, Colección Publicaciones Institucionales (La Laguna, Santa Cruz de Tenerife: Servicio de Publicaciones Universidad de la Laguna, 2017), 39.

⁴⁴ “Lawyer required. Those interested should contact the company by calling the number indicated below”. Author’s alternative: “Female or male lawyer required. Those interested should contact the company by calling the number indicated below”.

⁴⁵ Once again, in English it will be much easier: ‘Lawyer wanted’, as the gender-neutral term ‘lawyer’ refers to a man or a woman.

⁴⁶ Cametti, *I guardiani*, 168. This part is omitted in the English version.

⁴⁷ Nissen Uwe Kjaer, “Aspects of Translating Language”, *Linguistik Online*, 11.2 (2002).

resort to other methods to supply the reader with the necessary information. In this specific case, by adding the indirect feminine pronoun.

Within the Spanish language, cases of ambiguity can be also perceived: “Los empresarios españoles demandan reformas laborales”.⁴⁸ In this case, it is not clear whether the meaning is inclusive or exclusive, that is to say, if we are dealing with a case of the generic masculine or, by contrast, the exclusively masculine. According to some psycholinguistic studies, when the generic masculine refers to professions or trades, there are those who understand the noun as masculine and those who understand it as the generic masculine. If we contrast it again with other Italian examples of the same nature, we find an identical situation:

Occorre incentivare imprenditori e lavoratori, per tornare ad assumere.

I giovani imprenditori italiani che hanno deciso a dispetto della crisi e delle difficoltà oggettive di restare e scommettere ancora sul sistema Italia concludono con una riflessione sul Jobs act: ‘Rischia di essere solo una fiammata: nato per creare lavoro per i giovani invece sarà solo una grande illusione’.⁴⁹

Both examples show certain ambiguity: does the news refer to young entrepreneurs of both genders or, by contrast, does it only refer to the male group?

4. Conclusions

Language has been shaped historically from an androcentric perspective. The constant struggle faced by women over the centuries has resulted in major achievements in women's role in our society. Nonetheless, sex discrimination continues to be present in many spheres of our everyday lives, including the linguistic field.

To combat this linguistic sexism, we have reached a series of conclusions. Firstly, it is necessary to seek, find and promote alternatives in order to avoid the use of sexist language as well as to eradicate all kinds of prejudices: “Family, educational institutions and society represent three basic pillars that may contribute to reduce inequalities”.⁵⁰

As a consequence, it is absolutely necessary to insist on the promotion of an equal education and *coeducate*, that is to say, to permit the individual's total development by rejecting any kind of social prejudice – including patriarchal sociocultural traditions and attitudes. As mentioned in previous paragraphs, both in Spanish and Italian societies, throughout history, language has been built from an androcentric perspective characterized by certain patriarchal attitudes, which have been in charge of favoring the use of sexist language. However, the solution proposed here is the promotion of an androgynous image of the human being through the non-sexist use of language. The elimination of sexist language is a necessary condition for eradicating sexism in any society.

Regarding the promotion of equal education, it is also necessary to remove sex discrimination from teaching materials (whether they are textbooks, reading books, literary works, etc.), as well as to promote the use of non-sexist language by teachers, educators, parents and tutors:

⁴⁸ Almeida Suárez, *El sexismo en el lenguaje*, 19. “Spanish businessmen demand labor reforms”. In this particular case, in English there is not any case of ambiguity since we can use the feminine word ‘businesswoman’.

⁴⁹ Federica Bosco, “#Amegliaitalia. Gli imprenditori cosa chiedono alla politica? Dalle riforme alla grande illusione del Jobs Act”, *News Italia Live* (2015), <https://newsitalialive.it/amegliaitalia-gli-imprenditori-cosa-chiedono-alla-politica-dalle-riforme-alla-grande-illusione-del-jobs-act/>, accessed 18 April 2018. “We need to encourage entrepreneurs and workers in order to return to hire”; “The young Italian entrepreneurs, after facing the crisis and the objective difficulties of staying and betting again on the Italian system, conclude with a reflection on the Jobs act: ‘It risks to be just a flare: born to create work for young people but it will be only a great illusion’”, translation by the author.

⁵⁰ Marco López, “Lenguaje, sexismo y educación”, 15.

No hay que olvidar que la lengua lo es todo. Es el vehículo del pensamiento, es el principal mecanismo de comunicación que empleamos, y es el vehículo que se utiliza (tanto en su forma oral como escrito) para transmitir los conocimientos en las aulas ... la lengua está presente en cualquier actividad que se haga en la vida, por lo tanto, también en el acto de enseñar.⁵¹

The promotion of non-sexist language in Spanish can be carried out through the use of generic and collective nouns such as *funcionariado*, *alumnado*, *profesorado*, *tripulación*⁵²... or even by creating a feminine form for each masculine, and vice versa, in every word that has a single form.⁵³

Feminization entails adapting language to the different social and cultural realities within a context of equality. We must not exclude women from public discourse but make them present and name the world as it is: in masculine and feminine. Nevertheless, it is not easy to create new terms since there are no established morphological or semantic reasons to accept some forms and reject others. There are not well-defined rules on when a feminine form can be accepted or not. Why has the feminine form of *gerente/gerenta*⁵⁴ been created and not that of *conserje/*conserja*?

In regard to Cametti's translation, it is curious to observe how the biggest divergence can be found in the translation into Spanish and not in the one into English. So as to say, although both Spanish and Italian languages are characterized by grammatical gender, the translator Claudia Conde decided to use more feminist signs in her translation into Spanish than the hints that are found in the original edition, as the Italian author has often opted to use masculine terms or a gender-neutral approach to refer to women. This is the reason why the translation into English, as it is a language defined by a neutral gender, has had minor problems related to this.

Despite expectations, it has been observed a bigger analogy between the Italian and the English works than between the Italian and the Spanish ones. For this reason, and as it was fostered in the previous paragraphs, gender representation in translations can be determined by the identity of the author (which can be partially detected from his/her strategies). This article illustrates the importance and power that both language and translation have as they are means to legitimate or subvert the *status quo*; they are instruments to show oppression and gender liberation.⁵⁵ Translations make use of these strategies, yet they leave a personal trace, as it is the case of the Spanish writer Claudia Conde.

Considering everything, language conditions the way we think and, as a result, it becomes a necessary tool to achieve equal opportunities for everyone. Society, relationships between individuals and the way those communicate among them are continuously changing and language must adapt itself to all this. A certain sector of society considers the argument that defends the use of language as a means to bring a change to society as puerile. That is, a part of society believes that the use of non-sexist language will not prevent the position of subordinate women in our societies. Unfortunately that language will not change this situation. Nonetheless, as Almeida Suárez indicates: "Es importante saber que la lengua juega un papel importante en la organización de la realidad y que, por tanto, un modo de cambiar la

⁵¹ We must not forget that language is everything. It is the vehicle of thought, it is the main communication tool we use, and it is also the vehicle that is used (in both oral and written forms) to transmit knowledge in the classroom ... language is present in every activity we do in life, therefore, it is also present in the act of teaching. Calero Fernández, *Sexismo lingüístico*, 68, translation by the author.

⁵² 'government employees', 'students', 'faculty', 'crew'.

⁵³ As has already been done with the terms *juez/jueza* ('judge'), *presidente/presidenta* ('president'), etc.

⁵⁴ According to the DRAE, the masculine term is preferred even to indicate the feminine form (except in some South America countries): "Para el f., u. m. la forma *gerente*, excepto en Arg., Bol., Chile, Ec., Hond., Méx., Nic., Par., Perú, R. Dom., Ur. y Ven., donde se usa t. *gerenta*" (DRAE, 2017).

⁵⁵ Olga Castro, "Introduction: Gender, Language and Translation at the Crossroads of Disciplines", *Gender and Language*, 7 (Equinox Publishing, 2013), 5-12.

realidad requiere modificar, paralelamente, el lenguaje que la designa y nombra”.⁵⁶ Sexist language distorts the truth and we urgently need to demand concrete changes and advocate a nonsexist, neutral and gender inclusive language which does not exclude women or men. As Deborah Cameron observes:

The reason why changes ought to be made in language is to bring it into line with the way things really are. It is the business of language to represent reality, so to the extent that it is stuck in a vanished world where woman's place was in the home, and so on, language is misleading us and failing to do its job.⁵⁷

We must adopt this optimistic perspective in that language is a vehicle for cultural transmission that is available to everyone and can change the world. We still have a long road ahead to achieve full equal rights and opportunities among men and women. So, why not starting by using words like *ministra* or *jueza*⁵⁸ so as to give even more voice to women who exercise those types of professions which have been considered exclusively masculine over the years?

⁵⁶ It is important to know that language plays an important role in organizing reality and that, as a result, a way to change reality requires modifying, simultaneously, the language that designates and names it. Almeida Suárez, *El sexismo en el lenguaje*, 20, translation by the author.

⁵⁷ Cameron, *Feminism and Linguistic Theory*, 101.

⁵⁸ ‘minister’ or ‘judge’ (referring to a woman).

Women in Children's and Young Adults' Literature and Its Translation. Female Characters in *Manolito Gafotas* and *Kika Superbruja*

Abstract: The superiority of men over women, as well as the parental model consisting only of a man and a woman, and the failure to educate in terms of equality and diversity, are issues that have been latent in our society since time immemorial. However, it is important to note how publishers can determine the way in which female characters should be developed through the translation of literary works with children and young readers as targets. Since this literature contributes to children's education and provides the first contact with adult experiences, it seems pertinent to analyze the importance of this kind of manipulation during the translational process. This manipulation is requested by different institutions and powerful groups, and its aim is to perpetuate a heteronormative discourse in the translation of female characters within this literary genre.

Keywords: *translation, manipulation, children's literature, female characters, heteronormativity, education*

1. Introduction

The existence of a hegemonic discourse whose objective is to legitimize the traditional roles of femininity and masculinity is a pervasive phenomenon from an early age. This phenomenon can be perceived as a systematic and standardized custom at school and it is reinforced by a multitude of literary works for children and young readers. The presentation of female characters, whether main or secondary ones, in children's and young adults' literature, can help us to understand both the mentality of a society and the conventions which drive it. Therefore, we intend to analyze the traits of the female characters of *Manolito Gafotas*, by the Spanish writer Elvira Lindo, and *Kika Superbruja*, by the German author KNISTER. Our subject of study will thus be these female characters, women or girls, in main, secondary or occasional roles, analysing them firstly in their original language. On the basis of this analysis, we will study whether their traits are maintained when translated into another language – German and English in the case of *Manolito Gafotas*; and Spanish in the case of *Kika Superbruja*. If this is not the case, our aim will be to examine how their personality, functions or transgressive characteristics are changed in favor of a feminine role closer to the classic gender marks established by heteropatriarchy. This work aims to be a first and schematic approach to a gender-oriented analysis that we intend to develop by examining translations of Children's and Young Adults' Literature works.

The Spanish *Diccionario de la Real Academia Española (DRAE)*¹ defines 'machismo' as an "attitude of arrogance of men with respect to women", a definition that does not contemplate the true extension – and seriousness – that the term entails. For this reason, over the years, various social and academic movements as well as social media have insisted that "Machismo is not innate, machismo is learned"² and have described it as a set of acquired attitudes and behaviours, as well as social practices and beliefs, aimed at justifying and promoting the maintenance of behaviours traditionally perceived as

¹ This is the most important linguistic authority in the Spanish language, available online at: <https://dle.rae.es/?w=diccionario>.

² María Jesús Ibáñez, "El machismo no es innato, el machismo se aprende" (2017), <https://www.elperiodico.com/es/sociedad/20171124/educacion-machismo-violencia-mujeres-se-aprende-6447037>, accessed 3 October 2018.

heterosexually male and discriminatory against women. Luciana Guerra³ speaks about a heteronormative order constructed from a binary sexual system in which a hierarchy dominated by the masculine is set, dismissing all the feminine as inferior. That is why Guerra argues that this system restricts the definition of human to male and female categories. At the same time, the system upholds the 'attraction to the opposite sex', leading to the discrimination of every dissident sexual orientation as well as any identity included in the LGTBI+ collective. However, the main question remains: how is this reflected in children's and young adults' literature?

Lemus Montaña⁴ defines children's and young adults' literature as a "literature aimed at non-adult readers, children of any age, from pre-readers to teenagers". However, this definition not only seems inaccurate, but also encompasses a very broad audience, regardless of their age, needs or background. In fact, as Inmaculada Mendoza states,⁵ we cannot consider the literature created for children up to five years old as having any similarity with that aimed at a somewhat older audience. She refers to the model proposed by Joseph Appleyard in terms of the age group of the reader, their reading skills, as well as their tastes and interests: early childhood or reader-player, second childhood or prepubescent reader, adolescence or reader-thinker.⁶ In short, it is a readership with specific characteristics: a limited knowledge of the adult world, a far from extensive lexical domain, a more open-minded vision of the world, that is to say, a facility to accept all kinds of roles with ease.⁷

Furthermore, it is important to mention not only the readership to whom this type of literature is addressed, but also the objective it pursues. In this regard, Juan Cervera⁸ considers that children's and young people's literature plays a fundamental role in the development of the reader. This literature is not presented as a set of contents to be learned, but rather as a series of experiences that enables them to learn about the world as part of an integral education, meeting the child's intimate needs. Therefore, we could speak of children's and young adults' literature as a tool with didactic purposes whose development is produced by the interaction of literary, social and educational systems.⁹

Marisa Fernández López¹⁰ affirms that children's and young adults' literature is, or at least has been for a long time, a peripheral field subjected to a strong censorship on the part of adults. Within this control there are numerous examples of textual modifications which are normally legitimised by reasons such as the absence of aesthetic values in the text, the negative influence the text can exercise on the readers (political, religious or moral criteria), the formative aim of children's and young adults' literature (didacticism), and even "the commercial need to update the text in order to increase sales".¹¹

Therefore, we strongly believe that children's and young adults' literature is a genre with an idiosyncrasy that differentiates it from mass literature and that may be subject to manipulations prior to its publication in its original language (SL). These manipulations are produced by various factors claiming to adapt the work to make it more acceptable to the target group.

2. Translation and manipulation of children's and young people's literature

³ Luciana Guerra, "Familia y heteronormatividad", *Revista Argentina de Estudios de Juventud*, 1 (2009).

⁴ Ismael Lemus Montaña, "Grado de adaptación en las traducciones de *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*". *Tejuelo: Didáctica de la Lengua y la Literatura*, 4 (2008), 33-54, 34.

⁵ Inmaculada Mendoza, *La traducción al español de Judy Moody, de Megan McDonald. Revisión del tratamiento de los cultuemas y los nombres propios desde la traductología actual*. Doctoral Thesis (Sevilla: Universidad de Sevilla, 2014), 56.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 57.

⁷ Gillian Lathey, *Translating Children's Literature* (London: Routledge, 2015).

⁸ Juan Cervera, "La literatura infantil. Los límites de la didáctica", *Monteolive*, 6 (1989).

⁹ See Zohar Shavit, *Poetics of Children's Literature* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1986), 123.

¹⁰ See Marisa Fernández López, "Comportamientos censores en literatura infantil y juveniltraduccion del inglés en la España franquista", in Rosa Rabadán, ed., *Traducción y censura, inglés-español 1939-1985. Estudio preliminar* (Léon: Universidad, 2000), 227-254.

¹¹ "La necesidad comercial de actualizar el texto para incrementar las ventas", translation by the authors. See Marisa Fernández López, "Canon y periferia en literatura infantil y juvenil. Manipulación del medio visual", in Lourdes Lorenzo et al., eds., *Contribuciones al estudio de la traducción de literatura infantil y juvenil* (Valencia: Dossat, 2002), 13.

Mendoza¹² proposes that most of the research dedicated to the translation of children's and young adults' literature includes the debate about the existence or not of this mode of translation as a particular speciality with its own identity, different from the translation of mass literature. So, while Riitta Kuivasmäki¹³ firmly denies that children's and young adults' literature is a genre: "Children's literature is not a genre. As literature for children and adults encompasses many of the same genres, it seems wrong to deal with children's literature as a separate genre", Barbara Wall¹⁴ defines this kind of literature as "the genre of writing for children". Oittinen¹⁵ affirms that "Children's literature can be seen either as literature produced and intended for children or as literature read by children", and adds that "Children's literature can also be considered an issue of intentionality: if the original author has intended or directed her/his book to be read by children, it is a children's book". Likewise, Göte Klingberg¹⁶ said in 1972 that children's and young adults' literature is "literature produced specifically for children", while in 1999 Wall¹⁷ made the following distinction: "If a story is written for children, then it is for children, even though it may also be for adults. If a story is not written for children, then it does not form part of the genre of writing for children, even if the author, or publisher, hopes it will appeal to children".

However, it is also true that in this type of translation, the translator may take a series of liberties with regard to the original text, and even manipulate it, as indicated by Shavit,¹⁸ in order to adapt it to the target culture. While it is true that the simplest form of manipulation would be the removal of certain elements or even of whole paragraphs, the translator cannot always perform this elimination since it could alter the development of the plot. Similarly, the result might not be acceptable due to other factors within the work, such as images, so the translators are forced to find a strategy that allows them to adapt the work to the target culture, so "when it is possible to delete undesirable scenes without damaging the basic plot or characterizations, translators will not hesitate to do so".¹⁹

According to Reiss, what differentiates the translation of children's and young adults' literature from the translation of mass literature is the asymmetry in the translation process: "Erwachsene schreiben für Kinder und Jugendliche; Erwachsene übersetzen das von Erwachsenen Geschriebene für Kinder und Jugendliche" [Adults write for children and young adults; Adults translate what adults write for children and young adults].²⁰ According to Mendoza, this phenomenon implies that this literature is translated for children only secondarily, since the adult of the SL will take a series of experiences, knowledge and linguistic changes still unknown to the readers, and the translator, also an adult, will adapt, or modify and manipulate it to the culture of the target reader:

A diferencia de lo que sucede en la literatura para adultos, en función de los principios pedagógicos y morales que predominan en la sociedad receptora, las instancias mediadoras, esto es, las instituciones y autoridades culturales y educativas implicadas en los procesos de traducción, venta, promoción y compra de estos libros los editores, los bibliotecarios, los libreros, los educadores, los críticos y jurados literarios, los psicopedagogos, los orientadores, los padres y tutores, etc. ejercen una presión importante sobre el traductor de LI, ya sea de forma directa o indirecta. Como consecuencia de la influencia que todos estos

¹² Mendoza, *La traducción al español de Judy Moody, de Megan McDonald*, 55.

¹³ Riitta Oittinen, *Translating for Children* (London: Taylor & Francis, 2000), 65.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid., 61-62.

¹⁶ Ibid., 61.

¹⁷ Ibid., 63.

¹⁸ Shavit, *Poetics of Children's Literature*, 112.

¹⁹ Ibid., 123.

²⁰ Katerina Reiss, "Zur Übersetzung von Kinder- und Jugendbüchern. Theorie und Praxis", *Lebende Sprachen*, 27.1 (1982), 7-13, 7-8.

factores y agentes ejercen sobre el proceso, el traductor se verá obligado a añadir, omitir o adaptar determinados fragmentos textuales.²¹

2.1. *Male chauvinism and manipulation in the translation of children's and young adults' literature*

Bearing in mind that there are various authorities and institutions, as well as powerful groups that can influence the translation process, we should focus on our topic: machismo and heteronormativity as ideological manipulation in the translation of this literary genre. As Juan Marco Vaggione pointed out, the hierarchy of the Catholic Church and its allied sectors stand out among the promoters of a hegemonic male chauvinist system and a single conception of the family. For the Church, defending the family is a way of defending culture, threatened by demands from feminist movements and by sexual diversity. It should not be forgotten that in the *Letter to the Bishops of the Catholic Church on the collaboration of men and women in the Church and in the world*, prepared by the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith in 2004, it criticized the “radical feminism of recent years because it induces women to believe that in order to be themselves, they have to become antagonists of men, leading to an extreme rivalry between sexes, in which the identity and the role of one are assumed to undermine the other”.²²

Belén Lozano²³ talks about how children's and young adults' literature in Spain has been strongly linked to didactic and moralizing purposes. If we add the fact that certain publishers belong to groups influenced by political movements or by the Church – as is the case in point – we can observe the objective of our present study: that the idea of preserving conventional values leads publishers and professionals related to these sectors to manipulate fragments, even entire chapters, of SL works during the translational process in order to preserve that defence of culture and avoid the “feminist threat”.²⁴

3. *Hexe Lilli* and its female characters

Hexe Lilli, written by the German author KNISTER, with works aimed at first readers as well as a reading audience from 8 years old, tells the story of a young girl who, by chance, discovers she is a witch, and from that point on, she begins to have a series of adventures that will lead her to learn as much as the reader. The translation into Spanish was carried out by the translator Rosa Pilar Blanco and it was published by Bruño, a publisher linked to the Catholic Church, under the title *Kika Superbruja*.

²¹ “Unlike what happens in adult literature, depending on pedagogical and moral principles that predominate in the receiving society, the mediating authorities, that is, the cultural and educational institutions involved in the translation, sale, promotion and purchase of children's and young adults' literature (editors, librarians, booksellers, educators, critics and literary juries, educational psychologists, counsellors, parents and tutors) exert significant pressure on children's and young adults' literature translators, either directly or indirectly. As a result of the influence that all these factors and agents exert on the process, the translator may be forced to add, omit or adapt certain textual fragments”, translation by the authors. See Mendoza, *La traducción al español de Judy Moody, de Megan McDonald*, 70.

²² Juan Marco Vaggione, “Las familias más allá de la heteronormatividad”, in Cristina Motta and Macarena Sáez, eds., *La mirada de los jueces. Género y sexualidades en la jurisprudencia latinoamericana* (Bogotá: Siglo del Hombre Editores, 2008), 13-87, 14.

²³ Belén Lozano, “La traducción de la literatura infantojuvenil en lengua alemana en España. El caso de *Kika Superbruja*”, in Heike van Lawick and Brigitte Jirku, eds., *Übersetzung als Performanz. Translation und Translationswissenschaft in Performativem Licht* (Wien, Berlin: Lit-Verlag, 2012), 225.

²⁴ Nuria Pérez Vicente et al., eds., *Manolito por el mundo. Análisis intercultural de las traducciones al inglés, francés, alemán e italiano* (Sevilla: Asociación Cultural Benilde). For example, some aspects are censored in the English version, with the consent of Elvira Lindo, because they are considered politically incorrect and unacceptable to the American public.

As we have commented elsewhere,²⁵ the fact that Lilli – Kika in Spanish – is a girl, is due, according to the author,²⁶ to the interest of promoting the female character as independent, strong and capable of solving any challenge she may have in a logical way, without any help other than her own intelligence and that of her friends. Accordingly, the protagonist, in the original version, is accompanied by her brother and her mother, a single mother who is able to support her family on her own, without needing a male figure to help her. Likewise, we can see throughout the work that the figures of authority and responsibility of Lilli's friends are their mothers, and never any male character. This decision has not been respected in the Spanish translation since the translator decided to add a paternal character in the TL, as well as to make another series of changes that will be analyzed below.

3.1. 'Kika Superbruja' and the magic of inventing characters

The work under scrutiny is the third volume of the saga *Hexe Lilli und der Zirkuszauber*, published in 1996 by the German publisher Arena, and translated into Spanish as *Kika Superbruja and the magic of the circus* in 1999 by the aforementioned publishing house, Bruño.

As we can read on the back cover of the Spanish version, "in this adventure, Kika attends a circus performance. Her magic arts will enable her to teach the knife thrower a lesson, and to make the tricks of the wizard Abraxis appear really ... magical!" However, we can see how there have been a series of changes and manipulations throughout the translation of the text into Spanish that lead us to consider the aim of this translation to preserve a heteronormative model with a moralizing purpose (unfortunately, there is no English translation of the text that we can show):

Und was noch schöner ist, Lillis Mutter hat heute Morgen Eintrittskarten für die große Sondervorstellung am Sonntag gekauft.

Na ja, dass meine veste Freundin Mona am Sonntag nicht mit mir gehen kann. Ihre Mutter hat es auch versucht, bevor sie Mona von der Schule abgeholt hat, aber es hat nicht geklappt.

Hoffentlich rede ter nur nicht unnötig und macht Mama damit stutzig!

Sie muss ja den Zauber wieder rückgängig machen – bevor Mama vielleicht doch was merkt.

Am Donnerstagnachmittag holt Tobias' Mutter Leon ab.

Dann können wir ja doch alle zusammengehen, freut sich Mama und gibt Leon einen dicken Kuss.²⁷

Y, lo que es todavía mejor, esta misma mañana los padres de Kika han sacado entradas para la función de gala del domingo.

Pues... que Mónica, mi mejor amiga, no puede acompañarme al circo el domingo. Sus padres han intentado sacar entradas para ese día, pero ya estaban agotadas.

«Ojalá no hable más de la cuenta y haga sospechar a papá y mamá», piensa.

Y es que Kika tiene que anular el hechizo antes de que sus padres empiecen a sospechar de verdad.

El jueves por la tarde, los padres de Tony pasan a buscar a Dani.

¡Entonces podemos ir todos juntos! Se alegran sus padres.²⁸

These are just a few fragments collected both from the source text (ST) and from the target text. As can be clearly seen, the ST presents a single authority figure, the mother, either because it is a single-parent family, as in the case of Lilli, or because the author wanted to mention only one part of the family. This

²⁵ Antonio Lérica Muñoz, "El machismo y la heteronormatividad en la traducción al español de la literatura infantil y juvenil (LIJ)", in Ernesto Cutillas Orgilés, ed., *Convergencia y transversalidad en humanidades. Actas de las VII jornadas de investigación de la facultad de filosofía y letras de la universidad de Alicante (Alicante, 6 and 7 April 2017)* (Alicante: Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, Universidad de Alicante, 2018), 103-108.

²⁶ We had the opportunity to discuss this point with the author by phone.

²⁷ Knister, *Hexe Lilli und der Zirkuszauber* (Würzburg: Area Verlag, 1996).

²⁸ Knister, *Kika Superbruja y la magia del circo* (Madrid: Bruño, 1999).

phenomenon is common in the culture of the SL and also not unusual in the target culture, since in Spain there are a large number of single-parent families whose heads are indistinctly a father or a mother.

Thus, the Spanish publisher presents a translating strategy in which these situations not only lead to the inclusion of a non-existent paternal character, but also imply the existence of a heteronormative family composed of a man and a woman.

This decision, taken by the translator probably under the publisher's standards, could not only be considered as a translation mistake – as it deviates from both the concept of family and the message intended by the author – but also as a perpetuation of social conventions established by a patriarchal society. It also avoids showing alternatives such as the single-parent or homoparental family, and even more importantly, prevents younger children from becoming aware of them.

Likewise, in the following examples we can observe how a traditional distribution of the roles men and women should play within the classic family model, such as that proposed by the translator and the publisher, has been introduced:

Aber bevor sie das herausfinden kann, ruft Mama aus der Küche: »Lilli, Leon! Zum Abendessen!«

Er erzählt so viel, dass Mama beide Kinder zischendurch ermahnen muss das Essen darüber nicht zu vergessen.

»Und wie steht es mit dem Tischdecken?«, fragt Mama

»Weißt du eigentlich überhaupt noch, was du willst?«, fragt Mama ratlos. »Und dann noch diese alberne Buchstabenverdrehen...«

Weiter kommt Leon leider nicht, weil Mama das Zimmer betritt und die nächtliche Besprechung auf der Stelle beendet.

Pero antes de que pueda averiguarlo, mamá les llama desde la cocina:

—¡Kika, Dani! ¡A cenar!

Habla tanto que su madre tiene que decirle a Kika y a él que no se olviden de la cena.

—¿Es que hoy nadie piensa ayudarme a poner la mesa? —pregunta papá

—¿Qué está pasando aquí? —pregunta el padre, desconcertado—. ¿A qué viene esa tontería de cambiar las letras de sitio?

Dani no puede seguir hablando porque papá ha entrado en la habitación y ha puesto fin a la conferencia nocturna

In the aforementioned examples, we can observe how the traditional roles are marked by gender work. On the one hand, we see how the figure of the mother has been maintained for tasks such as working in the kitchen or ensuring that children do not forget their dinner, while the figure that imposes order or needs help to carry out a simple domestic task becomes the father in the Spanish version.

It should be noted that sometimes in the target text the mother figure also appears scolding the children or alternates with the father figure, added to impose authority. However, to our mind, the previous examples aim indirectly to send a subliminal message to the readers in order to perpetuate conventional roles assigned to the different sexes: the mother/woman works in the kitchen while the father/man is the figure of authority.

However, the perpetuation of a traditional gender bias is not only found at the textual level but, as we will see below, it goes further and can be perceived in other aspects of the publication.

3.2. From the cover to the inner part: peritextual elements

From the first contact with the original work, the Arena publisher presents neutral colors, usually with cold and *non-sexual* tones, such as yellow or blue. The use of these colors reveals a detachment from possible gender marks, enabling the publisher to reach a wider readership, since the author wants the work to appeal to as many young people as possible, irrespective of their sex.

So, the German edition features a circus with blue tent and bright stars.²⁹ Although blue is usually associated with children, the objective that this edition seems to have is the inclusion of a wide readership, without differentiating between boys and girls. However, in the edition published by Bruño, the dominant color on the cover is pink, eliminating the circus elements and therefore insisting on conventional gender marks: Kika is a girl, therefore its color should be pink and its readership will presumably be girls.

On the other hand, the non-translation of the inner illustrations by the designer and illustrator of children's and young adults' literature, Birgit Rieger, is also surprising.

As mentioned above, Kika's parents get circus tickets for everyone and they are happy to attend a circus performance together (see table 1). However, the text is accompanied by the following image:



Fig. 1

It can be seen that Kika has three tickets in her hand, although there are four members of her "Spanish" family. The lack of adaptation of this image may confuse the reader, since the images serve as a support for reading and, in this case, a lack of coherence remains. Similarly, in the following fragment, in which Kika is supposedly with her "Spanish" parents and her brother attending the show, only three people appear, as in the original German version:



Fig. 2

²⁹ As we can see in the covers of the German original (<https://pictures.abebooks.com/isbn/9783401045344-de.jpg>) and the Spanish translation (<https://www.brunolibros.es/libro/personajes/kika-superbruja-y-la-magia-del-circo/>).

Again, the paternal figure – non-existent in the ST but added in the FT – does not appear in the illustration, which produces an incoherence that hinders rather than aids the reading process, which is supposedly the main function of the images in children's and young people's literature.

These are just some of the examples that can be perceived in this translation in the zeal of this Catholic publisher to maintain a discourse that promotes a family model consisting only of a man and a woman, instead of educating in equality and diversity.

4. The women of *Manolito Gafotas*, by Elvira Lindo, around the world

The journalist and writer Elvira Lindo published eight novels between 1994 and 2012 featuring a ten-year-old boy as protagonist -Manolito Gafotas, from the Carabanchel neighbourhood in Madrid – all with illustrations by the cartoonist Emilio Urberuaga.³⁰ The last book was published 12 years after the end of an initial series of seven, with an adult Manolito as protagonist: *Manolito Gafotas* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1994), *¡Pobre Manolito!* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1995), *¡Cómo molo! (Otra de Manolito Gafotas)* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1996), *Los trapos sucios* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1997), *Manolito on the road* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1998), *Yo y el Imbécil* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 1999), *Manolito tiene un secreto* (Madrid: Alfaguara, 2000), *Mejor Manolo* (Barcelona: Seix Barral, 2012).

In all of them, four female figures play an important role, all related to the educational field: Manolito's mother, his classmate Susana, the school psychologist and the *seño*, his teacher. Their portrayal in the German and English translations will be analyzed in the following sections.

4.1. 'Manolito' translated into German

Out of the eight works, only the first three have been translated into German, and published in Germany between 2000 and 2002, with the following titles: *Manolito – Opas neues Gebiss* (Hamburg: Klopp, 2000), *Manolito und die Schmutzfußbande* (Hamburg: Klopp, 2001), *Manolito – was für ein Supertyp!* (Hamburg: Klopp, 2002).

As can be seen, the German versions were published by the same publishing house from Hamburg. They are the work of the same translator, Sabine Müller-Nordhoff, and were illustrated by the same artist, Oliver Wenniges. This is also the case with the original Spanish books, all of which were published by the Alfaguara publishing house – with the exception of the last novel – and illustrated by the award-winning Spanish cartoonist, Emilio Urberuaga.³¹

On the other hand, the German covers present a very different aesthetic from that of the original novels, as can be seen at first glance in the German and English editions of the third volume.³² The German version seems to be more clearly aimed at children, while the Spanish version has an aesthetic closer to a young – even adult – readership. The sobriety and originality of the illustrations mean that the Spanish books are not subject to the aesthetic assumptions usually found in covers and illustrations of children's and young adults' literature anywhere in the world. We believe that this significant aesthetic

³⁰ See also Nuria Pérez Vicente et al., eds., *Manolito por el mundo*.

³¹ On the broad professional experience of this Spanish illustrator, see http://sol-e.com/bancorecursos/museo.php?letra=U&id_tabla=2176&seccion=Biografia and <http://www.lukor.com/literatura/noticias/0411/12161556.htm>, accessed 18 June 2018. See also Víctor Montoya, "Las ilustraciones en la literatura infantil", <http://www.leemeuncuento.com.ar/ilustraciones.html>, accessed 18 June 2018; Oliver Wenniges, <http://www.oliverwenniges.de/>, accessed 18 June 2018.

³² Compare the original Spanish with the German one, https://www.todostuslibros.com/libros/como-molo_978-84-204-6452-7, <https://www.zvab.com/Manolito-super-Typ-Lindo-Elvira-Oliver/22865813174/bd#&gid=1&pid=1>, accessed 18 June 2018.

difference of the images played an important role in the failure of *Manolito Brillenschlange* (the name of the character in German) among the German-speaking readership.

4.2. 'Manolito' in English

The first three volumes of the series were also translated into English:

Lindo, Elvira (2008) <i>Manolito Four-Eyes: The 1st Volume of the Great Encyclopedia of My Life</i> . Translation by Joanne Moriarty. New York: Marshall Cavendish Corporation.	Lindo, Elvira (2009) <i>Manolito Four-Eyes: The 2nd Volume of the Great Encyclopedia of My Life</i> . Translation by Caroline Travalia. New York: Marshall Cavendish Corporation.	Lindo, Elvira (2010) <i>Manolito Four-Eyes: The 3rd Volume of the Great Encyclopedia of My Life</i> . Translation by Caroline Travalia. New York: Marshall Cavendish Children's Books.
---	---	--

In this case, the three volumes were published by the same publishing house, but unlike the German versions, the illustrations of the English translations are the same as the original novel in Spanish. In addition, the three volumes translated into English, unlike the German versions, are the work of two different translators, Joanne Moriarty with the first volume, and Caroline Travalia with the next two volumes. In that regard, we believe that the preservation of the original illustrations, in contrast to the German versions, contributed enormously to the success of the novel in the USA, where the English versions were published and distributed. Moreover, they were translated into American English on behalf of a US publisher. Finally, the maintenance of the illustrator is reflected in the global aesthetics of the volume in the covers.

4.3. The women of 'Manolito' in German and English

The aim of this section is to ascertain whether there is any difference in the treatment of female characters in the above-mentioned translations from Spanish into German and English.

As already stated, there are four important female characters in the life of the protagonist, *Manolito*, with roles traditionally linked to women: a suffering mother, a teacher (*la seño*), a child psychologist and a classmate. The latter, a 13-year-old girl, is regarded as an object of desire by the protagonist and her other male classmates, fuelling their fantasies. This does not mean that the Spanish novel is male chauvinist in nature or that it defends those postulates, but it parodies the society in the late eighties, in which masculine and feminine roles were still assigned a strict sexist character.

4.3.1 The women of 'Manolito' at a peritextual level: front and back covers

Here, we deal exclusively with the first volume of the series, published in Spanish in 1994 with the title of *Manolito* and translated into German in 2000 under the title *Manolito Brillenschlange. Opas neues Gebiss* (the German subtitle of the volume – the new dentures of the grandfather – refers to one of the chapters of the novel, focused on the grandfather's dentures).

At first glance, the covers of both volumes are very different, from the 'orthodox' blue of the Spanish volume, which alludes to the manly character of the protagonist, to the 'neutral' yellow of the German version, which, like *Kika Superbruja*, seeks to avoid any male chauvinist connotations by using yellow instead of the pink of the Spanish version. In the English version, the color is orange, which is also

neutral like the yellow of the German version, and even in the Italian version, the chosen colour is green instead of blue.³³

We reproduce below the covers of the first three volumes in Spanish, German and English along with their back covers, which will be analyzed in order to point out their differences:³⁴

Manolito Gafotas es uno de los personajes más famosos del "mundo mundial". Este chaval de Carabanchel (Alto) nos ofrece, a través de sus gafas, una visión del mundo rebosante de humor. ¡Manolito es único, magnífico, inimitable...! Junto a él, y junto a su hermano el Imbécil, su abuelo Nicolás y, por supuesto, toda la pandilla, viviremos divertidas aventuras.

Es war einmal ein wunderbarer Junge, ein Supertyp, dem keiner ein X für ein U vormachen konnte. Es gab keinen wie ihn und er nannte sich Manolito Brillenschlange. Ich weiss nicht, ob du es gemerkt hast, aber dieser Wahnsinnstyp bin ich. Meine Mutter meint, dass ich sie noch um den Verstand rede, sie meint, reden sei für mich eine Sache für Leben und Tod, aber meine Mutter sieht sowieso alles und arbeitet nur deshalb nicht beim CIA, weil die vom CIA sie noch nicht entdeckt haben. Aber ich will mit dem Tag beginnen, an dem ich geboren wurde.

Nobody knows me as Manolito García Moreno, not even Big Ears López, and he's my best friend; even though sometimes he can be a dog and a traitor (and other times, a dog traitor), he's still my best friend and he's a whole lotta cool. In Carabanchel – that's the name of my neighborhood in Madrid, in case I haven't told you – everyone knows me as Manolito Four-Eyes.

As can be seen, the descriptions of the back covers are very different among themselves; the first one focuses on highlighting what is shown on the cover; that is, it emphasizes all the important characters that surround Manolito: his grandfather, his brother El Imbécil, his friend Jihad and Susana Bragas Sucias –the only female character.

The German version highlights the other great family figure, also feminine, Manolito's mother, the progenitor who sees and knows so much that she could almost work for the CIA.

In the case of the English back cover, which is similar to the Spanish one, it is intended to highlight the figure of the protagonist and his curious nickname. In addition, it mentions his best friend and the name of the Madrid neighbourhood where Manolito lives, using an excerpt from one of the chapters of the novel. It can also be observed how the English translator retains the humorous tone of the original and the singular speech of the protagonist, which was possibly another reason for the success of the English version in contrast with the failure of the German one, which does not maintain that peculiar trait of the speech of Manolito.

4.3.2. *The female characters in Spanish, German and English*

As we can see below, just like the names of the male characters,³⁵ the female names with a special meaning have been translated into both languages. This is the case of Susana Bragas Sucias, whose name

³³ See here the cover, <https://www.libreriauniversitaria.it/ecco-manolito-manolito-quattrocchi-lindo/libro/9788878743250>, accessed 18 June 2018.

³⁴ See here the covers in Spanish (https://www.todostuslibros.com/libros/manolito-gafotas_978-84-204-4856-5), German (<https://www.booklooker.de/B%C3%BCher/ElviraLindo+Manolito/id/A02iczcm01ZZC?zid=79rjrqaosjt161q33mhu49r5kc>) and English (<https://www.amazon.com/Manolito-Four-Eyes-Great-Encyclopedia-Life-ebook/dp/B009DOOU82>), accessed 18 June 2018.

³⁵ We discussed this point in "The Strength of Stereotypes: The Translation of Children's and Young Adults' Literature from an Inclusive Perspective", a lecture given at the last AESLA conference held in April 2018 in Cádiz.

is translated into German quite literally and successfully as Susana Schmutztbutz, whereas the English name is the politically correct Susana the One and Only.

The names of both the teacher Asunción (whose name means “Assumption”) and the child psychologist Esperanza (whose name means “Hope”) have been maintained, despite the obvious religious and ironic connotations of both names, especially the psychologist’s. It may be due to the double fact that they are not child characters, whose nicknames are much more significant, and they are not very important characters:³⁶

Madre de Manolito	Manolitos Mutter	Manolito’s mother
Otras madres	andere Mütter	Other mothers
Susana Bragas Sucias	Susana Schmutztbutz	Susana the One and the Only
Sita Asunción	Fräulein Asunzion	Miss Asunción
Sita Espe (psicóloga)	Fräulein Esperanza	Miss Esperanza

In the Spanish version, the female characters are not explained at the beginning of the novel, unlike the German translation, which makes a selection of the most important characters and, above all, those whose names have a special meaning.

Two of the main female characters of the novel are described in this fashion, with the peculiar speech of Manolito and the special sense of humor of Elvira Lindo: Susana Bragas Sucias, whose name refers to one of the obsessions of boys from some decades ago (girls’ panties, the ‘bragas’) and these panties’ strange tendency to always appear dirty at the end of the day; and Asunción, their teacher, a fundamental figure in formative years of any child, who is described as a futurologist (‘futuróloga’), who can see if a child will develop into a killer or a Nobel Prize winner, without contemplating anything in between!:

Susana Bragas Sucias

Yo le conté a mi abuelo que la Susana no respetaba nada, que aunque uno se lo hubiera pedido, se iba con cualquiera que le diera cualquier cosa ... que lo de las bragas de Susana era para llevarlo al programa “Misterios sin resolver”. Su madre, que había ido a hablar con la *sita* Asunción, decía que las bragas se le manchaban de tierra aunque llevara el chándal y que haría falta que vinieran a España científicos de todo el mundo para saber por qué unas bragas que salían blancas de casa por la mañana entro de un chándal, a la hora de comer se habían vuelto negras.

Sita Asunción

... estábamos esperando a que nos recibiera la psicóloga del colegio, a que nos recibiera uno a uno, porque a los tres juntos no nos aguanta nadie, porque de aquí o a tres años vamos a acabar siendo unos delincuentes. Eso no lo digo yo, lo dice mi *sita* Asunción, que, además de maestra es futuróloga, porque ve el futuro de todos sus alumnos. No le hace falta bola de cristal ni cartas: te hinca los ojos en la cabeza y te ve de muchos años como uno de los delincuentes más buscados de la historia o ganando un Premio Nobel. Ella no tiene término medio.

Here, we can enjoy Manolito and Elvira Lindo in their purest form, with their peculiar sense of humor and their exaggerated comparisons, which make the translation of the novel so difficult, in addition to the complicated names of the characters, especially the children.

In the German version, the names of the characters are semantically or phonetically adapted to their public. The explanation preceding the story, which does not appear in Spanish, aims to highlight, with a great sense of humor and with the special language of the author, the failings of the protagonists: the excessive imagination of Susana, which drives people crazy, and the obsession of Asunción for the possible “rehabilitation” of the children:

³⁶ See also Olga García García, “La onomástica en la traducción al alemán de Manolito Gafotas”, *Anuario de Estudios Filológicos*, 24 (2001), 153-167 and M^a del Mar Soliño Pazó “¿Es Manolito Gafotas realmente Manolito Brillenschlange?”, in Barbara Lübke et al., eds., *El Alemán en su Contexto Español. Deutsch Im Spanischen Kontext. Actas del IV Congreso de la FAGE* (Santiago: Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, 2004), 677-684.

Susana Schmutzbutz

Dieses Mädchen ist wie ein Orkan. Mit ihrer übersprudelnden Phantasie kann sie jeden in Teufels Küche bringen, vor allem Manolito.

Fräulein Asunzion

Obwohl sie glaubt, dass ihre Schüler allesamt Verbrecher sind, gibt sie die Hoffnung nicht auf, dass sie sich bessern werden.

The character of Manolito's mother deserves a special mention. We find her thus described in her first appearance in the novel:

La madre del Orejones mola un pegote porque está divorciada y, como se siente culpable, nunca le levanta la mano al Orejones para que no se le haga más grande el trauma que le está curando la señorita Esperanza, que es la psicóloga de mi colegio. Mi madre tampoco quiere que me coja traumas pero, como no está divorciada, me da de vez en cuando una colleja, que es su especialidad. La colleja es una torta que te da una madre, o en su defecto cualquiera, en esa parte del cuerpo humano que se llama nuca. No es porque sea mi madre, pero la verdad es que es una experta como hay pocas.

Die Mutter von Segelohr geht mit ihm wirklich durch dick und dünn, weil sie geschieden ist und sich immer schuldig fühlt. Darum hebt sie auch nie die Hand gegen Segelohr, damit sein Trauma nicht noch größer wird, das Fräulein Esperanza, die Schulpsychologin, bei ihm kurieren soll. Meine Mutter will auch nicht, dass ich mir Trauma einfange, aber sie ist eben nicht geschieden und deswegen verpasst sie mir ab und zu einen Klatscher, eine Spezialität von ihr. Ein Klatscher ist eine Art Ohrfeige, die dir eine Mutter oder, falls nicht vorhanden, irgendein anderer an ihrer Stelle verpasst, und zwar auf den Teil des menschlichen Körpers, der sich Nacken nennt. Ich sage das nicht, weil sie meine Mutter ist, aber ich versichere euch, dass sie diesen Schlag beherrscht wie keine Zweite.

Big Ear's mom is a whole lotta cool because she's divorced and since she feels guilty, she never chews our Big Ears. She doesn't want him to have an even bigger trauma than the one currently being cured by Miss Esperanza, our school psychologist. My mom doesn't want me to have traumas either, but since she's not divorced, every now and again she chews me out, which is her specialty.³⁷ It's not because she's my mom; the truth is, she's expert like no other.

As can be noted, on the one hand, the German version neutralizes the language of Elvira Lindo, since it loses almost all its humorous tone and certain colloquial turns of phrase, like *mola un pegote* (meaning "it's really cool"), which disappears in German with the expression "geht mit ihm wirklich durch dick und dünn", while the English 'whole lotta cool', which features on the back cover of the volume, maintains the essence of the original. On the other hand, the English version censors as politically incorrect the point of the smacks (*collejas*), which is partly suppressed.³⁸ In the German version, it is maintained, although the *colleja*, instead a smack on the back of the neck, becomes a neutral slap (*Ohrfeige*). Both versions are correct, however, in the tone and the colloquial register of the final reflection on the degree of slapping expertise that Manolito's mother seems to possess.

5. Conclusions

³⁷ The description of a 'colleja' (slap on the back of the neck) is censored by omission in the English version, with the consent of Elvira Lindo, because it is considered politically incorrect and unacceptable to the American public, especially to a child's one.

³⁸ Elvira Lindo herself has commented how she accepted that the English translation could introduce changes of this nature in order to be politically correct (Manolito can't give chocolate to his dog nor make fun of Chinese people, for instance). See also Joan Moriarty, "Las traductoras de Manolito Gafotas al inglés nos cuentan qué piensan de Manolito Gafotas", <http://www.manolitogafotas.es/entrevista>, accessed 18 October 2019.

Children's and young people's literature seems to be more open to greater manipulation than mass literature, maybe due to its educational and moralizing nature which publishers, following their ideals and objectives, seek to strengthen.

As we have shown, throughout the Spanish adaptation of *Hexe Lilli/Kika Superbruja*, a large number of modifications can be perceived, which make us question the legitimacy of its translational process. The resulting text is not only far from the original regarding both its language and culture, but also regarding the message the author sought to convey. The translator offers us a version that could be considered as a prototext, since adding new characters, as well as changing their roles, can be seen as the real creation of a new story that has nothing to do with the one published in the SL.

On the other hand, in the case of *Manolito Gafotas* women represent traditional roles, such as teachers, child psychologists, whimsical girls who drive boys crazy, and mothers who bring up their children on their own, either taking them to the psychologist or slapping them on the back of the neck (the traditional *collejas*), so commonplace in Spanish culture. In its translations into English and German, we find that those versions respect these roles which, in the end, the author parodies as a reflection of a society as patriarchal as the Spanish one.

In short, we witness a correct use of translation when Spanish is the source language, but its use as a manipulative tool when the target language is Spanish. This leads us to question the veracity of this latter translation, as well as the possible need for a new interpretation and translation of the works under study in order to adapt them to a social reality more in line with the current situation of the target culture.

Therefore, we can conclude with the following question: if it is possible to modify certain aspects of novels such as names, characters, front covers, illustrations or back covers, why not carry out a positive manipulation to favour the breakdown of gender marks and roles traditionally laid down by heteropatriarchy?

Crime and Gender as Popularised Discourse in Maureen Jennings' *A Journeyman to Grief*

Abstract: The article deals with the analysis of the novel *A Journeyman to Grief* (2007) by the contemporary Canadian writer Maureen Jennings with the aim to detect the occurrence of popularised samples of specialised knowledge and communication flanked by the evocative language of the Crime Fiction genre profiling literary womanhood. Handled by – or significantly referring to – female characters, the language is observed in order to comprehend the effectiveness and the compatibility of the different codes conveyed by the medium through a narrative perspective, which is linguistically entrusted to a gender-bound proficiency.

Besides, being the plot set in a fictional but plausible historical reconstruction of late XIX century Toronto, the observation includes the examination of discourse events within different communicative situations and the related criteria of perceptibility, familiarity and acceptability of the detechnified terminology transmitted. The linguistic study also considers the social roles embodied by the characters – most of them being male – in contrast with the profiles of the female heroes and villains on the scene and, in accordance with narrative stylistic praxes, with the stereotypes associated with femininity.

Keywords: *Canadian crime fiction, Maureen Jennings, popularisation, female emancipation*

And I'll leave you with my quirky little theory that at some level we intend everything we do.
That's why it's extremely important to root out our intentions before they uproot us.

Patricia Cornwell, *Scarpetta*

1. The crime fiction formula

Crime Fiction – as a literary genre – is one of the most prolific categories in the field of literature, thanks to the huge level of assimilability of its plots and structures with ample ranges of people's reading tastes. The intense rhythm of the narration, the captivating deployment of the characters involved with the vicissitudes described in the stories, and the divertable focuses are all features capable of moving from one recounting perspective to the other and charming the readership. Indeed, in adherence to Tzvetan Todorov's speculation on literary formulae, and extending it to the present field of investigation, this kind of narration wisely harnesses the coexistence of both *fable*, meant as the natural consequentiality attributed to the events exploitation, and *sujet*, that is instead the order according to which things are proposed or revealed during the plot articulation and depending on the dynamics activated by the author's narrative slant, toying with the readers' desires of guessing the alternation of storyline-bound contingencies (i.e. when narrating the story as to frame certain characters, whom are subsequently and unexpectedly found innocent in the finale).¹ Under such point of view, the highest level of appeal is reached when the two aspects of story and plot coincide and blend with each other, originating a *noir* (above all the other genres on detection, since peculiar suspense expedients) fictional narration, where the curiosity of the investigative disclosure and the suspense mould the foggy and perilous atmosphere page after page.

¹ Tzvetan Todorov, *Poétique de la prose* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1971), 12, https://monoskop.org/images/a/a5/Todorov_Tzvetan_Poetique_de_la_prose_1978.pdf, accessed 31 January 2019.

Further confirmation of what has been anticipated is found in the relationship that connects the genre itself and its audiences, whose diverse demands have largely contributed to reshaping the aims of this literary environment through a multifaceted prism projecting kaleidoscopic narrative *spectra*, thus also producing labels aplenty in the related nomenclature, that ranges from the *classic* Police Procedural to the North American Hard-Boiled consolidated modality.² Nonetheless, the genre identification is not only carried out by the thematic specialisation. Indeed, the narrative style of Crime Fiction (here intended as the polarising name for all the possible variants), presupposes its own textual typology, mainly descriptive of the facts and the scenarios set by the author, and its own structured patterns and schemata to be enacted by characterising heroes. As a consequence, the formulaic connotation of the fiction requires the presence of fixed protagonists such as the detective, a murderer, one or more victims, some witnesses, and a series of law enforcement employees, all metaphorically and stereotypically representing the incarnation of good purposes, evil intent, sacrifice, social values and morality, along with the efforts supportive of what is right, accordingly. Yet, the pace passing from one situation (and character's role) to the other is utterly rendered by the "aestheticizing of crime".³ There, the killings are introduced and subsequently dissected and re-constructed, in order to be described in detail through every clue and investigative progress for the final 'deconsecration' of the murderous impiety via the resolution of the case and the figuring of the *mens rea* in the epilogue.

1.1. The female character and Maureen Jennings' Canadian panorama

Notwithstanding the famous tradition of Crime Fiction male heroes ranging from ancient Edgar A. Poe's stories to late XIX century Sir. Arthur C. Doyle's Sherlock Holmes, from the 1920s Agatha Christie's Hercule Poirot and Raymond Chandler's Philip Marlowe (whose first appearance is dated 1934) to the 1953 Ian Fleming's creation of James Bond and many others, the female front on the matter likewise offers a representative amount of characters – although their more recent history in this panorama. The gleeful Miss Marple entered the scene about a decade later than her *sibling* (because of their mutual nature as Agatha Christie's literary creations) Poirot, based on "the sort of old lady who would have been rather like some of my step grandmother's Ealing cronies",⁴ as declared by Christie herself. After this pioneering female hero, a number of other protagonists solidly emerged in contemporary Crime Fiction works, like crime reporter Britt Montero (born from the pen of award-winning Edna Buchanan), the most contemporary Patricia Cornwell's Italian-American Kay Scarpetta or the strong-willed Tess Monaghan and the controversial Claire DeWitt, respectively by Laura Lippman and Sara Gran, above all.

The Canadian Crime Fiction genre, represented here by Maureen Jennings' narrative, adheres to the North American style (inclusive of sensational and explicit narrative forms like the aforementioned Hard-Boiled one; see §1) comfortably cast by particular thematic and linguistic emphases on the atrocity of the crimes perpetrated, and already displaying abundant lexicon related to 'blood', 'murder' and 'death' in their titles.⁵ Yet, one characterising peculiarity of her books resides in the diachronic dimension of the stories. Indeed, the entire collection of the Murdoch-based fictions is centred on the historiographic reconstruction of late XIX century Toronto, often roughly (also ironically) matching the limits of the contemporary 'Entertainment' and 'Discovery' Districts of the city, in some sort of inside

² The range is, without doubt, broader than the two labels mentioned, although a complete list is not discussed here since not pertaining to the topic of the issue. See Federico Pio Gentile, *La linguistica del delitto. Maureen Jennings e il caso di 'Poor Tom Is Cold', tra formulaicità e traduzione* (Trento: Tangram Edizioni Scientifiche, 2015), 20-42.

³ Earl F. Bagginier, *The Gentle Art of Murder: The Detective Fiction of Agatha Christie* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1980), 7.

⁴ Agatha Christie, *An Autobiography* (New York: Harper Collins, 2001), 449.

⁵ Martin Priestman, *The Cambridge Companion to Crime Fiction* (Cambridge: Cambridge U.P., 2003), 77.

joke connecting the writer and her audience via the urban geography of the plots articulation. Moreover, the decision of staging 'her' murders on the 1800 sunset (approximately between 1887 and 1917) let the writer and her creative production benefit from the nostalgic and romantic atmosphere of the time. The narrative expedients that she uses, introducing peculiar forensic techniques like fingerprinting and blood analysis as estrangement factors, are perfectly coherent with the "heyday of the 'Northern' and literary exploration of Canada's remote ... frontiers ... when Canadian crime writing began to flourish" along with its culture and scientific knowledge.⁶

As described, the Crime Fiction genre inclination is to maintain a fixed narrative scheme, which presupposes the recurrence of a given number of antithetical characters that cannot disregard the presence of a detective and killer(s), cops and citizens, victims and witnesses. Consequently – and unlike her aforementioned colleagues – Maureen Jennings' books concentrate on the vicissitudes of preponderant male characters, where the female ones mostly represent vivid sidekicks. Hinging upon the Detective William Murdoch,⁷ other secondary characters belong to police precinct of Station Four, such as constable George Crabtree, and chief Thomas Brackenried, the former being a simple officer with huge admiration towards Murdoch, the latter a Scottish, stubborn and atheist man. Nonetheless, an emblematic and crucial role is then played by the coroner, Julia Ogden, a pathologist in a skirt wandering amid crowded crime scenes and more private handlings of nude male corpses. Julia, thus, results a female doctor allowed in the Victorian chauvinist realm build upon the patriarchal 'Angel in the house' ideology that sensibly contrasts with the association of the stereotype of women's fragility with forensic method professionalism delving into the brutality of death, despite mirroring historical data reporting women practising the medical profession at the time.⁸

Besides the presence of particular individuals within Maureen Jennings' plots, another fundamental element of the Crime Fiction is, of course, the accomplishment of violent deeds through killings, whose detailed reports are promised to be transposed via narrative schemata. Hence, the entire construction of the pattern has to undergo a coherent criterion of formulation, that in *the Murdoch Mysteries* already consists in the provision of subtle investigative details disseminated all over the book(s) and driving the reader's thoughts towards some precise storyline interpretations of certain elements (e.g. obscured clues, red herrings, misdirection). Indeed, considering the title of the volume, *A Journeyman to Grief* (2007),⁹ referencing Shakespeare's *Richard II*, the reader could see the connection between death, killing methods and revenge issues recounted in the plot. There, a black female protagonist is kidnapped and sold as a slave in the U.S. in the beginning of the century. Thirty years later, once she has managed to escape and retrieve some pieces of information about the men who had traded her, she arrives in Canada with a friend to carry out her merciless punishment.

2. Gendered discourses and popularisation in Maureen Jennings' *A Journeyman to Grief*

As anticipated, the text analysed in this paper deals with paybacks, whose fulfilment is strictly connected to the consummation of some criminal perpetrations implying murders. Despite the already perceivable

⁶ Jeannette Sloniowski and Marilyn Rose, *Detecting Canada: Essays on Canadian Crime Fiction, Television and Film* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier U.P., 2014), 22.

⁷ "Inspired by a real Toronto detective named John Wilson Murray [whom] became Toronto's first full-time 'government Detective Officer' in 1875" and that – just like the fictional hero – used to resort to advanced techniques such as fingerprinting and blood analyses for the carrying out of homicide solutions (at the end of his career, the man published a romanticised collection of cases under the title of *Memoirs of a Great Detective*, which the Murdoch Mysteries could clearly be compared to). Erin Frey, "Murdoch Mysteries", *The Canadian Encyclopedia* (2017), <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/murdoch-mysteries>, accessed 3 February 2019.

⁸ See Dorothy Wilson, *Lone Woman: The Story of Elizabeth Blackwell, the First Woman Doctor* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1970); Jo Manton, *Elizabeth Garrett Anderson* (London: Methuen, 1965).

⁹ All the examples are retrieved in Maureen Jennings, *A Journeyman to Grief* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 2010 [2007]).

tension simmered by Maureen Jennings' plot and the intensity of the title itself, the narrative pathos grows even denser where the contemporary readers find themselves projected about one hundred and thirty years in the past, in the literary reconstruction of a recognisable Toronto. There, the textual attention displayed in relation to social habits and ideologies has to face visible disparities in comparison with the present situation, and the narration is required to adhere with most old-fashion customs in order to maintain its plausibility, avoiding the story to deflect in direction of a Crime Fiction *uchronia* (also referring to the binomial 'woman'/'professional') that would propose anachronistic and improbable contingencies. According to a similar perspective, the novelist had preliminarily turned *herself* into a detective as well and investigated coherent old police methodologies, forensic procedures and medical awareness matching potential assassination cases to be harked back to the XIX century Canadian social organisation, customs, political configuration, and communicative proficiency, which could have long been given up or fallen in disuse.

Moreover, notwithstanding the abundance of possible knowledge and the related linguistic formulations, the present examination does not consider the totality of the linguistic and (detechnified specialised) discourse instances retrievable in the book, since its focus is mainly oriented towards the Female Discourse (and its assimilation into the literary descriptive style), thus aiming at comprehending the expressiveness and the technification levels attributable to the language (both common and specialised) and contextualised communication iterated by women. To that extent, it is worth noting that specialised knowledge conveyance does not coincide with specialised language/discourse usages in any case and, much less, in the literary context, where, in light of numerous "easification" strategies,¹⁰ narrations only admit procedural recounts in place of highly specialised and obscure terminology especially when involving the Legal and Medical domains. In light of that, the entire Crime fiction expressive universe inclusive of specialised discourse irrevocably needs to undergo a popularisation process as "a vast class of various types of communicative events or genres that involve the transformation of specialised knowledge into 'everyday' or 'lay' knowledge, as well as the recontextualisation of scientific discourse".¹¹ This *unspecialised* reflection of terminological and discourse patterns serves the goal of indiscriminately reaching any reading audience by circumventing the danger of whatsoever unwanted unclarity, notwithstanding the presence of 'imagined',¹² (in the acceptance of fictionalised) professional expressive and communicative fields to be recounted. Nonetheless, if nowadays Specialised Discourses display some formal and stabilised-in-use lexical, morphological, and syntactic skeleta, it is also worth noting that the backdating narrative procedure adopted by Jennings has to cover some deconstructive paths, where popularisation techniques do not *merely* represent aforesaid easification strategies and also incarnate the involutory history of precise terms linguistically re-projected backwards in the 1800 days. Consequently, the observation of some given passages, here, consists in the individuation of dawning terms (because of the pre-dated historical setting) contributing to conveying some professional *knowledge* and *expertise* managed by, or befalling, femininity and premising – in the *fin-de-siècle* context – the development of future linguistic needs.

On the same level, also the themes discussed mirror a narrative and historical representation of Torontonians along with the related urban context and social praxes, thus contextualising the events not only in a fixed and symbolic area of the city (see §1), but introducing characters' attitudes towards gender and race perspectives implying the socio-linguistic relationship with male preponderance and ethics issues such as slavery.

¹⁰ Ruth Breeze et al., eds., *Interpersonality in Legal Genres* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2014), 171-177.

¹¹ Helena Calsamiglia and Teun A. van Dijk, "Popularisation Discourse and Knowledge about the Genome", *Discourse & Society*, 15.4 (2004), 370, https://www.upf.edu/pctacademy/_docs/popularization_discourse.pdf, accessed 27 February 2019.

¹² Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities, Reflection on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London and New York: Verso, 1983 [2006]).

It is clear that, given the appealing goal wanted by the authorial style, not all the situations proposed in the book are ascribable to certain areas of specialisation and, in many cases, the narration can only lend itself to the charm of intense descriptions:

Example 1

This morning, she'd woken to find him sitting on the edge of the bed, looking at her. He had kissed her fiercely. "Today, I want you to wear your blue silk gown, your largest crinoline, and your big hat with peacock feathers. You will be the belle of the promenade" (2).

The language adopted, then, immediately displays a highly evocative approach finalised at rendering the *retro* atmosphere summoned by the story via listing the major characterising frills at disposal of women at the intended time when the story is set. Moreover, in order to bestow a more fashionable and backdated factor on the plot and really capture the readers' enthusiasm, some peculiar lexical choices are proposed (example 1). The phrase 'belle of the promenade' refers to the XVII century 'belle of the ball' one, used for indicating the most attractive woman of a *soiree*, being noticed since the very moment of her entrance in the room, and where the French 'promenade' meant the march performed to participate in the ceremonious opening of a ball to join it: a phrase that appears to be one preferred figurative expression in the XIX century as well.¹³ In this very opening of the book, women are not talkative individuals at all. They merely represent a stereotypical representation of the male as overpowering, directive and authoritative. The female character, here, is still not perceived as a human being (much less a professional capable of handling any – specialised – discourse) but as an object of the gaze devoid of any other aspect. Nonetheless, in line with the style of narration, the related happening contrasts with such gentle description, which suddenly guides to a climax once the woman attends her date and finds someone else waiting for her:

Example 2

In a ghastly parody of an embrace, he crushed her against his chest so that her hat was almost knocked off her head, her nose and mouth were smothered, and she couldn't breathe. She felt herself being carried to the carriage and thrust inside.

There was another man within whom she couldn't see because she was shoved to the floor face down and at the same time something was stuffed in her mouth (3-4).

The courting addressed to such a nameless and yet striking woman gets shuttered by the abduction. The oxymoronic hug is not the one she is supposed to receive from her husband, as it resolves into the unexpected and enchainning grip of a kidnapper (example 2) taking the *belle* away from her *feast* (example 1). There, a vivid gender-based violence language emerges to emphasise the oppressing physicality of the male bruisers – *crushing*, *knocking off*, *smothering*, *thrusting* and *shoving* the female 'body' inside the coach and to the floor, and then *suffocating* and *gagging* their victim – against the defenselessness of the female character within just five lines.

Yet, the writing strategy deployed to present the situation at the beginning of the book also seems to be the pivotal event contextualising the story. Through the pages, the woman's name happens to be discovered together with her ethnicity when, about thirty years after the abduction, the African-American Emeline Talbert finds herself travelling to Toronto from the U.S. to accomplish her revenge against the black man, Thomas, and the white one, Daniel – her father and husband, respectively – for having sold her as a slave at the age of seventeen once she has found the proofs of such abomination (example 3). A similar expedient leads to the articulation of a multilayered storyline simultaneously narrating the present

¹³ "Definition of 'promenade'", *The Collins Dictionary*, <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/promenade>, accessed 27 February 2019.

and the past, and gendered perspectives shifting from slavery domestic contexts to murderous acts and from medical examinations to investigative slants. Here, the evocative power of the literary style and its formulae trickle in diverse communicative situations involving the recurrence of as many codes and linguistic patterns, blending and merging with each other. This hybridisation process allows receivers to access a kaleidoscopic dimension where natural language and specialised communication coexist, mediated by literary techniques relating to Crime Fiction.

On a content level, the seemingly romantic narration of the arrangement of the date (example 1), is without doubt far from being a tender meeting. Womanhood is presented in its frippery, whose vanity is shown off via garnishments such as ample gowns and feathers picturing the image of a naïve peacock. The beauty and the elegance of the female character, to that extent, incorporate some sort of sin of vanity that is literarily and immediately *punished* through the kidnapping, by a male gaze only interested in the external appearance of a similar soulless puppet (under the slaver's perspective). Indeed, the husband himself took care of *telling* his wife what to dress, in order to make sure the accomplices would have recognised the woman right away. From the abstractness of the incipit – women as personified beauty – only a few lines further the text moves on to the morbid immanence of femininity – where woman equals ware:

Example 3

Know by all these present that I, James Prescott, of the country of Guildwood and the State of Maryland have this day delivered to Mrs. Catherine Dickie of the city of Baltimore, a negro slave woman aged seventeen years old, named Lena, for the sum of four hundred dollars and the right and title to said woman I warrant and defend now and forever. I also warrant her to be sound and healthy of meek character although inclined to be fanciful. She can read and write.

Signed and dated this twenty-eight day of August, 1858 (173).

In this first part of the story, the novelist chooses to relegate the female body and consciousness (due to her slavery condition) to the class of *things*, being objects to be glared, bought, sold, or exchanged rather than active subjects,¹⁴ unless they belonged to the ethnically dominant upper-class, which had the economic power to afford slavery (although, even in that case, the woman buying the 'negro slave' maid, despite having finances, was constricted in the domesticity of her household).

The example reported above constitutes a trustworthy reproduction of an old-fashion brief contract, where the essence of the Legal Discourse – rather than the terminology – is conveyed by the employment of some sectorial phraseology characterised by declarative and denotative aims, which grant the document its formality. The initial statement, 'Know by all these present that I', is intended to remark the legal requirement to drafting and signing contracts whose validity is sustained *in-praesentia* by all the Parts (as they are termed today) acting within the situation as participants (contractor and contractee) and witnesses, along with the provision of their personal information (name, surname, qualification, nationality, place of origin, residence; see also example 4). The drafting focus is not univocal as it varies in compliance with the role exerted by the Part who actually and predominantly establishes the trade, then the ego-targeted strategy recurring here ('that I ... have this day delivered') refers to the seller, yet might be accordingly subverted to the buyer's point of view with reference to some alternative formulae, such as in example 4, where the seller becomes a passive actor:

¹⁴ The fiction refers to a black female character kidnapped at the beginning of the XIX century in North America and escaped from her agony thirty years later – although no reference to the underground railroad is clearly mentioned – to track down her original tyrants all the way to Canada. Indeed, slavery abolition worked quite better in Canada, where such trade was formally given up in 1833, and many slaves started seeking refuge there to emancipate. Consequently, it is worth noting that by 1865, when the 13th amendment abolished slavery throughout the U.S., African-American women underwent plenty of torments as victims of both racism and sexism. See Deborah Gray White, "Jezebel and Mammy: The Mythology of Female Slavery", in Joseph F. Healey and Eileen O'Brien, eds., *Race, Ethnicity and Gender: Selected Readings* (Los Angeles: Pine Forge Press, 2007), 124-132.

Example 4

Purchased *from* Thomas Talbert, Esquire, for the sum of 200 dollars. The Livery, 27 Mutual Street. Including the six horses and three carriages and all the tack presently in use. Also the present feed as stated.

Signed. Daniel Cooke

Eleventh day of October 1863. at Toronto. Acknowledged as stated, Thomas Talbert (77, *italics is mine*).

Moreover, considering the commercial nature of the exchange, the document – and thus the language conveyed – could be read as part of a border area malleably separating the Legal Discourse from the Economics field, extending its dominion and the possibility of contemporaneously labelling it as *contract* and *invoice*. Such contextual pluralism is also sanctioned by the paramount importance given to the description of the *merchandise* to be traded. In example 3, the female character, then, is dehumanised and treated like a piece of furniture or an animal utterly comparable to the horses mentioned in example 4: her features and physical traits ('negro slave woman aged seventeen ... she can read and write') are listed on a par with a pedigree, and her being 'sound and healthy of meek character although inclined to be fanciful' resembles the description of a tamed mare temper while being entrusted to another owner. Further comparisons between Emeline and domestic beasts, besides the obvious duties of a slave, also formally emerge with the process of re-naming her, since readers are acquainted to know the character as Lena – the name attributed to the protagonist by her first owner and maintained by Mr. Prescott as well – for the best part of the novel, until the name she was actually christened with, and subsequently forced to relinquish, is revealed together with her origin.

Yet, being the book a Crime Fiction it is clear that the relevance of social and ethics speculations is only secondary to the prominence given to the articulation of storylines involving murderous lexical contexts of narration:

Example 5

The man's blue eyes were open and staring and he was naked from the waist up, his back criss-crossed with livid marks. Blood had clotted along the lines and pooled at his waist. Buzzing flies fed greedily on the wounds ...

Murdoch placed the back of his hand against the dead man's cheek. The skin retained some warmth. Gently, he turned Cooke's jaw to side. It moved easily.

"He hasn't been dead long at all. No rigor mortis and he's not completely cold" (23-4).

The Julia Ogden character, a forensic specialist, is introduced in the very first pages of the text and associated with her great interest in medicine, emphasising her participation in different events and conventions. However, when assassinations occur, the discovery of the body and preliminary forensic examinations of corpses are prerogative of men (example 5). In light of this, it is always Murdoch, who finds the cadaver and sketches out its position on his notebook also listing any interesting details of it, and inspects the remaining specificities of the crime scene. The detective is the one that is narratively deemed to assess the heat and the elasticity of the body to deduct a possible range of time of the killing (example 5) before proceeding with further considerations. There, every description is rendered by means of the North American style fierce lexicon (see §1) implementing some commonsense conjectures revealing the basics of the forensic discipline.

However, it is worth noting that the reader's appetite would not be whet by these limited – even though fascinating – descriptions, hence the need to introduce the contextualised *pernicious* character of the female character of the coroner, whose role is to search not only the nudity, but also the viscera of

the dead, with a cannibalistic eagerness for pieces of evidence to be extorted from the male *patient's* everlasting silence:¹⁵

Example 6

“I’ll need the scalpel first.”

He proceeded to make an incision across the top of Cooke’s head from ear to ear. He pulled back the scalp ... Broske sawed through the skull, removed the dome, put it in a dish, severed the nerves, then lifted out the brain, which was the size of his fist ... He spoke with such yearning and reverence that Murdoch was astonished. As for Dr. Ogden she was staring at Broske transfixed (96-7).

Example 7

He grasped the muscular cold piece of meat that had once served Daniel Cooke to utter words of many hues and tugged it out of the way until the professor had removed the pharynx, larynx, and the upper esophagus and examined them.

“No blockage anywhere. No bruising on the carotid arteries. He wasn’t strangled or suffocated. He did vomit, but it did not get swallowed so his air passages are clear ... We’re nearing the end. Let’s take out the bladder and urethra. They have emptied, which is quite normal with sudden death. I’ll do the stomach next, Miss Julia. A ligature, if you please” (98-99).

The three main communicative actors – the detective, the coroner, and the male *helper* – participate in the banquet where human flesh and bones are sliced and served in *dishes* (example 6),¹⁶ like main courses nourishing them with different amounts of information whose apprehension suddenly leaves the *commensals* bewildered: the detective, because of the unmatching softness of Broske’s tone against the crudity of the happening, the coroner elated by the context (example 6). Further terminology and specialised knowledge may be apprehended during the dissection.

The procedure, indeed, informs receivers about the fundamental anatomy of human heads, made of different layers of skin (scalp) separating the surface from the skull containing the brain and all the nerves, about the terms used to denote specific tools (scalpel) and portions of the body (scalp, skull, dome, pharynx, larynx, esophagus, carotid, bladder, urethra, stomach), and about organ dimensions (‘which was the size of his fist’; which is clearly not Specialised Discourse in the strict sense, anyhow could represent a popularisation gloss, in adherence with the poor terminology of XIX century dawning Medical language) and precise and standardised operations required for the accomplishment of the exam (‘first I need the scalpel’; ‘make an incision across the top of [the] head from ear to ear’). The Forensic discipline is here also represented by the detailed description of the examination (example 7). The formality of the professional context is rendered through other popularising techniques entrusting praxis conjectures to Broske’s direct speech divulging some physiological knowledge through sensational explanations. The rough description of the trachea (‘the muscular cold piece of meat that had once served Daniel Cooke to utter words’, example 7) is followed by the list of all the connected organs eradicated from the corpse one by one. Other glosses explain the lack of suffocation in adherence to the status of

¹⁵ The statement provocatively transposes coroner’s tasks with the readerships’ curiosity for death. Cultures traditional respect for death and corpses imposes (especially in the Western world) the societal custom of grieving privately, treating death like some sort of taboo to be delivered from the public domain. Thus, the female pathologist searching the inner parts of a nude body opposite to her ample audience represents a sensational act of de-consecration implementing the striking attitude of the recount. See also Helaine Selin and Robert M. Rakoff, eds., *Death Across Cultures* (Berlin: Springer, 2019).

¹⁶ Despite the clearly terminological acceptance of ‘dish’ as the stainless tray where tools and body reports are set (in Medicine), in this commentary it also is allegorically read in support of what has been described in note 14. Indeed, despite the monoreferential aim of Specialised Discourse terminology, the perusal of any occurrence in the text has to be interpreted in line with the evocative power of the Literary style as well, and even with the eventuality that the readership could miss the actual link between the word ‘dish’ and the term ‘dish’, sticking with the lay communication level.

carotid arteries and 'air passages', and the emptiness of the bladder and urethra, which are common clues of 'sudden death'.

While roles are often fixed in the Crime Fiction formula, it is also worth noting that Jennings breaks with this stereotype. Where, generally speaking, detectives beat the streets in want of criminals, coroners are mainly kept in sombre morgues and helpers are only secondary characters, here Murdoch relinquishes his law enforcement qualification to become the sidekick, the helper is 'promoted' to impersonate the coroner tangibly conducting the forensic examination and giving instructions. Eventually (and unexpectedly), the coroner is demeaned to a mere third wheel (Dr. Ogden is even called 'Miss Julia') merely useful to stitch back up the body in the end (example 7).

Not limited to the *purely* Medical Discourse, a similar language would also be conveyed through the use of collocations ('questionable death', 41), or with hints of multidisciplinary occurrences. Biochemistry ('the blood was mammalian', 'small per cent of chloral ... water, and 10 per cent of solution of cocaine', 245) is detected via specific adjectival usages and nominalisation strategies avoiding verbal syntagms typical of Scientific Discourses –¹⁷ according to the known principle of linguistic economy –, to flank the deductive slant of the detective and help him to solve cases via the dissemination of specialised details at different levels of informativity throughout the narration. Along with the Forensic methods (displaying analyses on weapon trajectories, partial prints, and tissue exams), the space given to popularised Scientific Discourse in the book, allows it to range across even more areas of pertinence. As a consequence, a reader would find traces of Diagnostics ('manifestations', 'palpitations, shortness of breath, pallor, trembling, flight, sometimes immobility', 6; 'pupils ... would no doubt dilate, and the inspirations of your breath would be curtailed', 8) through identifiable terms and statements explaining the manifestation of certain symptoms. Anatomy is provided by means of explicative glosses useful in the divulging perspective ('he who also had six fingers, hexadactylis', 404), and widespread phrases recuperating dead languages formal eloquence or technicality, such as the Latinate '*in situ*', '*post mortem*' (42), and '*rigor mortis*' (24). Some more derivational terminology examples on the matter include 'exanguination' (41) – from Latin 'ex-sanguis', to bleed out – or the already-mentioned Graecism 'hexadactylis' (404) – the adjective for hexadactyly (or more generally polydactyly) from the Greek 'esa-daktylos', six-fingers, along with other already noted terms (example 7).

Just like in examples 1 and 2, the prominence of the literary style expressiveness is transmitted by the evocative description of various passages leaping from one narrative context to another, where fragments of sectorial knowledge are inserted. Although, even in those divulging interactions, some witty comments are often funnelled to break the formality of the detechnified discourse and catch the reader's platitude with some subjective and stereotyped remarks or flirtation descriptions:

Example 8

It was Julia Ogden's turn to look embarrassed. "I suppose I was so caught up in Dr. Broske's lecture that I heard it as 'fright'. I'm sorry, professor. I have brought you here under false pretences".

... Murdoch watched this exchange in astonishment. The prim doctor of formidable intellect was behaving like a coy young girl. As for Broske, he was speaking to her as if she were an object of great attraction. Dr. Ogden! (39)

The uncompromising pathologist, whose life is solidly devoted to laboratory examinations and surgery schedules, used to death like the male forensic doctor, suddenly happens to lose her lucidity in presence of her attractive male-colleague, with great scorn by Murdoch. Thus, despite the highly emancipated portray of Julia, she once more represents the stereotypical literary *cliché* of a female character ready to renounce anything for love's sake: even forgetting her professionalism and focused competence.

¹⁷ See Michael A.K. Halliday and James R. Martin, *Writing Science: Literacy and Discursive Power* (London: Falmer, 1993).

A similar contingency is also linguistically transcoded via the reference pattern involving the two characters of the example. On the one hand, the male socio-linguistic predominance of paramount characters constantly risks adumbrating the effectiveness of Julia's presence on the scene. For that reason, every mention of the female character is only made via the collocation of the surname, Ogden (and almost never including the name too), with her professional and ungendered label of 'Dr.', as to legitimise – rather than actually qualify – her existence (example 6), potentially having the interlocutors confusing Julia with her father, Dr. Uzziel Ogden. Subsequently, the minute she blossoms off her social role to incarnate her womanhood, Julia seems to betray her imposed a-sexuality, being linguistically deprived of her professionalism and title (example 8: 'It was Julia Ogden's turn to look embarrassed'; see also example 7, where the polite 'Miss Julia' also increases the distance between Broske, as medical examiner, and Dr. Ogden, become – there – some sort of extra character on the scene). Here, accordingly, Murdoch thinks of an untold reprimand to be addressed to his esteemed acquaintance, reminding her of the necessary condition of her legitimacy ('Dr. Ogden!'). The same observation could be applied to the other doctor, the male one. Broske is always mentioned by surname as well as Julia. Nonetheless, the man is never associated with his qualification since his professionalism has not to be proven within the social bubble their interactions take place. The only occasion when Broske is defined via his qualification, indeed, is when Julia's feelings are discovered (example 8), in order to create even more separation between the two characters, yet still not re-evaluating the man but narratively *punishing* the other protagonist.

On the other hand, despite Dr. Ogden's qualities and expertise – she is a 'prim doctor of formidable intellect' (example 8) –, in *A Journeyman to Grief* Julia is declassified to a mere observer (thus a female *voice*). In light of the importance of her role, the character never passively accepts her destiny to fall back towards the 'Angel in the house' ideology as she considers her feelings as part of her personality along with her technical skills. On the linguistic point of view (within this medical context) the doctor-*ess* is described as 'staring' (example 6), 'telling' or *looking* 'embarrassed' and 'behaving ... coy' (example 8), in fact, never *performing* any crucial activities.

The only case when she seems to embrace an active-agent role is where she points out some observations to Murdoch ('I see he has also suffered a blow to his head on the top left side, however, it looks superficial. However, I won't know until I open up his skull ...', 41). Even in this situation, Dr. Ogden's performativity is limited to a voyeuristic attitude of *focus-softening* ('I see', 'it looks like'), and her thoughts hardly ever turn into motion; even the '*I open up the skull*' *monogloss* statement is not realised, since the autopsy is materially conducted by Broske:¹⁸

Example 9

Cooke was wearing flannel underwear, which Broske pulled off.

"Ah look at that." He poked at the flaccid penis. "I'd say the man had at least one bout with venereal disease, wouldn't you, Miss Julia?"

She leaned forward to take a look, and Broske cradled Cooke's member in his hand.

"Yes, indeed. That's quite a scar. A large chancre".

"He must have contracted it some time ago, it's not recent. So far, I don't see any other signs of syphilis, but we'll see more when we open up his brain ..." (95-6).

Still, the heroine's relevance (once more *declassified* to 'Miss' Julia in place of 'Doctor' by her male colleague) remains inasmuch as her remarks represent the actual carriers of most popularised terminological values within the dialogues. Indeed, while other male protagonists like Murdoch or Broske habitually start interacting as they notice something according to a more divulging approach to

¹⁸ Under the Appraisal Linguistic Framework perspective. See James R. Martin and Peter R.R. White, *The Language of Evaluation: Appraisal in English* (Houndmills: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005).

generic considerations (example 9: 'at least one bout with venereal disease'), Julia's preciseness resides in the relished examples of the specialised lexicon she offers: where Broske finds bouts of an unidentified venereal disease, the term 'chance' introduced by the female doctor allows the utter identification of the illness, which had affected the man before dying by the observation of the cadaver's penis (although never touching it). Besides the lexical dimension, also the contextual one draws further observations. It is worth noting that the possibility of practising the medical profession in the XIX century was a hard bargain for women, not only because of social prejudices but also because to them it meant having to deal with diseases, nudity and death, which did not exactly comply with the morality and the ideal standards of the Victorian Era (see §1).¹⁹ On the contrary, possibly because of her upper-class origin and the professional career of her father, Dr. Ogden is not just totally emancipated: she seems perfectly comfortable with similar topics as well – or at least, more at ease than many of the men witnessing the scene.

Nonetheless, the doctor is not the only female character in the story. Departing from the Medical communicative situation, a meaningful feminine relevance is provided in the narration via the descriptions of plot events that subvert the stereotypes relating to women as the fairer sex or preferred victims. William's discontent about Julia's flirtation is not definitive, as her reputation and reliability are not really endangered by her personal choices, yet she remains a strong-willed female character whose stamina is uncommon to many men. Moreover, despite the detective being a male character as the rest of police enforcement individuals, those who confront themselves with death and *win*, are all women. Men mostly die in *A Journeyman to Grief*, killed by female ruthless assailants in male disguise, and their wives accordingly survive to recount the events:

Example 10

"Could you describe the revolver to me, Mrs. Cooke?"

"I certainly can. We discussed at length which was the best for his purpose. He finally decided for a bulldog, thirty-two calibre. It was nickel-plated and had a rubber stock (55).

Example 11

"Yes, I thought of that. Perhaps Cooke died too soon for his attacker to use it. Or he already knew Cooke had a weak heart. The disturbing thing, George, is that according to Dr. Ogden and her friend Professor Broske, some of the lashes were administered after Cooke was dead ... Did somebody hate Cooke that much? Or are we dealing with a lunatic?" (134)

Hence, the totality of the victims consists of men annihilated by their revengeful Nemesis, for having failed fundamental social values like family and love, and consequentially humiliated by the assassination rite (example 11). Once more, those who remain alive after such wrath are only women, which used to live in the shadow of shameful men, and whose cold blood manifests in their proficiency and knowledge pertaining to the instruments of death that caused their marital demise, like Mrs. Cooke describing the minutiae of her husband's weapon. In example 10, not only it is evident that the man had discussed with his wife the best option on the matter of guns before buying one (demonstrating the woman's proficiency in the field), also Mrs. Cooke lends herself to a semi-specialised description of the

¹⁹ Elizabeth Blackwell was the first woman in history to achieve an M.D. degree from an American Medical School in 1849. After her, another Elizabeth, whose surname was Garrett Anderson became the first woman in the Anglosphere to qualify as both physician and surgeon after the promulgation of the 1876 Medical Act. Nonetheless, the pioneering professional Frances Gertrude McGill is known as one of the first Canadian pathologist and criminologist in history, graduating at the University of Manitoba in 1915. See "Dr. Elizabeth Blackwell", *Changing the Face of Medicine*, https://cfmedicine.nlm.nih.gov/physicians/biography_35.html; "Elizabeth Garrett Anderson (1836-1917)", *Brought to Life: Exploring the History of Medicine*, <http://broughttolife.sciencemuseum.org.uk/broughttolife/people/elizabethgarrettanderson>; "Celebrating Women's Achievements: Dr. Frances Gertrude McGill", *Library and Archives Canada*, <https://www.collectionscanada.gc.ca/women/030001-1417-e.html>, accessed 19 September 2019.

firearm via the explication of its slang name ('bulldog'), the internal diameter of the gun barrel bore (thirty-two calibre), materials and grip ('nickel-plater and had a rubber stock').

Thus, the sole female character murdered is a casualty, sacrificed for the survival of the two black women escaping from slavery, and whose decease is unimportant because of her intrinsic racism. Eventually, the relentless killers are discovered to be Emeline and her friend Faith – each of them betrayed, sold, mistreated, abused, and starved, but – finally ran away from their tyrants, and satisfied by *rightful* acts of vengeance by killing the first men who started this case of slave-trade. Women in literature are often associated with subtle deeds like poisoning²⁰ when it comes to homicides, although Jennings prefers to unleash their rage physically in ways that have a brutal connotation usually enacted by male villains. For that reason, investigators speak about assassins via masculine references throughout the whole narration (example 11), and the murderers themselves disguise their identities vanishing from crime scenes dressing in male clothes to swindle potential casual observers ('He may be wearing a fedora and long mackintosh. Be careful. He is dangerous', 395). Similar stereotypisations of cruelty and death to be associated with the male realm, thus represent a useful misdirection employed by female killers (and by the author) during the articulation of the plot. The muscular structure and the strength acquired by Faith when she was a slave are then shown off when the female character hangs the first victim to whip him, or when she punishes her second one through what she calls the Spanish stoop (Murdoch himself undergoes such torture as well). Faith's physique and her camouflage usefully serve the purpose and let the woman be mistaken for a man, nonetheless only the brutality of the actions is performatively delivered to resemble a masculine consummation, while the mental ideation of the plan needs to remain feminine (and avenge years of domestic abuses). Emeline's friend materially accomplishes the assassination in men's clothes outdoor, and yet the minutiae of the murderous projects are thought by the perpetrators in the cozy corner of their hotel room, protected by the innocence their unsuspected female bodies.

However, it is also true that, by narrative praxis, the formula of the Crime Fiction novel demands culprits to be caught no matter what, once approaching the end of the story and having identified them with certainty:

Example 12

The doctor who had examined her immediately placed Emeline Talbert in the infirmary. She was not going to live long enough to go to trial, so Judge Rose was content to accept her supposed confession and leave things as they stood. The wondrous thing was that when the story had been reported in the newspapers in all its lurid details, Mrs. Archer had gone to visit her. "God in His infinite Wisdom has given her punishment enough," she said. "It is not for me to judge her" (428).

In conclusion, the dramatisation of crimes, of course, presupposes the arresting of perpetrators in the epilogue, although no man's society (intended here as referring to societal chauvinism) is permitted to tame women's legitimacy (meant as femininity), here. The female killer has recently slaughtered Mrs. Archer's husband. Nonetheless, this latter character offers her some sympathetic mercy ('God ... has given her punishment enough. It's not for me to judge her', example 12) – ennobling womanhood, possibly in contrast with more cynical male hopes. Protected by Emeline's devotion, Faith exits the story as a perpetual (but free) runaway, while the older woman, despite being arrested, peacefully lives in her own mental prison, occasionally comforted by a sympathetic visiting-Murdoch: her justifiable and true punishment can only be divine, like the stomach cancer she suffers from, and law is – for the first time – put aside because (narratively) *unworthy* of condemning Emeline in light of the chastises she has already suffered (example 12).

²⁰ Lisa Downing, "Murder in the Feminine: Marie Lafarge and the Sexualisation of the Nineteenth-century Criminal Woman", *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, 18.1 (2009), 121-137.

3. Conclusions

In adherence to what discussed in the present article, literary contexts – and especially Crime Fiction renditions – can often be considered as apt examples of linguistic patterns blending different usages, ranging from natural contexts to diverse specialised discourse domains, with as many expressive and communicative situations and registers (also related to multiple levels of technicality involving cases of terminological conveyance of the irrevocable need for detechnification). The evocative power of the language of literature is capable of enchanting its receivers, capturing their attention to the last page of the stories. Under the point of view of Police narratives, this tendency is translated into the proposition of vivid formulations whose dominant colours are the black (or the *noir*) surrounding dark atmospheres where cruel deeds are being performed, and the red of the blood staining the hands of individuals pursuing their own interests in the grip of emotions.

Moreover, those vivid plots and contents are formulated through the deployment of specific pieces of information and knowledge via a mixture of highly evocative forms and different codes belonging to diverse communicative areas that facilitate heterogeneous contextualisations and narrative shifts. Those languages and styles are administered to large audiences by means of plain language descriptions often alternated to specialised discourse of terminological hints mostly in their popularised capacity and according to a gender perspective that lets women speak or perform their acts in certain ways that (in many cases) contrast with the male preponderance XIX century societal cliché.

The case study proposed has focused on the observation of linguistic situations acting as catalysts for the emersion of diverse communicative contexts ranging from the aesthetics of *pure* narration to the deployment of police procedural forensic methodologies and mental patterns to be expressed and articulated, along with further socio-linguistic implicatures over community structures and ethics issues about slavery, the definition of emotional and physiological differentiation, and Gender perspectives to be considered.

The *spectrum* of the linguistic occurrences retrieved in *A Journeyman to Grief* (2007) is, without doubt, ample on the lexical point of view – as much as the variety of terminological findings to be assessed. Even so, given the mass-oriented nature of the book along with its narrative and recreational (non-didactic) purpose, it would be misleading to attribute the lexicon of the work an utterly specialised value of high technicality but it would clearly be correct to refer to such a language expressiveness as to a good example of authorial efforts simplifying terminological occurrence needs towards a lay divulgation level. To that extent, the appraisable bits of evidence investigated here are indeed valid and worthy of consideration, although they only belong to a dimension of knowledge transferability, since the primary intent of such analysis was to understand and formally attest the presence and the plausible coexistence of natural language formulations with terminological content-enriched contexts, merging the denotative qualities of this latter type of communication to the connoted and aesthetic features of women's literary formulations.

Yet, a similar goal could have not been carried out regardless of the partial narrative techniques highlighting perspectival observation spots onto the XIX century historically reconstructed society and urban fabric of Toronto. The historical description of the city, however, contrasts the language actually used by M. Jennings, which is contemporary, although without resulting anachronistic or originating fractures between the narration and the mode, yet considering eventual idiosyncrasies separating current linguistic schemata from past structures. The speculations, then, have not only involved potential language adaptations to fit the uses of the Era, in a like manner they have also discussed the critical portrayal of inter-gender relationships and disparities stressed out by the author's preliminary historiographic study preceding the writing. The results of such research outline the feminine *silhouette* of a self-made female character outstanding and refusing the common-shared chauvinism of a past – which is ostensibly still mirrored nowadays –, in some sort of encouragement to emancipation from out-

dated legacies via the *murder* of those prejudices imprisoning the *fairer sex* into mere *echoes* of men's achievements.

Adapting George R. R. Martin's *A Game of Thrones*. A Corpus Linguistics Analysis from a Gender Perspective

Abstract: George R. R. Martin's *A Song of Ice and Fire* is one of the most successful fantasy series to date, and its popularity has incredibly increased over the last decade thanks to several adaptations into different media. The success of Martin's fantasy series is also due to the enormous popularity of its female characters, which has sparked a hot debate in terms of gender and power relations. This paper aims at offering a corpus-based analysis, from a gender perspective, of the language adopted by the characters of Martin's first book of the series, *A Game of Thrones* (Bantam, 1996), and two adaptations which closely follow the novel's original storyline: the first season of the TV series *Game of Thrones* (HBO, 2011) and the graphic adaptation titled *A Game of Thrones. The Graphic Novel* (Dynamite Entertainment, 2011-2014).

Keywords: *adaptation studies, corpus linguistics, gender studies, fantasy literature, graphic novels, American TV series*

1. Introduction

George R. R. Martin's fantasy series, *A Song of Ice and Fire*, has become in recent times so popular that it might be considered as a global cultural phenomenon. The author of the series, born in New Jersey in 1948 and currently living in Santa Fe, New Mexico, started his career as a writer in the 1970s, mostly focusing on fantasy, science fiction, and horror short stories and novels, but also actively working as a screenwriter. The winner of numerous literary awards, Martin began the saga that made him worldwide famous with the publication of its first volume, *A Game of Thrones*, in 1996. As recently reported by Charles Yu in the *New York Times* (October 15, 2018), the book series *A Song of Ice and Fire* (which comprises five novels) is currently available in 47 languages and has already sold 85 million copies worldwide. At the same time, the TV series adaptation of Martin's book series, produced by HBO and titled *Game of Thrones*, has become "by many measures the most popular television show on earth, airing in 170 countries".¹ In 2011, or the same year in which the first season of the TV series adaptation was aired, the graphic novel adaptation of Martin's series was launched by Dynamite Entertainment; when it was republished in four hardcover volumes by Bantam Books, it immediately reached the top position in the New York Times Graphic Books Best Sellers List.² In addition, role-playing games, card and board games, online video games, and a huge online fanbase further define the dimensions of the worldwide interest and passion toward Martin's creation. The author himself is still involved in the process of concluding the book series (two more volumes are supposed to complete what will eventually become a heptalogy). Martin has also endorsed two of the most fortunate adaptations of his novels, the TV series produced by HBO as well as the graphic novel adaptation, as the author himself asserts in the introduction to the first hardcover volume of the graphic novel: "A series of novels. A television show.

¹ Charles Yu, "George R. R. Martin, Fantasy's Reigning King" (*The New York Times Style Magazine*, 15 October 2018), <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/10/15/t-magazine/george-rr-martin-got-interview.html>, accessed 10 November 2018.

² See George Gene Gustines, "Graphic Books Best Sellers: *Game of Thrones* and the *Avengers*" (*The New York Times*, 6 April 2012).

A comic book. Three different media, each with its own strengths and weaknesses, its own pleasure and frustrations...but all ultimately telling the same story”.³

Set in a quasi-medieval fantasy world, full of dark magic and supernatural creatures, *A Game of Thrones* has a complex plot, with various storylines narrated from different points of view. The sudden death of the principal advisor to the King of the Seven Kingdoms sets in motion a dramatic power play that involves the most important families in the kingdom: The Baratheons, with the death of King Robert and the political crisis that ensues, and the Starks, after Lord Eddard and his family become involved in various ways in a war against the Lannisters for the succession to the throne. In the meantime, another illustrious family, the Targaryens, is planning a comeback (with the help of the powerful Dothraki tribe) after a period of exile in order to take over the Iron Throne; however, at the northern border of the Seven Kingdoms, Lord Eddard Stark's illegitimate son, Jon Snow, and the Night's Watch are guarding the Wall, a huge barrier that protects the kingdom from the Northern wilderness, and they are dealing with other dangerous threats to the Seven Kingdoms, such as potential attacks from the Wildlings and a series of mysterious murders of members of the Watch who reanimate as undead.

Martin's popular series has often been compared to the trilogy that started the fantasy genre, J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*. In a 2011 online interview, Martin asserts that he wanted to write “an epic fantasy that had the imagination and the sense of wonder that you get in the best fantasy, but the gritty realism of the best historical fiction”.⁴ He explains that, according to him, fantasy writers who were following Tolkien's example “were getting it all wrong,” and describes the fantasy world in their works as “a sort of Disneyland middle ages, where they had castles and princesses and all that. The trappings of a class system, but they didn't seem to understand what a class system actually meant”.⁵ One of the innovative elements of Martin's series within the fantasy genre is the fact that the world of *A Song of Ice and Fire* presents several female characters who are among the most memorable protagonists of the whole series. Catelyn Stark, Daenerys Targaryen, Arya and Sansa Stark, but also Queen Cersei Lannister, Brienne of Tarth, Melisandre of Asshai and many other female characters populate the world created by George R. R. Martin as well as the imagination of millions of fans. As Frankel explains, Martin:

Considers himself a feminist, with female characters as vibrant and expressive as the male ones: “To me, being a feminist is about treating men and women the same,” he says. “I regard men and women as all human—yes there are differences, but many of those differences are created by the culture that we live in, whether it's the medieval culture of Westeros, or 21st century Western culture” (Salter). Most fans acclaim Martin for his three-dimensional female characters.⁶

³ Daniel Abraham, *George R. R. Martin. A Game of Thrones: The Graphic Novel*, vol. 1 (New York: Bantam Books, 2012), 5. In the preface to the volume *Inside HBO's Game of Thrones: Seasons 1 & 2* (Bryan Cogman et al., San Francisco: Chronicle Books, 2012), Martin observes that “[m]oving from page to screen is never easy” and that “[a] novelist has techniques and devices at his command that are not available to the scriptwriter: internal dialogue, unreliable narrators, first-person and tight third-person points of view, flashbacks, expository narrative, and a host of others. As a novelist, I strive to put my readers inside the heads of my characters, make them privy to their thoughts, let them see the world through their eyes. But the camera stands outside the character, so the viewpoint is of necessity external rather than internal. Aside from voice-overs (always an intrusion, I think, a crutch at best), the scriptwriter must depend on the director and the cast to convey the depths of emotion, subtleties of thought, and contradictions of character that a novelist can simply tell the reader about in clear, straightforward prose” (Martin, *Inside HBO's Game of Thrones*, 4).

⁴ John Hodgman, “John Hodgman Interviews George R. R. Martin”, *PRI – Public Radio International* (21 September 2011), <https://www.pri.org/stories/2011-09-21/john-hodgman-interviews-george-rr-martin>, accessed 10 November 2018.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Valerie Estelle Frankel, *Women in Game of Thrones: Power, Conformity and Resistance* (Jefferson: McFarland, 2014), 2. Frankel also reports that, at least for the HBO adaptation, *Game of Thrones* is not “just a boys' show,” because women represent about 42% of the viewers, and 50% of the online conversations about Martin's series is conducted by women (Frankel, *Women in “Game of Thrones”*, 1).

Another recent publication that shows the academic interest for the importance given to female characters in Martin's fantasy series is *Women of Ice and Fire: Gender, Game of Thrones, and Multiple Media Engagements*, edited by Anne Gjelsvik and Rikke Schubart,⁷ which starts with an epigraph quoting a famous answer given by Martin to George Stroumboulopoulos during an interview on the Canadian TV channel CBC TV on March 13th, 2012: "George Stroumboulopoulos: 'There's one thing that's interesting about your books. I noticed that you write women really well and really different. Where does that come from?' George R. R. Martin: 'You know, I've always considered women to be people'".⁸

While Martin is, at least in his fantasy series, a strong proponent of the equality of treatment between men and women, the male and female characters in *A Song of Ice and Fire* have not always been portrayed in the same way. Especially in relation to the TV series, this issue has already been pointed out on the web, where fans and bloggers have noticed that the screen time of the female characters is on average lower than that of the male characters;⁹ in addition, some of the choices made in the TV series adaptation, such as the abundance of sex scenes (especially the rape scenes) happened to cause intense debate in terms of alleged gender equality in the show.¹⁰

This paper aims at offering a preliminary corpus-based analysis of the language¹¹ employed by the characters of Martin's *A Song of Ice and Fire* by focusing on the first book of the series, *A Game of Thrones*, and two different adaptations which closely follow the original storyline: the graphic novel adaptation published by Dynamite Entertainment, and the first season of the HBO TV series. Since these two very popular adaptations, which became concurrently available starting from 2011, closely follow the original storyline from Martin's novel,¹² they represent a unique opportunity to study simultaneously how the language employed by male and female characters in the novel might have changed in the process of adapting it for two media adaptations created for different intended audiences.¹³ The result is a study based on a corpus which is made by three different versions of the same story told in three different media: literature, graphic novel, TV series.

Given the specific nature of the corpus compiled for this research, this paper concentrates on offering a quantitative corpus-based study which focuses specifically on what the language that the characters employ can reveal in terms of power and gender relations which characterize the fictional world created by Martin. In other words, this study specifically explores the degree of active participation of the female characters in the narrative universe of *A Game of Thrones* through their verbal agency, and whether the power relations enacted in the story change in the two intersemiotic translations of Martin's novel.

⁷ Anne Gjelsvik and Rikke Schubart, eds., *Women of Ice and Fire: Gender, "Game of Thrones", and Multiple Media Engagements* (New York: Bloomsbury, 2016).

⁸ Ibid., 1.

⁹ See for example, Shannon Carlin, "The Women of *Game of Thrones* Get Far Less Screen Time Than Their Male Counterparts" (Refinery29, June 28, 2017), <https://www.refinery29.com/en-us/2017/06/160818/game-of-thrones-female-characters-less-screen-time>, accessed 10 November 2018.

¹⁰ See for example, Nicole Silverberg, "Whatever Happened to (Consensual) Sex on *Game of Thrones*?", *GQ* (13 July 2017), <https://www.gq.com/story/consensual-sex-game-of-thrones>; Christopher Orr, "Why Does *Game of Thrones* Feature So Much Sexual Violence?", *The Atlantic* (17 June 2015), <https://www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2015/06/game-of-thrones-sexual-violence/396191/>, accessed 10 November 2018.

¹¹ See Paul Baker, *Using Corpora in Discourse Analysis* (New York: Continuum, 2006).

¹² Martin was also personally involved in the development of both adaptations: he was a co-executive producer and creative consultant to the TV series adaptation, and he was a consultant for the graphic novel adaptation (for the latter, see also Daniel Abraham, "Same Song in a Different Key: Adapting *A Game of Thrones* as a Graphic Novel," in James Lowder, ed., *Beyond the Wall: Exploring George R. R. Martin's "A Song of Ice and Fire"* (Dallas: Benbella Books, 2012), 29-42).

¹³ As a consequence, this research also aims at avoiding the path already followed by many existing adaptation studies in relation to exclusively comparing literature and movie adaptations. See Linda Hutcheon, *A Theory of Adaptation* (Derby, UK: Routledge, 2013).

Considering the complex features of the corpus compiled, this research does not aim at offering a thorough analysis of the patriarchal discourse in and around *A Game of Thrones*. Such a study would be virtually impossible to be covered within the space of a journal article, and it would probably lead to a rushed (and inevitably superficial) overview of the many aspects that should be taken into consideration. Instead, this research mainly focuses on comparing the dialogues performed by the male and the female characters in the three versions of Martin's story. In addition, it includes a more general analysis of the visibility of male and female characters across the different media versions from a quantitative perspective by examining the narrative component of the novel, the screen time of the characters in the TV series and the visibility of male and female characters in the panels that compose the graphic novel adaptation. Finally, in order to take a closer look at the language employed by the main characters of Martin's novel and its two adaptations, the research includes a preliminary keyword analysis which offers further insights into the power and gender relations in force in the world of *A Game of Thrones*.

2. Main features of the corpus

As already mentioned, in order to understand how the first volume of George R. R. Martin's series, *A Game of Thrones: Book One of a Song of Ice and Fire*¹⁴ was adapted from a gender perspective, the novel was compared with two of its most popular adaptations: a graphic novel and a TV series. The graphic novel version, scripted by Daniel Abraham and drawn by Tommy Patterson, was originally published in 24 issues by Dynamite Entertainment between September 2011 and July 2014, and then collected in four hardcover volumes published by Bantam Books between 2012 and 2015.¹⁵ The first season of the HBO TV series, written by David Benioff and D. B. Weiss, aired on HBO between April 17 and June 19, 2011.¹⁶ Taken together, these three different versions of *A Game of Thrones* represent a heterogeneous corpus, each of them having its own specific features, and the corpus was consequently developed in different ways in order to suit the specific purposes of the current research project.

The corpus was initially built starting from the isolation of the only element which the original text and the two adaptations clearly have in common, which is the dialogues. The first volume of G. R. R. Martin's book series is composed by 71 chapters, each of them narrated in third person from the point of view of one of the eight main characters of the novel: four male characters (Eddard Stark, Tyrion Lannister, Jon Snow, Bran Stark) and four female characters (Catelyn Stark, Daenerys Targaryen, Arya Stark and Sansa Stark), plus a prologue chapter which is narrated from the point of view of a minor character, Will, a member of the Night's Watch. A quick look at the list of chapters in Martin's book reveals that the number of chapters narrated from the point of view of the female characters is 31, while those narrated from the point of view of the male characters are 40. In order to prepare the corpus for the analysis, all the dialogues were isolated and tagged according to the characters who perform them. The act of isolating all the dialogues in the novel was helped by the fact that Martin constantly uses a simple and clear narrative style during the entire novel, which favors direct speech over indirect speech and generally avoids narrative ambiguity.

In the case of the graphic novel adaptation, the whole textual component of the graphic novel (which means balloons, captions, and every other possible textual element that is meant to be read and does not represent a drawing element) was typed manually, since it was impossible to use any text recognition software that could automatically extract the text from the graphic novel. At the same time, the typed text was tagged in relation to the characters who perform the dialogues. In addition, all the panels were

¹⁴ George R. R. Martin, *A Game of Thrones: Book One of "A Song of Ice and Fire"* (New York: Bantam Books, 1996).

¹⁵ Daniel Abraham, *George R. R. Martin: A Game of Thrones: The Graphic Novel*, vol. 1-4 (New York: Bantam Books, 2012), 5.

¹⁶ David Benioff and D. B. Weiss, *Game of Thrones: The Complete First Season* (New York: HBO Home Entertainment, 2012).

carefully examined and categorized in terms of visibility of male or female characters, as an attempt to quantitatively determine how often male characters were portrayed compared to female characters.

Thanks to a huge fanbase and the availability of materials about the HBO production on the Internet, it was possible to find online the scripts of all the episodes of the first season, which were accurately checked through a comparison with the original audio of the episodes of the TV series.¹⁷ Starting from the online scripts, a section of the corpus based on the dialogues of all the characters in the series was developed. While it was possible to check the accuracy of the scripts, there was no certainty that the scripts were original, which means that there was no way to check the authenticity of the stage directions and the scene comments; consequently, both stage directions and scene comments were excluded from the analysis. Instead, in order to find a quantifiable way to compare the importance given to all the viewpoint characters in this specific retelling of Martin's story, the screen time of all the characters collected in 2013 by StannisEndGame, a member of A Forum of Ice and Fire, the forum section of the popular fansite Westeros.org, was taken into consideration.¹⁸

After the corpus was collected and its content tagged, the corpus linguistics analysis was conducted through the use of the software *Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count (LIWC2015)*¹⁹ which operates through a comparison of the vocabulary used in a given corpus with a semantically tagged dictionary composed by about 6,400 words, word stems and emoticons. LIWC analyzes the data according to 90 different categories related to grammar, linguistic variables and psychological processes which are included in the internal dictionary.²⁰ For the sake of the current analysis, some of the most common parameters (word count, number of words per sentence, and percentage of words with more than 6 letters,) which are typically used for corpus linguistics analysis, were taken into consideration. In addition, the corpus was analyzed in terms of *analytical thinking*, a summary variable offered by LIWC and based on previous research (Pennebaker et al., 2014). The *analytical thinking* variable is related to large samples of writing which were analyzed in terms of “categorical versus dynamic thinking”.²¹ More specifically, according to Pennebaker, categorical thinking writers “methodically define and categorize thoughts and experiences. The writing is structured and largely impersonal but, at the same time, ponderous”.²² On the other hand, a more dynamic writing style “is far more personal and works to tell a story. The language is more informal and simple, using shorter words. Every sentence has multiple verbs, which has the effect of making the story more alive”.²³ LIWC converts the results to a percentile scale in which the higher the number, the more an analyzed text results “categorical;” on the other hand, a text that obtains a lower number can be interpreted as more “dynamic”.²⁴

¹⁷ <https://genius.com/artists/Game-of-thrones>, accessed 10 November 2018.

¹⁸ <https://asoiaf.westeros.org/index.php?/topic/94295-a-game-of-screentime/>, accessed 10 November 2018.

¹⁹ James W. Pennebaker et al., *Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count: LIWC2015* (Austin: Pennebaker Conglomerates, 2015). Available from www.LIWC.net.

²⁰ For more information on the analysis conducted by LIWC, see James W. Pennebaker et al., *The Development and Psychometric Properties of LIWC2015* (Austin: University of Texas at Austin, 2015).

²¹ James W. Pennebaker, *The Secret Life of Pronouns: What Our Words Say about Us* (New York: Bloomsbury, 2011), 285.

²² *Ibid.*

²³ *Ibid.*, 286.

²⁴ Pennebaker et al., *Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count: LIWC2015*, 22. It is important to add that, according to the already mentioned research conducted by Pennebaker et al., texts written in a categorical style are usually more rewarded at the academic level compared to more dynamic ones (see also Pennebaker, *The Secret Life of Pronouns*, 286). However, the research only refers to writing samples in an academic context, which means that further investigation needs to be conducted in order to ascertain the degree of effectiveness of this tool in relation to dialogues or spoken texts. Having said that, I personally believe that the data analyzed in the present research, which show the striking difference in terms of results found in relation to the characteristics of the language used by male and female characters as well as the general consistency found in the three different versions of *A Game of Thrones*, still deserve to be taken into consideration.

3. Data analysis

The following tables report the findings from the corpus linguistics analysis. The results obtained show a marked imbalance in terms of language performed by male and female characters, and a striking resemblance of such a disparity across the three different versions of Martin’s story.

	GoT dialogues		GNA dialogues		TVS dialogues	
	Male Characters	Female Characters	Male Characters	Female Characters	Male Characters	Female Characters
Word count (%)	81890 (84%)	15026 (16%)	37093 (76%)	11606 (24%)	34997 (79%)	9508 (21%)
Words/sentence	11,02	10,59	7,44	7,01	6,68	6,22
Words > 6 letters (%)	9,95	8,52	9,94	9,25	10,14	9,05
Analytical thinking (%)	39,58	23,20	36,95	25,11	32,55	17,50

Tab. 1: Comparison between the dialogues included in Martin’s novel *A Game of Thrones* and its two adaptations.

The first table shows a comparison between the dialogues performed by male and female characters across the three different versions of G. R. R. Martin’s *A Game of Thrones*, where “GoT” stands for the original book version, “GNA” refers to the graphic novel adaptation published by Dynamite Entertainment, and “TVS” means the TV series broadcast by HBO. All the characters (the eight viewpoint characters as well as all the minor characters) are included in this analysis. The numbers in bold are the highest values in each pair. In the first row, the table shows the word count of all the dialogues divided between male and female characters in the three different versions of Martin’s story, and the relative percentages. The results are evident: the female characters only perform between 16 and 24% of the dialogues in the story, with a remarkable similarity between the novel and the two adaptations.

The second and third rows show the results respectively in terms of number of words per sentence and percentage of words with more than 6 letters, again comparing the results between male and female characters in the three versions of *A Game of Thrones*. While the difference between the figures related to the male characters and those related to the female characters is less conspicuous, in each and every case the male characters’ utterances are characterized by having longer sentences and using longer words compared to the female counterparts.

The fourth row refers to the LIWC variable *analytical thinking*, and it shows again an important difference in terms of language adopted by the male characters compared to the female characters in the novel, the graphic novel, and the TV series. According to the results, while all the numbers obtained are relatively low, the male characters use a language that is evidently (as well as consistently) higher compared to the female characters in terms of formality as well as logical and hierarchical thinking.

	Male viewpoint characters					Female viewpoint characters				
	Eddard	Tyrion	Jon	Bran	AVG	Catelyn	Daenerys	Sansa	Arya	AVG

Word count (%)	Go T	10378	7851	3919	1699	5961,75	6496	3404	2220	1590	<i>3427,50</i>
	G N A	4818	4132	1885	710	2886,25	3502	1903	1050	780	<i>1808,75</i>
	T V S	3453	3891	1234	567	2286,25	1709	1306	831	771	<i>1154,25</i>
Word s / sente nce	Go T	10,34	11,49	9,18	9,44	<i>10,11</i>	11,46	9,81	12,13	9,03	10,61
	G N A	7,27	8,04	5,73	5,55	6,65	7,83	6,12	6,25	5,17	<i>6,34</i>
	T V S	6,42	7,21	5,51	4,93	6,02	6,73	5,63	4,92	4,76	<i>5,51</i>
Word s > 6 letter s	Go T	10,58	10,15	8,62	7,42	9,19	9,96	7,70	9,41	6,86	<i>8,48</i>
	G N A	10,75	10,31	9,23	6,34	9,16	10,79	7,20	9,62	6,92	<i>8,63</i>
	T V S	10,98	11,67	7,94	8,29	9,72	9,01	7,50	8,42	6,49	<i>7,86</i>
Anal ytical thinki ng (%)	Go T	34,64	33,16	20,37	25,35	28,38	28,40	16,97	6,95	16,47	<i>17,20</i>
	G N A	32,71	31,25	14,30	13,32	22,90	29,49	15,10	8,30	11,16	<i>16,01</i>
	T V S	35,08	35,16	8,15	8,15	21,64	19,63	6,90	2,07	11,62	<i>10,06</i>

Tab. 2: Comparison between the dialogues included in Martin’s novel *A Game of Thrones* and its two adaptations with specific reference to the eight viewpoint characters.

Tab. 2 shows a more detailed overview of the analysis described in Table 1. In this case, while the four parameters considered (word count, words per sentence, percentage of words with more than 6 letters, and *analytical thinking*) are the same, the characters included in the comparison are not all the male and female characters that appear in Martin’s novel and its two adaptations, but only the eight viewpoint characters from the novel. The results from the analysis of the language used by each point-of-view character are averaged in the two AVG columns (one for the four male characters and one for the four female characters,) and the higher value of each pair is in bold. It is important to point out that, by dividing the corpus in a number of much smaller sub-corpora, the reliability of the data analysis might be affected (the rule of thumb is that the larger the corpus analyzed, the more reliable the results). However, in this table it is possible to notice that only in one case do the female characters ‘perform better’ than their male counterparts. Except for the number of words per sentence in the original version of *A Game of Thrones*, where the female characters have a slight advantage over the other four viewpoint characters, nowhere else do the characters of Catelyn Stark, Daenerys Targaryen, Sansa and Arya Stark have the opportunity to pronounce more words than Eddard Stark, Tyrion Lannister, Jon Snow, Bran

Stark, or use a language characterized by more words per sentence, longer words, or else show a higher degree of *analytical thinking* through the language they use.

		Male characters	%	Female characters	%
GoT	Number of chapters per POV character	40	56	31	44
	Chapter word count per POV character	157.631	54	132.224	46
GNA	Word count (balloons only)	37.093	76	11.606	24
	Number of panels in which any male or female characters are visible	2.815	66	1.451	34
TVS	Screen time in minutes	649:45	74	225:00	26
	Screen time in minutes (POV characters only)	234:00	59	164:47	41

Tab. 3: Comparison between male and female characters in terms of general visibility in the novel, the graphic novel and the TV series adaptation of *A Game of Thrones*.

The table above (Tab. 3) shows an attempt at comparing the general visibility of the male and female characters in the three versions of *A Game of Thrones* examined in the present research. This table offers a summary of all the data obtained from the corpus which are not directly related to the dialogues but can be still considered relevant in order to understand the power relations and the degree of agency between male and female characters in Martin’s story. The main reason this table was created is because, while analyzing dialogues is a useful way to understand who is really talking and who has more often the role of the passive listener, it is also true that dialogues only constitute one of the elements with which these three different media are made. As a consequence, in the case of the novel, in order to add to the analysis also the narrative component that accompanies the dialogues, the first two rows show the difference, between male and female characters, in terms of number of chapters narrated and specific word count. For the graphic novel adaptation, the third row shows the word count for all the male and the female characters in relation to the balloons only; in the next row, due to the specific features of the comic medium, the panel was considered as the unit of measure, and the presence of male and female characters was traced in each panel (in a way that can be comparable to screen time in the TV series), in order to obtain the total number of panels in which male and female characters are visible.

Finally, and as already mentioned above, the screen time data offered by StannisEndGame on *A Forum of Ice and Fire* on the website Westeros.org have been added to the analysis, in order to take into consideration the visibility on the screen of all the male and the female characters of the HBO TV series adaptation. The author of the analysis explains that he has considered as screen time only the actual time in which every character is visible on screen (with the exclusion of walk-on characters), rather than the length of the scenes in which each character is included. Moreover, he gives “characters screentime for ‘deadtime’ when the whole body is still intact. Khal Drogo [i.e. the leader of the Dothraki tribe]’s corpse got screentime, Ned [i.e. Eddard Stark]’s head dit [*sic*] not”.²⁵

For the purposes of this research, the fifth row in Table 3 refers to all the screen time of all the male characters versus the female characters, while the sixth and last row only includes the screen time of the eight viewpoint characters.

In order to make Tab. 3 as clear as possible, each raw result is paired with its relative percentage number, and the higher values between male and female characters are in bold. As the table shows, even

²⁵ Ibid., 286.

without considering the dialogues only, the two adaptations of George R. R. Martin’s novel *A Game of Thrones* faithfully reiterate the imbalance between male and female characters: the male characters have more and longer chapters in Martin’s original novel; they also pronounce more words and are visible in more panels in the graphic novel, and they have more screen time in the HBO TV adaptation. In other words, the two adaptations of Martin’s novel faithfully transpose the same disparity, in terms of gender, that can be found in the original novel.

As an attempt to offer a preliminary analysis of the linguistic patterns that can be found in the collected corpus, a keyword analysis of the language employed by each of the eight point-of-view characters in the story was conducted.

	Arya	Bran	Catelyn	Daenerys	Eddard	Jon	Sansa	Tyrion
GoT	t (45)	go (21)	robb (20)	drogo (25)	robert (65)	ghost (22)	t (58)	bronn (8)
	liar (8)	t (33)	riverrun (15)	jorah (18)	baelish (12)	sam (14)	please (24)	mord (6)
	nymeria (6)	summer (10)	petyr (9)	dragon (20)	jory (14)	t (59)	prince (14)	my (158)
	syrio (7)	hodor (8)	rodrik (11)	sun (13)	grace (29)	chain (7)	i (124)	i (321)
	i (98)	can (21)	frey (9)	viserys (11)	final (7)	s (84)	don (20)	gold (17)
	mycah (5)	rickon (5)	walder (9)	stars (9)	<i>arya (19)</i>	don (23)	ll (24)	dwarfs (5)
	don (16)	brandon (6)	<i>lysa (13)</i>	khal (18)	this (83)	bran (14)	marry (7)	grumkins (5)
	m (17)	didn (7)	lannisters (17)	blood (20)		read (6)	she (24)	shagga (9)
	going (9)	fly (5)	luwin (10)	<i>doreah (7)</i>		night (18)	joffrey (12)	prefer (7)
	hate (6)	he (40)	brynden (6)	<i>duur (5)</i>			queen (13)	wine (14)
	didn (7)		prisoner (6)	<i>maz (5)</i>			father (24)	rock (13)
	fat (5)		bran (18)	<i>mirri (5)</i>			grace (13)	casterly (11)
	a (60)		karstark (6)	please (15)			wouldn (7)	flagon (5)
	says (8)			me (60)			<i>arya (9)</i>	timett (5)
	was (27)			bride (5)			want (18)	
				him (48)			septa (6)	
				maegi (7)			dress (5)	
				eggs (5)				
				rhaego (5)				
				stallion (6)				
				them (33)				
				gift (6)				
				am (19)				
				i (146)				
				bring (12)				
				life (11)				
				khalasar (6)				

Tab. 4: Keywords for the eight point-of-view characters in Martin’s *A Game of Thrones*.

	Arya	Bran	Catelyn	Daenerys	Eddard	Jon	Sansa	Tyrion
GNA	t (27)	hodor (6)	walder (8)	drogo (17)	robert (39)	ghost (10)	please (16)	i (196)
	liar (5)	go (13)	robb (12)	jorah (12)	arryn (18)	t (35)	t (26)	mord (6)
	syrio (5)	stories (5)	petyr (6)	dragon (15)	jory (6)	sam (6)	prince (8)	dwarfs (5)
	says (6)	t (18)	must (24)	stars (7)	justice (8)	bran (11)	joffrey (9)	bronn (6)
	don (9)	summer (5)		viserys (8)		uncle (7)	don (10)	
	i (48)	i (45)		khal (11)		s (48)	want (11)	
		want (9)		sun (8)			oh (5)	
				maegi (5)			grace (7)	

Tab. 5: Keywords for the eight point-of-view characters in the graphic novel adaptation of Martin’s novel.

	Arya	Bran	Catelyn	Daenerys	Eddard	Jon	Sansa	Tyrion
TVS	liar (12)	robb (5)	ned (9)	stars (8)	baratheon (11)	sam (7)	please (15)	mord (8)
	fat (5)	family (5)		sun (9)	robert (17)	know (17)	<i>arya (7)</i>	bronn (5)
	m (14)			drogo (8)	hey (5)	uncle (5)	t (28)	vale (9)
	i (50)			jorah (5)			grace (9)	
	says (5)			dragon (7)			stop (7)	
				khal (8)			he (27)	
				stop (7)			i (53)	
				am (8)				

Tab. 6: Keywords for the eight point-of-view characters in the TV series adaptation of Martin’s novel.

The three tables above (Tabs 4-6) show the keywords for the eight viewpoint characters in Martin’s *A Game of Thrones* from the novel (GoT), the graphic novel (GNA), and the TV series (TVS) respectively. The keywords are based on a comparison between the language of each of the viewpoint characters against a reference corpus composed of the other seven viewpoint characters in each of the three versions of Martin’s story. In the tables, the keywords are in descending order according to keyness, and for each keyword the frequency of occurrences is written in parenthesis. The data analysis was conducted through the use of the corpus linguistics software *AntConc*²⁶ (Keyness=Log Likelihood, $p<0.05$ +Bonferroni), and the minimum frequency for each keyword is set at five.²⁷ Since it would be impossible, for sheer lack of space, to analyze in detail all the keywords included in the tables above,²⁸ only what might be considered as the overall most striking feature of these keyword lists will be discussed here. More specifically, the three lists include an impressive number of proper nouns, which normally would not

²⁶ Lawrence Anthony, *AntConc* (version 3.5.8) [Computer Software] (Tokyo: Waseda University, 2019). Available from <https://www.laurenceanthony.net/software>.

²⁷ See Jonathan Culpeper, “Keyness: Words, Parts-of-speech and Semantic Categories in the Character-talk of Shakespeare’s *Romeo and Juliet*”, *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics*, 14.1 (2009), 29-59.

²⁸ Yet, the keywords in the list are very helpful in order to understand some of the main features of the characters’ storylines and their personalities. For example, the predominance of the word “please” in Sansa Stark’s column in all three versions of Martin’s story reflects her submissive role as a stereotypical princess (the same keyword is also interestingly included in the list of keywords, from the novel, that refers to Daenerys Targaryen), and the predominant role of the word “Robert” in the three keyword lists related to Eddard Stark underlines the latter’s unfaltering sense of duty in defending King Robert Baratheon against all his political enemies.

represent a surprising aspect of any keyword list, except for the fact that the vast majority of these keywords (marked in bold in the tables) refer to male characters, while, on the other hand, only a limited number of them (marked in italics) refer to female characters. This could be considered as a confirmation of what has already been stated above in terms of power and gender relations in Martin’s story, since it demonstrates that all the eight viewpoint characters tend to continuously talk about male characters, while the female characters are clearly relegated to having an ancillary role.²⁹ Other examples of this general tendency can be found in some keywords such as, for example, “sun” and “stars” in Daenerys Targaryen’s column, which are typically used in combination to form an epithet for her husband, Khal Drogo (“my sun and stars”), or in the higher number of common nouns which unequivocally refer to male characters (for example, “prince” or “khal,” the latter being the word used to refer to male leaders in the Dothraki language) compared to those which refer exclusively to female characters (for example, “queen”), or else in the comparatively higher use of the pronoun “he” compared to “she,” as can be noticed in the keyword list tables above.

4. Conclusions and further research

After more than twenty years since the publication of the first volume of George R. R. Martin’s *A Song of Ice and Fire*, the role and meaning of the female characters in the fictional world of Westeros is still hotly debated. In the “gritty realism” that the author portrays in his fantasy series, according to Caroline Spector:

Martin has created a brutal world where unspeakable acts are commonplace, where the shares of power allotted to men and women are clearly out of balance, where women must struggle, steal, and fight for every ounce of autonomy ... In the midst of what appears to be a traditional male-power fantasy about war and politics, [Martin] serves up a grim, realistic, and harrowing depiction of what happens when women aren’t fully empowered in a society. In doing so, by creating such diverse and fully rendered female characters and thrusting them into this grim and bitter world, Martin has created a subversively feminist tale.³⁰

Indeed, by looking at different retellings of Martin’s fantasy series in terms of language employed by the characters in the story, the fictional world of *A Game of Thrones* can definitely be considered as dominated by male characters, with the female characters relegated to roles of secondary importance. However, Judith Butler’s idea of the essential performativity of gender, with people speaking in a certain way not because they are male or female, but because they are supposed to adhere to a masculine or a feminine identity which is based on the social conventions that are followed by everyone in relation to the society that people belong to, can be fruitfully applied here.³¹ In fact, this idea of gender performativity can closely be linked to the way gender is portrayed by media in general, and a global phenomenon like George R. R. Martin’s *A Song of Ice and Fire* can have a strong impact in the way people see themselves through the characters in the fantasy series.

²⁹ While proper nouns in keyword lists are usually considered of secondary importance by corpus linguistics researchers, Culpeper points out that “[i]n fact, in fictional texts, they may be of some interest, as they relate to key aspects of the fictional world.” (Jonathan Culpeper, “Keywords and Characterization: An Analysis of Six Characters in *Romeo and Juliet*”, in David L. Hoover, et al., eds., *Digital Literary Studies: Corpus Approaches to Poetry, Prose, and Drama* (London: Routledge, 2014), 18.

³⁰ Caroline Spector, “Power and Feminism in Westeros,” in Lowder, ed., *Beyond the Wall*, 187.

³¹ See Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1990). Some organizations are currently on the lookout to find any positive change in the entertainment industry in relation to gender bias, and unfortunately, over the last four decades, things seem not to have changed. See, for example, the research conducted by the Geena Davis Institute on Gender in Media (Seejane.org), which focuses on the entertainment production for children until the age of 11, but still offers a rather appalling portrait of the pervasiveness of unconscious bias in terms of gender and race in the media.

It is possible to argue that Martin is developing a fictional world that resembles a medieval context in which gender inequality is rampant (for example, by relying on stereotypical assumptions related to a medieval setting dominated by a male-based military society, perhaps in accordance to the expected background knowledge of the intended audience) and where the female characters in the series fight for their own liberation from gender constraints. On the other hand, it is also important to point out that, since *A Game of Thrones* is a work of fiction, its medieval-looking fantasy world could have been characterized as more egalitarian from a gender perspective, with male and female characters as equally visible and having the same degree of agency.

Nonetheless, as the results from the corpus linguistics analysis show, all the three versions of *A Game of Thrones* are characterized by a gender bias that relegates the female characters to a secondary role, forcing them to be listeners rather than speakers, with a language that betrays their submissive role without offering them an opportunity, at least in that fictional world, to be on par with their male interlocutors. The attempt at keeping the two adaptations as close as possible to the source text, or the fact that G. R. R. Martin was personally involved in the development of both the graphic novel and the TV series adaptations, could have been possible constraints that led to maintaining the gender imbalance found in the original novel.³² Nevertheless, the fact is that, whether the story is told in the graphic novel form, the TV series form or the original novel version, the same kind of linguistic inequality is identifiable, and this can be considered as an example of how easily gender bias can be accepted in the process of transposing a literary work into a different medium, and then performed and shared across some of the most popular contemporary media without paying close attention to the social and cultural implications this act might imply.³³

As already mentioned in the first section, given the complexity of the corpus examined, the present research programmatically focuses on a quantitative analysis of the language employed by the characters in three different media versions of Martin's *A Game of Thrones*, with the goal of understanding how male and female characters are active verbally, and whether the gender imbalance found in the novel changes in terms of intersemiotic translation. It would be of great interest to further expand the research by developing a more thorough analysis of the patriarchal discourse in and around *A Game of Thrones*. Such a study could help understand, for example, in what ways the adaptations might have been conceived, in terms of framing and point of view, in order to primarily satisfy the male gaze; likewise, a paratextual analysis related to the media adaptations, for example in relation to interviews with directors, creators, and actors, but also trailers, sneak peeks, teasers and "making of" documentaries of the adaptations, could be complementary research directions capable of further revealing the importance and visibility of the male and female characters in both the graphic novel adaptation and the TV series adaptation of Martin's *A Game of Thrones*.

³² It would be interesting to investigate whether the same gender imbalance can be found in the last three seasons of the TV series produced by HBO, since they are all based on original content written by David Benioff and D. B. Weiss that is not included in the original book series *A Song of Ice and Fire*.

³³ The analysis here described does not take into consideration the conspicuous absence of diversity among the characters of *A Song of Ice and Fire*, which is another very serious issue in terms of bias, this time from a racial perspective. To tell the truth, the almost complete lack of non-white characters among the protagonists of the first volume of the series, *A Game of Thrones*, would make such a corpus linguistics analysis virtually impossible to do.

Subtitling Gender and Humour in Douglas McGrath's *Emma*

Abstract: This paper aims to investigate gender and humour in McGrath's *Emma* by applying Vandaele's notions of incongruity and superiority, politeness theory as well as Díaz-Cintas's linguistics of subtitling. Among adaptations of *Emma*, the 1996 version created by Douglas McGrath remediated Austen's comedy of manners with great attention to gender roles resulting in verbally expressed humour. I intend to track through these references and look at the issues – female irony, violations of maxims of politeness, *Emma*'s incongruity and superiority, etc – which they raise. But my central purpose will be to re-read *Emma* from a subtitling perspective. I will analyse the linguistics of subtitling and text-reduction shifts in order to demonstrate that gender may be conceptualised in subtitling and that *Emma*'s speech acts are reproduced faithfully by audio-visual media. Through dialogues, I suggest, subtitling may be considered as a form of culture-bound translation giving voice to gender and humour with unexpected results.

Keywords: *subtitling, female irony, Emma, speech acts, text-reduction shifts*

1. *Emma*'s modalities of humour between incongruity and superiority

Rated by the *New York Times* as one of the best of Jane Austen movies, Douglas McGrath's *Emma* (1996), an Academy Award-Winning Film in the Original Music Score category, starring Gwyneth Paltrow, Jeremy Northam, and Ewan McGregor, is able to transpose from novel to screen Jane Austen's subtle irony "narrowing the gap between finely wrought social satire and daytime soap opera".¹ Austen's most accomplished and wittiest novel about a matchmaker doing all the wrong things for all the right reasons appears to Douglas McGrath, already known as a playwright, screenwriter and columnist for *The New Republic*, the perfect novel to be adapted for what he defines "the most beautiful language, the most articulate kind of prose, the wittiest kind of prose" (interview with Charlie Rose).

Emma is a mature and brilliant comedy of manners, or better to say a comedy of errors, containing various humorous sequences. The entire plot of the novel and the film hinges on tricking the reader/viewer into believing the clueless *Emma*'s wrong interpretation of events. She unsuccessfully tries to make a match between her plain, uncultured friend Harriet Smith and the local vicar Mr Elton, and later on she takes on the next project of marrying Harriet with Frank Churchill who is already secretly engaged with Jane Fairfax.

The aim of this essay is to investigate gender and humour in McGrath's *Emma* by applying Vandaele's notions of incongruity and superiority, politeness theory as well as Díaz-Cintas's linguistics of subtitling and text reduction shifts. Apart from dispersed articles in academic journals and occasional chapters focusing on gender and dubbing no study exists on such a topic as gender and humour in McGrath's *Emma*. Marcella De Marco's monograph on *Audiovisual Translation through a Gender Lens*² is a valuable survey of how references to gender and sexuality are manipulated in the dubbing transfer but it does not apply Vandaele's approach to humour nor speech act theory to female irony. Only through a combination of theoretical approaches is it possible to understand the extent to which gender and humour are culture-bound issues posing a wide range of translation problems.

¹ Janet Maslin, *The New York Times* (2 August 1996).

² Marcella De Marco, *Audiovisual Translation through a Gender Lens* (Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 2012).

Emma’s snobbery and perfect lack of self-awareness render her ideas of romance entertaining. Overtly asserting in the opening scene of the film that “The most beautiful thing in the world is a match well made, and a happy marriage” (00:02:30),³ Emma contradicts herself only 20 minutes later by revealing her friend Harriet Smith that “I have no inducements to marry. I lack neither fortune, nor position, and never could I be so important in a man’s eyes as I am in my father’s” (00:29:00). Ambiguities, misunderstandings, contradictions, obscurity of expressions characterise the dialogues of characters who, although merely obsessed with rank, class and manners, they end up violating Paul Grice’s maxims of quantity, quality, relation and manner to comic effect. Notoriously, Emma is characterised by linguistic prolixity (violation of the maxim of quantity) aimed at giving irrelevant information (violation of the maxim of relevance) which are expressed with fake smiles (violation of the maxim of quality) and obscurity of expressions (violation of the maxim of manner).

For this reason, humour⁴ in *Emma*, which is extremely English in character, landscape, sensibility, and wit, poses a genuine challenge to the translator, and more particularly, to the subtitler who has to cope not only with a culturally connoted element which is hardly transferable from one culture to another, but also with this distinct female character: Emma’s verbal competitions with Mr Knightley and inner thoughts about Jane Fairfax, an accomplished musician lacking in fortune, about the rich and vulgar Mrs Elton and the Coles’ party provide the most hilarious scenes in the movie.

According to Patrick Zabalbeascoa,⁵ audiovisual humour can be classified into three categories: the universally funny or international humour which is not connected to any specific culture but it is universally recognised as funny no matter the viewers’ nationality or who they really are. This particular kind of humour should not cause major subtitling problems. In fact, space constraints permitting, a literal translation of the content and verbatim rendering of the referent is the most obvious solution. Another category is a humour linked to funny scenes or funny expressions of the body or of the face (the so called visual joke) that tend to be universal and should not be of concern to translators. And the last category is the humour linked to the “word” (commonly referred to as language-dependent jokes) representing the hardest problem of translation, aptly investigated by Delia Chiaro as ‘verbally expressed humour’.

Emma’s humour typically expresses her femininity and contradictory personality, thereby becoming a complex form of humour based on jokes that are the visually coded version of a linguistic joke making use of all or various of the film’s sign systems. In the Preface to *Women and Comedy: History, Theory, Practice*, Rebecca Barreca maintains that “humour is a powerful way for women to redress the balance”.⁶ In Barreca’s view, women’s humour is always aimed at attacking the powerful and dismantling barriers as in George Eliot, Elizabeth Bowen, Muriel Spark and many others. This is the case of Emma whose sarcastic humour is addressed to Mr Knightley, the father-like figure embodying Victorian morality and patriarchal society. In spite of cultural differences, there is a certain universality in her female gestures and body language aimed at expressing her relief, suffering, resignation or discomfort. See, for example, Emma’s fake smiles welcoming the unwelcome Mrs Elton, or the cold stares she gives to Mr Knightley when they quarrel on Harriet Smith’s refusing Robert Martin’s proposal, or even the childish knowing looks Emma and Harriet exchange at Mr Elton’s misunderstood expressions of appraisal.

³ These digital numbers are commonly known as timecode which is a sort of identity sign unique to each frame, making it very easy for any professional to identify a particular frame within the whole movie.

⁴ In his introduction to the *Special Issue of the Journal of Pragmatics: The Pragmatics of Humor*, Salvatore Attardo underlines the difference between humour, a psychological and a cognitive manifestation, and laughter, a neurophysiological phenomenon, explaining how humour, strictly connected with intelligence, is subjective and a relative concept, differing from individual to individual, from context to context and from one culture to another. Salvatore Attardo, “Introduction: The Pragmatics of Humor”, *Journal of Pragmatics*, 35.9 (September 2003), 1287-1294.

⁵ Patrick Zabalbeascoa, “Translating Jokes for Dubbed Television Situation Comedies”, *The Translator*, 2.2 (1996), 235-267.

⁶ Peter Dickinson et al., eds, *Women and Comedy: History, Theory, Practice* (Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson U.P., 2013), xi.

But the most typical expression of audiovisual humour in *Emma* is aptly summarised by Jeroen Vandaele who characterises the phenomenon on the basis of two concepts, allegedly present in all forms, albeit in different quantities or qualities: incongruity and superiority. *Emma*’s incongruity is an essential feature of irony which is strictly connected to speech act theory and that Pelsmaekers and Van Besien describe as “some kind of contrast or incongruity between what is said (the propositional content) and what can be inferred from the situation”.⁷ There are many examples of irony’s perlocutionary effects in the film deriving from incongruity where laughter is the effect most commonly associated with humour. Apart from the numerous times *Emma* expresses her good intentions by uttering such sentences as “Oh, it’s not my place to intrude!”, “I shall never do it again! Never!”, “I would never try to match anyone again”, and one second later she starts manipulating Harriet with rhetorical questions in order to convince her to refuse Mr Martin’s proposal, there is one scene revealing *Emma*’s subtle irony produced by her negative politeness which is aimed at minimizing her imposition on Mr Elton. The latter is constantly interrupting *Emma* from listening to Mr Weston’s reporting the words of Frank Churchill’s letter.

The humorous element in *Emma*’s speech acts is the effect of her uttering a negative polite request which is said to get rid of Mr Elton “I wondered if perhaps you might be so kind as to bring me some punch.” (00:35:39). But when he pre-announces he will try to do his best to come back as quickly as possible, she answers back by employing all politeness routines and markers (the key word ‘please’ is pronounced with a high pitch) albeit implying not to hurry: “Please! I could not enjoy it if I knew that you hurried!”.

Script	Subtitles (00:34:57)
1 Mr Weston: My son Frank has written and told us something most exciting.	Mio figlio Frank ci ha scritto una lettera Piena di particolari molto emozionanti
2 Mr Elton: Miss Woodhouse, are you warm enough?	Signorina Woodhouse, vi sentite Al caldo? - Sì, sì grazie.
3 Emma: Yes, thank you.	
4 Mr Weston: The letter arrived today, and on the opening, we had the most wonderful surprise. Frank said-	- Quando avete avuto sue notizie? -La lettera è arrivata oggi. E leggendola mia moglie Ed io abbiamo avuto La più bella delle sorprese, Frank ...
5 Mr Elton: Some of the other ladies were saying they were not warm enough.	Ho udito alcune signore che si lamentavano per il freddo.
6 Emma: I am quite comfortable, yes.	Io invece sto benissimo.
7 Mr Elton: Then I saw how close you were to the fire, and thought you might be too warm, and-	E poi ho notato Quanto fosse vicina al fuoco.
8 Emma: Mr Elton! I am in the perfect state of warmth.	Signor Elton, ritengo che la mia temperatura sia perfetta.
9 Mr Weston: At first I did not believe it, so I asked Mrs Weston to read the letter	Inizialmente non riuscivo a crederci,

⁷ Kaja Pelsmaekers and Fred van Besien, “Subtitling Irony: *Blackadder* in Dutch”, in Jeroen Vandaele, ed., *Translating Humour* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), 243.

- | | | |
|----|---|---|
| | herself, to make sure I was not dreaming. But indeed Frank said- | così ho chiesto alla signora Weston di rileggermi la lettera, Per essere certo di non averlo immaginato. Ma era vero, Frank... |
| 10 | Mr Elton: Miss Woodhouse, is there any effort I might make on behalf of your father's comfort? | Signorina Woodhouse, c'è nulla che io possa fare

per mettere più a suo agio vostro padre? |
| 11 | Emma: You are very kind, but I can only imagine that he's quite comfortable. Thank you for being so thoughtful. | Siete molto gentile ma vi assicuro che mio padre gode di ogni conforto
- Grazie per essere così premuroso.
- No, grazie a voi, di considerarmi premuroso. |
| 12 | Mr Elton: No, thank you for thinking I am thoughtful. | |
| 13 | Emma: I wondered if perhaps you might be so kind as to bring me some punch. | Io mi stavo chiedendo Se potreste essere così gentile da andarmi a prendere un punch. |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | Mr Elton: I only hope I can complete the task quickly enough- | Spero solo di poterlo fare abbastanza celermente. |
| 16 | Emma: Please! I could not enjoy it if I knew that you hurried! | Vi prego. Non lo gradirei se sapessi che vi siete affrettato. |

Humour in interlingual subtitling, as suggested by Delabastita, involves shifts which fail to produce a counterpart such as the existence of alliteration at sub. no. 12 in which the “th” sound is not rendered in the target text. Substitutions and compensations, often cited as the best way out by Delia Chiaro, are not applicable in all cases, and, as a result, half-translations and semi-substitutions also occur, unfortunately not always with good results. Mr Elton's illocutionary act (sub. no. 15) reveals his chivalric approach to women as exemplified by the lexical item “task” whose romantic allure and reference to courtly love's tasks and tests that a knight should perform in order to prove his love are lost in the over-simplified translation “Spero solo di poterlo fare / abbastanza celermente”. The semantic, pragmatic and comic effects of the source text wordplay recall the knightly service to a lady but they lose their specificity due to the process of what David Katan calls ‘chunking up’, involving replacing the source text with a more general translation or what Delabastita calls *detraction*, where the translation results in a reduction of the verbal and non-verbal semiotics. This omission at word level undertranslating British humour may be ascribed to time and space constraints since dialogues must be condensed in order to fit into short captions. From this perspective, the comic effect is reduced in Italian subtitles favouring sense over irony. All evidence suggests that the segmentation and line breaks are aimed at reflecting the dialogue's dynamics and in a way at rendering speech in writing. This is what Díaz-Cintas calls rhetorical segmentation which tries to take some of the meaningful features of spoken language into account: hesitations and pauses, or the playfulness of quick repartees. For instance, the two-line subtitle no. 16 which is segmented violating grammatical cohesion since the phrasal verb “se sapessi che” is split, seems to give emphasis and suspense to some climactic part of the speech act in order to increase its comic effect. This rhetorical segmentation strategy seems to confirm Luise von Flotow's words according to which “language is not only a tool for communication but also a manipulative tool”.⁸

⁸ Luise von Flotow, *Translation and Gender: Translating in the 'Era of Feminism'* (London & New York: Routledge, 2016), 8.

As far as the concept of superiority is concerned, Vandaele defines it as a form of increased happiness related to a heightened self-esteem.⁹ Besides causing laughter, humour can also make all or some of the parties involved feel they are better than others. This feature envisions humour as a “very visible social functioning: being superior is always being superior-to-someone”.¹⁰ One can, of course, have different reasons for feeling superior; one might feel superior because one has understood an incongruity, but, as Vandaele points out, a feeling of superiority can also be related to a feeling of aggression, humour in the sense of ‘laughing at’. This then takes us back to Emma, obsessed with her own superiority and importance, and her ironic humour aimed at laughing at or trying to provoke laughter at the expense of Mr Knightley and the other members of the community of Highbury. At timecode 00:26:03, Emma asks Mr Elton to contribute a riddle for Harriet’s book but Mr Knightley, quite offended at not being invited to write a riddle, requires an explanation for this form of impoliteness. Emma sarcastically replies that “Your entire personality is a riddle, Mr Knightley” and she continues by ridiculing his superiority of mind: “I thought you were overqualified.”

Script	Subtitles (00:26:03)
1 Mr Knightley: Emma, you didn’t ask me to contribute a riddle.	Emma, non mi avete chiesto di partecipare.
2 Emma: Your entire personality is a riddle, Mr Knightley. I thought you were overqualified.	La vostra personalità è di per sé una sciarada. Siete di un livello troppo superiore.

In this careful segmentation of the information distributed in two-liners rather than one-liners, the subtitler aims at reinforcing incongruity and suspense. To attain this objective, subtitles are structured in such a way that they are not semantically and syntactically self-contained. The larger use of two-liners may be ascribed to the fact that, as suggested by Brondeel,¹¹ two-line subtitles are preferable to two successive one-liners since the overall reading time in two-liners seems to offer the viewer more reading comfort. It is not a case that Emma’s speech acts are distributed into two separate two-liners employing rhetorical segmentation, and eliminating (at sub. no. 2) the name of Mr Knightley in appellative construction. This omission at word level is necessary to reduce the number of characters in the Italian language whose prolixity forces the subtitler to use other omissions at sentence level (“I thought”). In this peculiar case, the Italian translation is aimed at increasing the sense of humour by applying Vandaele’s strategy of superiority as exemplified by the lexical choice (“overqualified” > “troppo superiore”) focusing on the semantic field of superiority rather than qualification. Likewise, at timecode 00: 29: 08, when talking about the upcoming Weston ball, Mr Knightley expresses his dislike of dancing asserting that he would rather fetch the dog stick. Emma’s ironic speech act is all the more amusing since she replies “I’ll try to remember to bring it to the ball” comparing Mr Knightley to a dog and thereby establishing her superior, master-like position in relation to him. In terms of comic effects, the sentence “I have no taste for it” has been omitted since it appears to be a “dispensable element”,¹² according to Irena Kovačič’s classification, which adds nothing to the subtitled information “Preferirei piuttosto rincorrere / quel bastone”.

⁹ Jeroen Vandaele, “Each Time We Laugh. Translated Humour in Screen Comedy”, in Jeroen Vandaele, ed., *Translation and the (Re)Location of Meaning: Selected Papers of the CETRA Research Seminars in Translation Studies 1994-1996* (Leuven: CETRA, 1999), 241.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Herman Brondeel, “Teaching Subtitling Routines”, *Meta*, 34.1 (1994), 28.

¹² According to Kovačič, there is a three-level hierarchy of discourse elements in subtitling: The indispensable elements (that must be translated); the partly dispensable elements (that can be condensed); the dispensable elements (that can be omitted).

	Script	Subtitles (00:29:08)
1	Emma: Well, then you shall have to dance yourself!	Beh, potreste ballare anche voi.
2	Mr Knightley: I have no taste for it. I’d rather fetch that stick.	Preferirei piuttosto rincorrere quel bastone.
3	Emma: I’ll try to remember to bring it to the ball.	Cercherò di ricordarmi di portarlo al ballo.

These morbid jokes follow Emma’s and Mr Knightley’s quarrel about Harriet Smith’s refusal of Robert Martin’s proposal in which Emma reveals her inferiority to Mr Knightley, older (sixteen years older than Emma) and morally superior to her. Guilty of influencing and flattering the uncultured Harriet, Emma, who is engaged in a bit of archery while arguing over Harriet, is accused by Mr Knightley of vanity and senselessness: “Vanity working on a weak mind produces every kind of mischief” (00:23:44) and “Better be without sense than misapply it as you do” (00:24:04). But Mr Knightley’s last joke is uttered with an amused smile: “Try not to kill my dogs” (McGrath 1996) confirming Vandaele’s ideas about what he calls ‘factors of humour’, i.e. superiority and incongruities, which are not sufficient conditions for creating humour. These deviations from the norm do not automatically provoke laughter. Humour does not function in isolation. It is not only rooted in its co-text (the dialogue sequence or scene/sequence in which it occurs, for instance), but also in socio-cultural, linguistic and even personal contexts. Without seeing Emma’s arrows ending up further and further from the target, as a result of her incapacity to defend herself from Mr Knightley’s accusations and without noticing that Mr Knightley’s dogs are lying close to the target, the viewer cannot grasp the essence of his joke. In this case, the Italian subtitler has transferred the perceived humour into the target text and reformulated it into a new utterance that will hopefully provoke an increased effect on the target viewer. “Try not to kill my dogs” has been subtitled with “Risparmiate almeno i cani” implying Emma’s bad influence and mischievous acts could affect his dogs as well. Deliberately inserting the adverb “almeno”, which is used to add a comic relief (positive comment) about a generally negative situation, the subtitler not only increases the number of characters allowed per line (39 is the maximum number of characters allowed per line), but he/she raises the degree of comic content associated with the superiority of Mr Knightley patronising Emma for her mistakes.

2. Emma’s voice as the semiotic fabric of the film

McGrath’s attempts to creatively reproduce the ambiguities of the voice in Emma (her free indirect speech), are enacted more specifically through the sound bridge, a purely cinematic device according to which the human voice stretches across one scene and begins over the images of the successive. Seen more as a disembodied voice which is heard talking outside the frame before the viewer actually sees the character, the sound bridge is, in my view, another way of expressing Emma’s disorienting personality and morbid irony, which is able to confuse rather than identify, to dislocate rather than locate. This editing technique is used many times to signify the importance of Emma’s narrative change upon Jane Fairfax’s arrival in Highbury, a woman that she finds impossible because as Mr K. ironically suggests, “she divides our attentions from you [Emma]!” (00:47:54). The sound bridge is also able to stress the ironic incongruities of Emma who, deeply offended for not receiving an invitation for a party at the Coles, employs the suspended modal negative construction “But I cannot” with a negative polarity (implying “I cannot accept that”) when desperately waiting for the invitation to arrive and then, in the following scene with a positive nuance in which she expresses her pleasure for joining the party: “I cannot tell you how delighted I am to have been invited, Mrs Cole!” (00:54:03).

But the most hilarious use of sound bridge as an aural joke is when Emma’s inner thoughts in voiceover form revealing her furious reaction toward the “vulgar, base, conceited and crass” Mrs Elton

who dares to call Mr Knightley simply Knightley are repeated loudly by Emma herself to Harriet with exactly the same words: “Never seen him before and she called him Knightley!” (01:05:58). If in the previous two examples, the voice bridge is visually rendered with continuation dots generally used as a bridge at the end of the first subtitle and the beginning of the following one to alert the viewer visually of this connection, then in the last example the same subtitle remains on screen when there is a shot change so that there are no dividing frontiers between scenes and subtitles. This unusual timing or cueing, consisting in the in and out times of subtitles, i.e. the exact moment when a subtitle should appear on screen and when it should disappear, does nothing but mirror Emma’s incongruities with comic effects.

If the opening scene of McGrath’s *Emma* is introduced by a disembodied female voice describing a “young woman, who knew how this world should be runned” then the BBC Miniseries *Emma* (2009) opens with a male voice-over narration sentimentalizing maternal mortality giving voice to the repressed absent mother plot. This male omniscient narrator creates further confusion in the storytelling and the central consciousness of the film is further obscured with the introduction of Emma’s own voice-over.

Unlike McGrath’s *Emma*, whose inner thoughts appear to be an interior monologue so interlaced with narration that the blend is indefinable, BBC *Emma*’s off-screen voice is indicated with the use of italics, also employed for putting emphasis on meaningful and comic words. As aptly summarised by Díaz-Cintas italics are useful to call attention to certain elements of the text. In particular, one of italics’ unique functions in subtitling is to represent voices from within, e.g. thoughts, voices that are in a character’s mind, interior monologues, voices that are heard in dreams, and the like.

The paraverbal features of BBC *Emma*’s speech (intonation, accent, voice quality rhythm, speed and pausing) contribute in delineating what Bosseaux defines as “the semiotic fabric of films”.¹³ As opposed to McGrath’s *Emma* who delivered speeches at a rather slow and sedate pace with a round, dry voice, and regular, imperceptible breathing, BBC *Emma*’s speech pattern is characterised by a very fast pace with hardly any variations aimed at summarising quickly her feelings and thoughts. With its inventive reworking of the recognizable *Emma*’s feminist tropes shedding light on minor events and untold stories, the 2009 BBC series distances itself from the slow-paced literariness of McGrath’s adaptation whose incomparable comic appeal derives from *Emma*’s central consciousness mirroring or keeping a journal, voicing her prayers and commenting on the members of Highbury community. One of the most hilarious scenes in the movie is at timecode 01: 38: 44 when Emma tries desperately not to think about Mr Knightley but, as a perfect example of female incongruity, she fails to respect her intentions with comic effects:

Ho provato
a non pensare a lui in giardino

dove per tre volte
ho interrogato i petali delle margherite

per conoscere i suoi sentimenti
per Harriet.

Penso che farò togliere
le margherite dal giardino.

Sono soltanto
dei piccoli fiori mercenari.

¹³ Charlotte Bosseaux, “Buffy the Vampire Slayer Characterization in the Musical Episode of the TV Series”, *The Translator*, 14.2 (2008), 345.

Emma’s use of irony explains the great pleasure viewers take in audiovisual adaptations of Austen’s novel. Not only is *Emma* a text that recounts pleasures – the pleasure of romance, the pleasure of courtship, the pleasure of matchmaking, the pleasure of plotting, and so forth – but it is also a text of pleasure in the humoristic sense. The pleasure viewers/readers find in *Emma*, extends to bliss, *into the pleasure deriving from laughter*. Humour – a psychological and a cognitive manifestation – and laughter – a neurophysiological phenomenon – are not always correlated but *Emma* appears to be a universally funny text which is able to amuse and entertain any individual no matter their cultural origin or contextual framework.

3. Conclusions

McGrath’s filmic adaptation of Austen’s *Emma* appears to be a paramount example of how gender and humour become the real protagonists of this comedy of manners. Though temporally-bound to the late eighteenth century, the filmic dialogues are first and foremost the quintessential representation of the battle of the sexes carried out with verbally expressed humour. Such strategies of humour as incongruity and superiority are aptly employed by male and female characters with different albeit similar intentions. Likewise, the violations of the maxims of politeness result in hilarious effects especially as regards Emma whose personality and linguistic verbosity produce unforgettable moments of female irony. Her negative politeness is of particular interest since she presents her statements in an ambiguous or indirect way resulting in a series of comic scenes.

From an interlingual subtitling perspective, McGrath’s *Emma* provides the most amusing examples of female irony as embodied by the protagonist herself whose speech acts, violations of politeness maxims, incongruity and superiority are expressions of femininity. In the verbal hilarious battles between Emma and Mr Knightley the viewer may find the quintessential opposition female wit vs male humour which sometimes appears to be over-translated in Italian subtitles. All text-reduction shifts are aimed at reproducing the verbal and non-verbal irony of characters whose gender roles are stereotyped with original and subtle audio-visual results.

Taking McGrath’s *Emma* as a case study is a useful approach to assess gender and humour in audiovisual translation. This period comedy film representing Emma’s false sense of class superiority in comic vein is a journey through the heroine’s romantic destiny. Emma’s female irony with her strengths and frailties is so appealing for the contemporary audience since she embodies the mind style of women constantly trying to attest their roles in a patriarchal society.

The Feminist Revolution of Words. Translating the Feminist Discourse through Newspapers

Abstract: Gender differences and hierarchical relations, cultural values and expected gender behaviours: all these elements are reflected into languages in terms of syntax, lexicon and contexts of use. At the same time, a language is the privileged territory for its reference culture.

The feminist perspective has given relevant contribution to the creation of the feminist gender discourse by offering values and expressions designed to eradicate the established androcentric language, and by defining key words and concepts: the Spanish *empoderamiento* (empowerment), *techo de cristal* (glass ceiling), *inequidad de género* (gender inequality) are some of the terms which were born with the feminist stance and became part of a discourse on gender spread through the written medium, in particular press. As a specific literary genre, journalism has indeed welcomed the features of the feminist discourse, providing a powerful communicative tool for the feminist standpoint.

The aim of this paper is to investigate the relation between feminist theories and the feminist language, observe its main features on Spanish newspapers and its influence on the creation of gender identity.

Keywords: *feminism, gender, identity, language*

1. Introduction

When observing the current feminist ideology¹ – which emphasizes the idea that women and men belong to different subcultures – it is possible to examine issues of gender and language from a lexical standpoint, taking into account the perspective offered by a variety of fields, such as applied linguistics or sociolinguistics. By doing so, the study of women's language can be dealt with outside a framework of oppression and lack of power. In fact, in recent years, women have started to bring to light many 'invisible' problems related to their condition 'through' language by coining new expressions – from the 'double day' (at work and at home) to the so-called 'glass ceiling' – and have called for unity and cooperation among each other from the pages of global newspapers. This renewed interest around feminist ideas is also confirmed by statistics on online searches, which saw 'feminism' as the most searched word in 2017 according to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary.

Feminisms arise, as Castro Vázquez states, on the margin of the dominant discourse due to a situation of inequality.² It will be shown here how feminism – which has traditionally denounced this socio-historical disadvantage – seeks to subvert the established male domination and to repair this inequality by proposing deep changes in all languages – which of course are never neutral, but always loaded with connotative values. In general, it could be observed that those phenomena reflecting changes that have taken or are taking place within a community or society are typically the starting point for much linguistic innovation. In relation to this, Freixa points out that:

¹ For further notions on feminist theory see, among the others: Nancy C. M. Hartsock, *The Feminist Standpoint Revisited, and Other Essays* (New York: Routledge, 2019); Janet Radcliffe Richards, *The Skeptical Feminist (RLE Feminist Theory): A Philosophical Enquiry* (New York: Routledge, 2012); Mary G. Dietz, "Current Controversies in Feminist Theory", *Annual Review of Political Science*, 6.1 (2003), 399-431.

² Olga Castro Vázquez, "Género y traducción. Elementos discursivos para una reescritura feminista", *Lectora*, 14 (2008), 287.

The reality to be expressed implies different psychological reactions on the part of the speakers as individuals and as members of a social group, and these diverse psychological and social motivations find expression in the ability of each speaker to constantly produce new lexical units.³

All these reactions – expressed at the lexical level through the introduction, among the others, of loanwords, adaptations of foreign terms, semantic calques, false friends, invention of new terms – are spread through social media and the Internet, and of course through the international press. As a matter of fact, this paper will only consider the latter medium, given the authoritativeness that print media (and newspapers particularly, albeit in their online version) still seem to retain. As Alvar Esquerda correctly claims, the language of journalism serves as one of the means of promoting and spreading the use of new words and expressions in all fields of language:

It is therefore not only a rich source of examples through which to illustrate the processes of formation and incorporation of new words into a language, but also a means of taking the pulse of the vitality of a language in order to measure its ability to withstand the arrival of foreign words and its creative potential, qualities which both help to keep it alive producing novelties at every instant.⁴

For what concerns journalism as a literary genre, its features were clearly recognizable and undoubtedly peculiar from the very beginning. By the end of the 19th century, journalism was the privileged communication tool for news, politics, culture, arts, advertisement, and many other fields; above all, newspapers and magazines configured as an open space for narratives, a virtually unlimited medium available to writers, thinkers, ideologists to communicate their ideas and opinions, their proposals and perspectives. This feature luckily stands to the present day and, over time, global social movements have spoken from the pages of the world's newspapers: feminism (at least in Western countries) makes no exception.

Following genre classification, journalism falls within the category of non-fiction and is characterized by an informative and communicative purpose which makes it close to other kinds of informative texts. The language includes lexicon drawn from the general language and limited specialized terminologies (from various fields of language for special purposes). As for syntax and discourse analysis, this is where journalism differs from other literary genres, being subject to specific rules and constraints also due to space limits; objectivity, accuracy and transparency are other criteria which should be met – in terms of language, contents, organization and presentation of the information – in journalistic writing, as part of a journalist ethics embedded in this profession.

Given the intrinsic global nature of journalism, the inclination towards internationalism is especially evident in the introduction, appropriation and use of foreign words and concepts, a topic that has always been of interest in language and translation studies on journalism. The possibilities connected to the translation of foreign words and expressions on newspapers sparked linguistics research at least from the 1960s until the present day. In translation studies, different methods and procedures for translating foreign terms have been examined, for example those based on Venuti's foreignization or domestication strategies,⁵ and attention has been given to the actual practice of translation beyond theory: since, in translational terms, it is the journalist of the receiving culture who decides on the translation of lexicon from a different source culture, it appears that translation in the field of journalism is mostly a matter of agency, political ideology, and culture/decision-making processes.

³ Judith Freixa, "La dimensió social de la neologia" in Maria Teresa Cabré et al., eds., *Lèxic i neologia* (Barcelona: Observatori de Neologia, Institut Universitari de Lingüística Aplicada, Universitat Pompeu Fabra, 2002), 70. Translation by the author.

⁴ Manuel Alvar Ezquerda, *Palabras nuevas en los periódicos de hoy, en la lengua española a finales del milenio* (Burgos: Caja de Burgos, 1998), 40. Translation by the author.

⁵ Lawrence Venuti, *The Translator's Invisibility* (New York: Routledge, 1995).

Consequently, this research aims to observe lexical innovation in the digital version of the Spanish newspaper, *La Vanguardia*, in a period that spans from the 2017 U.S. election campaign to the present day. It should be added that some of the terms considered in the present corpus were coined before 2017, but have been revitalised after some major socio-political events; indeed, international journalism was, in this period, marked by the impact of President Trump's male chauvinist political speeches and by a subsequent wave of protests at the global level which led to different reactions to sexist attitudes on the part of feminists.

For what concerns the broader framework on gender and language studies, despite the fact that most of the work carried out to date considers phonetics and phonology, morpho-syntax, discourse analysis and translation,⁶ very little research has been done concerning the influence of the most recent feminist movement on the innovation of lexical units with a social function. This study hopes to contribute to fill this gap.

As regards methodology issues, the psychological, social and practical aspects that influence the updating of the Spanish language – such as, for example, the role played by the Fundéu, the foundation advised by the Real Academia Española (RAE) to promote the good use of Spanish in the media – were taken into account so as to identify the lexical units derived from English – in accordance with the theoretical framework given by Cabré,⁷ of which more will be said further on. Among the considered neologisms, the presence of foreign words, of words formed by lexical revitalisation and of structural calques with metaphorical value was highlighted. For each word, explanation on its first appearance in the English language was given, as well as term definition and Spanish adapted equivalent; furthermore, neologisms were analysed in context in order to observe their function in response to given communicative needs. Finally, some filters were established and applied to the indicated lexical units in order to obtain a preliminary indication of their degree of neologicity, such as their introduction in other lexicographic sources⁸ and their frequency in the *Obneo* database (the Observatori de Neologia of the Institut Universitari de Lingüística Aplicada at Universitat Pompeu Fabra).

2. Borrowed neologisms: *foreign words*

There are many foreign words – foreign entries that have not been adapted to the phonetic and morphologic system of the target/receiving language⁹ – connected to the struggle for equality and justice of different social movements in Spanish. Although many newspaper articles tend to keep the original English terms, an attempt has been made to provide possible translations into Spanish based on specific elements of which more will be said further on. With reference to the analysis of Spanish newspapers, one of the words that marked the lexicon of the feminist discourse in recent years was the term ‘mansplaining’. According to *Know Your Meme*, the word appeared for the first time in a blog comment published on May 21, 2008. In 2009 it reached the *Urban Dictionary* website and in 2012 and 2014 the *Oxford Dictionary* considered it as one of the most ingenious and most used words by feminists on social networks. This word is the blending of the words man and explaining.

The exact definition of ‘mansplaining’ given by Lily Rothman, writer for *The Atlantic*, is “explaining without regard to the fact that the explainee knows more than the explainer, often done by a man to a

⁶ See, for example, the seminal work by Deborah Cameron, “Gender, Language, and Discourse: A Review Essay”, *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 23.4 (1998), 945-973; Janet Holmes and Miriam Meyerhoff, eds., *The Handbook of Language and Gender* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2003).

⁷ Maria Teresa Cabré, “Aspectes sobre la neologia: La «novetat lèxica» a través de dos diaris catalans” in Cabré et al., eds., *Lèxic i neologia*, 57-68.

⁸ In particular, *El diccionario Clave* online, which includes expressions and terms of daily use, the *Diccionario de uso del español* by María Moliner, the 23rd edition of the *Diccionario de la lengua española* (updated to 2017).

⁹ Valentin García Yebra, *Teoría y práctica de la traducción* (Madrid: Gredos, 1894), 333-352.

woman”.¹⁰ Rebecca Solnit, who is considered the creator of the term, gives an example of mansplaining in her article for the *Los Angeles Times*, “Men who explain things”.¹¹ She was at a party, and a man was talking about a very interesting book about the photographer Edward Muybridge which had been highly acclaimed by the *New York Times*. While the man was describing the book, Rebecca thought it was very similar to hers, when her friend said to Mr. Very Important (as she calls him): “She wrote that book”. He didn’t listen to her. She had to tell him three or four times until the man realized that he had in front of him the very writer of that interesting book.

Rebecca Solnit, in her article, comments:

Men explain things to me, and to other women, whether or not they know what they’re talking about. Some men. Every woman knows what I mean. It’s the presumption that makes it hard, at times, for any woman in any field; that keeps women from speaking up and from being heard when they dare.¹²

According to lexicographer Mark Peter, mansplain was so successful that it generated the suffix (or ‘libfix’) ‘splainin’, a contraction of explaining. The word has come to encompass all types of offensive and condescending language, such as ‘melaninsplaining’ (for white people) and ‘ablesplaining’ (for non-disabled people). Some use this suffix for a different purpose, flipping and subverting its main meaning to create female versions of mansplaining: ‘womansplaining’. In addition, it has been noted that the condescending act of mansplaining has extended not only to gender divisions but also to racial politics and human rights. This obsession has given rise to other compound terms formed by the prefix -man.¹³ These three letters can turn almost any noun, verb or adjective into coarser, sexist, vulgar and even childish words, as in the case of:

- ‘Maninterrupting’: unnecessary interruption of a woman’s speech by a man. Proposed by *Time* in 2015, it is very common in business meetings and even presidential debates, courtesy of Donald Trump to Hillary Clinton;
- ‘Manderstanding’: It is said of those private jokes between men that only they can understand. This behavior is sexist when it is done with women around, who are baffled and often outraged because the jokes are usually sexist;
- ‘Manslamming’: the phenomenon of men not letting anyone pass at the entrances or exits of public spaces, resulting in a ‘collision’, almost always with women;

Other terms include ‘manologue’, the monologue of a man, and ‘manspreading’, a word coined in 2013 that Fundéu proposed to translate as male or sexist leg-spreading. These are indeed practices that transcend cultures. Translating mansplaining would be to assume that this practice also exists in Spanish. According to the literature blog *latorredemontaigne*:

The Spanish word “explicar”, to explain, has an interesting etymology. “Plica”, in Latin, means fold, like the folds of a cloth, while the prefix “ex”, among other things, gives the idea of opening and closing. From there, explaining is the same as unfolding, clarifying, smoothing. If we get serious, “androplicar” (a possible translation for *mansplaining*?) would be something like complicating things in the masculine style, folding like a man. It’s strange and twisted. But isn’t it that – when a man wants to explain what a woman already knows, or when he doesn’t let her finish her sentence, or when he wants, in one way or another, to silence her – what he’s doing is twisting a situation that, in its normality, in equality, is so simple?¹⁴

¹⁰ Lily Rothman, “A Cultural History of Mansplaining”, *The Atlantic* (2012), <https://www.theatlantic.com/sexes/archive/2012/11/a-cultural-history-of-mansplaining/264380/>, accessed 1 December 2018.

¹¹ Rebecca Solnit, “Men Who Explain Things”, *Los Angeles Times*, 4 (2008), 1-2.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ <https://www.visualthesaurus.com/cm/dictionary/mansplaining-spawns-a-new-suffix/>, accessed 1 December 2018.

¹⁴ <https://latorredemontaigne.wordpress.com/2015/06/16/mansplaining-una-nueva-palabra-en-busca-de-traduccion/>, accessed 1 December 2018.

Accordingly, *androplicar* has the meaning of folding and closing a speech, or folding the woman in order to shut her up.

On the other hand, Fundéu proposed the neologism *machoexplicación* as a valid alternative to refer to this masculine habit. The neologism *machoexplicación* (from *macho*, male chauvinist, and *explicación*, explanation), which is already used and which shares the same informal character as the English original, is an alternative that adequately captures its meaning and also allows the creation of other words from the same lexical family, such as the noun *machoexplicador* or the verb *machoexplicar*. A more formal translation could employ the word *condescendencia* (+ *masculina*, male, or *machista*, macho, depending on the nuance): in Spanish, the verb *condescender* means, according to the *Diccionario de la lengua española* (23rd ed.), “accommodating oneself out of kindness to someone's taste and will”, a term which is often used with a negative nuance. Therefore, in the analysed articles, it would be appropriate to substitute the foreign word with the equivalent *machoexplicación* or *condescendencia machista*:

We can also talk about mansplaining [...]. All these concepts allude to various ways of perpetuating male chauvinist attitudes that tend to go unnoticed, that is, micro-sexisms.¹⁵

In that scene, one thinks one is going to see the classic 'mansplaining' and it's not like that, but the hypocrisy of that man and the shame he has suffered is undressed.¹⁶

The same can be observed for the word ‘manspreading’. This compound – which emerged in 2014 and was incorporated into the Oxford Dictionary in August 2015 – is an informal term that alludes to the way some men sit, especially on public transports, with their legs open, thus invading the space of adjacent seats. After a period of linguistic implementation within the English-speaking countries, the word was brought to light internationally and in particular in Spain in 2017, as protests by both feminist groups and the authorities responsible for some public transport networks sparked heated debate on the issue:

The Community of Madrid is not planning to take concrete action against ‘manspreading’ on the Metro.¹⁷

The different ways of sitting in the subway have lately become news, especially the male *despatarre* and the campaigns of different cities against this example of micro-sexism and lack of civility.¹⁸

The terms *despatarre* or *despatarre masculino* are possible Spanish alternatives to the English ‘manspreading’, as suggested by the Fundación del Español Urgente. The Spanish verb *despatarrar(se)* is, according to the *Diccionario académico*, a colloquial term that means “to open the legs excessively”, therefore the derived noun *despatarre* adapts perfectly to the action described by ‘manspreading’.

¹⁵ Clara Polo Sabat, “Micromachismos o formas sutiles de perpetuar agresiones sexuales”, *La Vanguardia* (15 November 2016), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/muyfan/20161105/411602705837/machismo-micromachismos-violencia-abusos-mujeres.html>, accessed 1 December 2018. Translation by the author.

¹⁶ Antonio Martín Guirado, “Chastain: La representación de la mujer en el cine no ha sido certera”, *La Vanguardia* (22 December 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/vida/20171202/433369239876/chastain-la-representacion-de-la-mujer-en-el-cine-no-ha-sido-certera.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

¹⁷ “El gobierno no tomará medidas específicas contra el ‘manspreading’ en metro”, *La Vanguardia* (6 June 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/local/madrid/20170606/423229310134/el-gobierno-no-tomara-medidas-especificas-contr-el-manspreading-en-metro.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

¹⁸ Vivo, “Cruzar las piernas como en esta foto no es tan malo como parece”, *La Vanguardia* (18 June 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/vivo/salud/20170618/423487574150/cruzar-las-piernas-viral-efectos-salud.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

Despite the doubts of some critics such as Juana Gallego,¹⁹ the success of these words is indisputable, probably because they encompass broad sets of situations that go beyond anecdotal or subjective experiences.

Among the adapted foreign words, in recent times the concept of ‘interseccionalidad’ (intersectionality) has been well received by feminist and gender studies at a global level, being defined as “the best contribution made so far to gender studies”.²⁰ The notion of intersectionality arose when black lesbian feminist collectives denounced, in the mid-1970s, the racial blindness of their white feminist sisters in the United States. Feminist and law theorist Kimberlé Crenshaw first coined the term in 1989 in the well-known article “Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex”. In the text, Crenshaw wanted to rescue from invisibility and omission – both by feminists and anti-racist discourses – the specific experiences of subordination and exploitation of black, poor, and/or immigrant women in the U.S. – which were caused by the combined effect of the social identification categories of class, race, sex/gender, and so on. To explain this legal vacuum, Crenshaw raised the analogy of car traffic at a road junction:

Consider an analogy for traffic in an intersection, coming and going in all four directions. Discrimination, like traffic through an intersection, may flow in one direction, and it may flow in another. If an accident happened in an intersection, it can be caused by cars travelling from any number of directions and, sometimes, from all of them.²¹

With this metaphor Crenshaw pointed out how certain situations of discrimination cannot be identified or adequately addressed from a univocal perspective which does not consider simultaneous interweaving. Therefore, as the following articles demonstrate, the term ‘intersectionality’ refers to the situation in which a particular type of discrimination takes place within two or more categories, all creating a single situation: gender, ethnicity, sexuality, citizenship status, functional diversity, age or education level.

Hillary Clinton's defeat in front of Trump makes it more urgent than ever to read this apostle of intersectionality in feminism, supporting the idea that the movement cannot be just a matter of white university women.²²

In the feminist discourse, moreover, there are many defenders who ask the intersectionality of the struggle to be taken into account. Emmy winner on best script (*Master of None*) Lena Waithe calls for black women to break out of the stereotype. This is why she observes that in every American film there is at least one female character who is black, in a position of power and who is in a healthy relationship.²³

2.1. Borrowed neologisms: *words formed by lexical revitalisation*

When analyzing the lexical evolution of some words, it can be observed how some of them, after falling into disuse, for some reason are revitalised with another meaning or with the same one. This is the case, for instance, of the Spanish word ‘sororidad’ (sorority). The Real Academia’s need to revitalise this

¹⁹ Coordinator of the Master in Gender and Communication at the Autonomous University of Barcelona, he frames neologisms within the tendency of Americans to invent new terms for everything.

²⁰ Leslie Mcall, “The Complexity of Intersectionality”, *Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 30.3 (2005), 1771.

²¹ Kimberlé Crenshaw, “Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory, and Antiracist Politics”, *Feminist Legal Theory* (New York: Routledge, 2018), 149.

²² “Con espíritu indie”, *La Vanguardia* (9 December 2016).

²³ Pere Solà Gimferrer, “¿El test de Bechdel está pasado de moda? Creadoras proponen otras alternativas”, *La Vanguardia* (22 December 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/series/20171222/433813779773/test-de-bechdel-feminismo-interseccionalidad-series.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

word with a new ethical and political meaning arose after Fundéu qualified it as a ‘valid term’. However, it is not a new word: as the CORDE consultation shows, it was already used (without italics and without inverted commas) by M. De Unamuno when, in his *La Tía Tula* (1921), he spoke of *matria* and *sororidad* – both deriving from the Latin *mater* and *soror*, mother and sister; it is curious to note that both *sororidad* and its English equivalent ‘sorority’ are rare compared to the male equivalents *fraternidad* (in Spanish) and ‘fraternity’ (in English). The term *sororidad* is formed from the Latin word *soror*, -oris, meaning “sister, companion, lover, sister of a society, same and similar to another”, plus the quality suffix -tat/-itat, in Spanish -dad/-idad. Hence, *sororidad* is “the quality or condition (-idad) of belonging to a society (soror) of women”. The following articles show how women make a call to unity:

The women of the governing group of the capital declare that they symbolically participate to a “historical day” with an “internationalist spirit and under the principles of sorority” that unite millions of women.²⁴

On her part, Pontevedra’s number-four María Pierres, called for ‘sorority’ and non-competition.²⁵

However, the revitalisation of this word is to be attributed to the Mexican feminist and anthropologist Marcela Legarde de los Ríos, who proposed it in relation to the distressing issue of the so-called “Juárez’s murders” which have been perpetrated in Chihuahua, México, since 1993. According to Lagarde, sorority is:

An ethical, political and practical dimension of contemporary feminism. It is a female experience that leads to the search for positive relationships and for existential and political alliance (...) with other women to contribute with specific actions to the social elimination of all forms of oppression, to offer mutual support to achieve the generic power of all women and the vital empowerment of each woman.²⁶

Following the *Diccionario de Americanismos*:

Sororidad. (From Eng. sorority). f. PR. A group based on friendship and reciprocity among women who share the same ideal and work towards the same goal.

The spirit of cooperation and friendship, therefore, emerges as a distinctive feature of this term – in line with the meaning of ‘sorority’ in English, indicating a society in school or university (“a society of female university or college students”).²⁷ On the other hand, the relationship of brotherhood and solidarity established among women to create support networks that spark social changes with the objective of achieving equality is defined with the word ‘sisterhood’. This word already has equivalents in Spanish: the neutral *hermandad* (brotherhood) and *fraternidad* (fraternity), which the RAE defines as “friendship or affection between brothers or among those who are treated as such”. This reflection leads to the assumption that language is not neutral, but is a vehicle of values, traditions and ideological positions, and highlights the need to coin a new term to refer to the ideological union among women.

Moving forward, the verb *empoderar* (to empower) and the noun *empoderamiento* (empowerment) also abound in the lexicon of social movements and unleash the perplexity of many speakers when

²⁴ “Carmena y sus concejales se suman al paro feminista por miles de razones”, *La Vanguardia* (8 March 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/vida/20170308/42657593874/carmena-y-sus-concejales-se-suman-al-paro-feminista-por-miles-de-razones.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

²⁵ “Leiceaga se compromete ante mujeres del PSdeG a recuperar la ley de igualdad en el trabajo del bipartito”, *La Vanguardia* (17 September 2016), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/vida/20160917/41383429378/leiceaga-se-compromete-ante-mujeres-del-psdeg-a-recuperar-la-ley-de-igualdad-en-el-trabajo-del-bipartito.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

²⁶ Marcela Lagarde y de los Ríos, “Pacto en mujeres. Sororidad”, *Aportes* (2006), <https://www.asociacionag.org.ar/pdfaportes/25/09.pdf>, accessed 1 December 2018.

²⁷ <https://www.oxforddictionaries.com/>, accessed 1 December 2018.

evoked in public life. According to the RAE and the *Diccionario de Uso del Español* María Moliner, both terms were already circulating in the dictionaries of the 16th and 17th centuries (prior to the creation of the Real Academia). However, they soon fell into disuse, displaced by their synonyms *apoderar* and *apoderamiento*. That is why many speakers today take *empoderar* and *empoderamiento* as artificial novelties invented for the occasion. Before the timespan considered, the word *empoderamiento* was dying out in Spanish, while ‘to empower’ and ‘empowerment’ gained strength in English; these were traditionally translated into Spanish as *apoderar* and *apoderamiento*, which is what these terms mean. Thus, both words acquired an additional meaning in Spanish: the action or effect of a collectivity reaching a form of power that was previously denied. In this way, the radical vision of empowerment as an act and a strategy for change was theoretically and politically strengthened by minority groups and feminist elaborations on gender issues. After the Spanish translation of an adapted version of the Beijing Declaration and Platform of 1995, the word entered the official language with a new connotation. It did not take long to make to empower and *empoderar* linguistic equivalents, despite the availability of *apoderar* and the possibility of broadening one of its meanings (“to become strong”) – as had been done in English. These anglicised uses caused the RAE to take a double decision concerning the 2014 Dictionary:

- reintroducing the old *empoderar* from the 16th century – 13 years after discarding it in 2001 – with an etymology derived from *en* and *poder* (“bestowing a power”), yet marking it as disused word;
- adding a second entry for *empoderar*, originated from the equivalent English word with its modern meaning as assimilated in Spanish:

To empower [a socio-economically disadvantaged group] to improve their living conditions through self-management. The corresponding noun is *empoderamiento*: the action or effect of empowerment.

Starting from 2017 – what, in the Spanish context, has been considered as ‘the year of women’ –²⁸ this expression has also carried another dimension, which includes being aware of one’s individual power and the recovery of the women’s own dignity as persons:

Along the same lines, the ‘Decalogue of Good Practices’ has been developed for the processing of information related to sexist aggressions. In addition, in order to promote the empowerment of women, the School of Feminisms has been set up with various training actions and, to strengthen the economic autonomy of women, a commitment has been made to make women who suffer from situations of economic precariousness visible.²⁹

Through her satirical cartoons full of violence, humour and a strong sense of vindication, the Barcelona illustrator Raquel Riba Rossy seeks to promote female empowerment. And she does so by talking openly about her sexual frustrations, covert sexism and couple conflicts which is impossible not to identify with.³⁰

Therefore, empowerment as derived from the theory and practice of feminism can be summarised, in accordance to Rowlands³¹ as quoted by De León,³² as a process in which women, in a context of gender disadvantage, acquire or reinforce their capacities, strategies and prominent position, both individually

²⁸ Following Jara Atienza, “Los libros que han convertido el 2017 en el año de las mujeres”, *La Vanguardia* (20 December 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/cultura/20171220/433759800134/cultura-libros-lista-feministas-2017-navidad.html>.

²⁹ “Pamplona se suma al día contra la violencia hacia las mujeres con teatro, cinefórum y una mesa redonda”, *La Vanguardia* (17 November 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/local/navarra/20171117/432946215368/pamplona-se-suma-al-dia-contra-la-violencia-hacia-las-mujeres-con-teatro-cineforum-y-una-mesa-redonda.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

³⁰ Jara Atienza, “Los libros que han convertido el 2017 en el año de las mujeres”.

³¹ Jo Rowlands, *Questioning Empowerment: Working with Women in Honduras* (UK and Ireland: Oxfam, 1997).

³² Magdalena De León, “Poder y empoderamiento de las mujeres”, *Región y Sociedad*, 11.18 (1999), 190-197.

and collectively, to achieve an autonomous life in which they can participate – in terms of equality, access to resources, recognition and decision-making – at all levels of personal and social life. Consultation of the most relevant corpus of Spanish – the Reference Corpus of Current Spanish (CREA) and the Corpus of Spanish of the 21st Century (CORPES XXI) – yields significant results in terms of cases and trends in use linked to the gender perspective. The word *empoderar* co-appears 115 times with the noun *mujer* (woman), evidencing a strong associative power between the two entries.

2.2. Borrowed neologisms: *structural calques with metaphoric value*

Lexical calques are special types of borrowings that do not imitate the actual phonetic entity (signifier) of the foreign model, but rather two more ‘internal’ aspects: the morphological schema or construction, and the meaning in its metaphorical value, typical of some English compounds/words/composite words. These types of loans are used by feminist movements mainly to focus on gender stereotypes, labour market segregation based on gender, social and psychological harassment, and the incompatibility of private and public life. These are all related to the concept of micro-sexism, *micromachismo*, a Spanish term coined in 1991 by Luis Bonino Méndez in response to the need to find a term that conceptualised less perceptible types of gender violence. These metaphors have had quite significant rhetorical success, and one of their important aspects is that they play a necessary role in our understanding of the world as we find them in the discursive construction of all spheres of life – since they constitute a fundamental part of our conceptual system.

Consequently, different kinds of metaphors to describe the challenges that women and other disadvantaged groups have to face both in the world of business and in politics exist, among which: *suelos pegajosos* (sticky floors), *muros maternos* (maternity walls), *tuberías con goteras* (leaky pipes), *escaleras mecánicas de cristal* (glass escalators), *laberinto* (labyrinth), *precipicio de cristal* (glass cliff). These metaphors are used by both male and female journalists to manipulate social groups and persuade them to adopt certain principles or to act in certain ways.

Many years have passed since the first use of the glass ceiling metaphor in the 1980s by the editor of the Wall Street Journal, Gay Bryant; today it has become a buzzword after candidate Hillary Clinton resorted to it in the wake of her defeat by Republican Donald Trump: “We have not broken the glass ceiling, the tallest and hardest glass ceiling we face, but we will, and I hope sooner than we can think right now”.³³ The expression ‘glass ceiling’³⁴ began to be used with metaphorical allusion to the apparently invisible (glass) and yet very concrete (ceiling) barriers that prevent many highly skilled women from accessing the highest levels of economic, political and cultural power. Since then, the glass ceiling metaphor has been a very useful tool to draw attention to gender discrimination in the workplace and to motivate both research and practical intervention. It has also been included in academic speeches, commentators and legislators’ discourse, and has been extraordinarily successful, enjoying massive popularity among both the press and the general public:

³³ Hillary Clinton, “Hillary Clinton’s Concession Speech – Full Transcript”, *The Guardian* (9 November 2016), <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2016/nov/09/hillary-clinton-concession-speech-full-transcript>, accessed 1 December 2018.

³⁴ Marilyn J. Davidson and Cary L. Cooper, *Shattering the Glass Ceiling: The Woman Manager* (London: Paul Chapman Publishing, 1992), 27.

“I have been considered and well paid and I have lived a real equality, but to a certain extent. There’s this famous glass ceiling and I think that it does exist in theatre. The positions of power are still held more by men”, explains the actress.³⁵

For this reason, the researcher of the UOC’s Internet Interdisciplinary Institute (IN3) and one of the project’s coordinators, Ana M. González Ramos, defends that “it is necessary to change the dynamics of the field and begin to raise young people’s awareness on the need to break the glass ceiling and improve access and visibility for women”.³⁶

Starting from the meaning attributed to the word *techo* (ceiling), other expressions have also been coined as per the Glossary of the University of León:

- *techo de cemento* (cement ceiling): referring to the limits that prevent women from growing politically, socially or entrepreneurially due to their lack of references, maternity, personal life, greater self-criticism or their different way of understanding leadership and professional ambition.
- *techo de diamante* (diamond ceiling): coined by Amelia Valcárcel in her book *La política de las mujeres* (1997, Ediciones Cátedra). It refers to the fact that, in the patriarchal society, the man is an “object of appreciation” and the woman is an “object of desire” (just like a diamond), subordinated to a situation in which the man perpetuates his power.

These invisible barriers are attitudes resulting from traditional expectations, norms and values that hinder women’s full participation in society. Accordingly, similar expressions are:

- *suelo pegajoso* (sticky floor), another significant term coined in 1992 by Catherine Berheide in a report for the Center for Women in Government at SUNY. It is a concept related to the glass ceiling metaphor referring to maternal, conjugal and domestic work, which cause women – charged with responsibilities, emotional and affective burdens that obstruct or impede their professional and personal fulfillment away from the family environment – to walk on a ‘sticky’ surface which holds them back:

The landscape is dark for half the world’s population. If we add that women have to take on tasks that are stereotypically their own, such as caring for the young and the old, cleaning or cooking, it is especially difficult to get rid of the sticky floor that keeps them trapped in this position. And if men don’t help... We get into the dark tunnel of complacency.³⁷

Conversely, the expression *doble jornada* (double-day) describes the everyday life of women who have to face work and domestic or family tasks as the only viable or obligatory horizon. Almost 30 years ago, when a massive flow of women and mothers joined the workforce, Arlie Hochschild, a Berkeley sociologist, wanted to know how families were coping with this revolutionary change. He spent several hours interviewing and observing 50 couples, and he described a phenomenon that he called “double day”: women coming back home from work had to face another round of unpaid housework, besides taking care of children. Therefore, the metaphor represents the double workload borne by women daily and synchronically in the same period of time as men:

³⁵ “Isabel Ordaz. El teatro tiene su propio techo de cristal para las mujeres”, *La Vanguardia* (8 January 2018), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/local/madrid/20180107/434149570799/previsiones-del-lunes-8-de-enero-de-2018.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

³⁶ “Sólo uno de cada cuatro trabajadores del sector tecnológico es mujer”, *La Vanguardia* (30 October 2017), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/vida/20171030/432490445144/solo-uno-de-cada-cuatro-trabajadores-del-sector-tecnologico-es-mujer.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

³⁷ “Fomento al autoempleo femenino”, *Página Siete*, (23 December 2017), <https://www.paginasiete.bo/inversion/2017/12/31/fomento-autoempleo-femenino-164972.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

When Barenys entered the Parliament she combined her work as a deputy with the care of her mother. “Women are always burdened with the work of family care”. And Barenys believes that, even today, women still work a double day. “There is still a long way to go”.³⁸

That is why women are, on the one hand, trapped between the multi-tasks that lock them up/relegate them in maternal, domestic, conjugal and other types of care that impede their professional success and fulfillment and, on the other, subordinated to barriers that hinder their personal advancement.

3. Conclusions

During this study some interesting data about the use of language, especially in the evidenced lexical fields, were observed. On the one hand, it is clear that language is not neutral, but operates as a vehicle of values, traditions and ideological positions; therefore, it is necessary to introduce new words in common language use so that vital changes are produced also in the field of journalism. The use of neological units responds to a denominative or expressive necessity where the speaker plays with language and shows his/her implicit vision of the world in order to seek attention from the interlocutor; also, some units are employed to show or reaffirm his/her belonging to a certain group. On the other hand, there is a significant tendency to acquire loan words from English that, in most cases, undergo processes of adaptation to the phonic and morphological system of the target language. Finally, it can be observed that the language of journalism is an inexhaustible source of lexical creativity. It includes numerous areas of knowledge and reflects linguistic changes that constantly occur in language; it revitalises disused words, unifies other words that were never associated before, forms new lexical expressions/collocations, compound words, and introduces foreign words.

With the aim of observing the relationship between neologicity and modern feminism, some filters can be established, such as the existence of neologisms in other lexicographic sources and their frequency based on data retrieved from Obneo. The majority of neological units is not recorded in the chosen lexicographic sources, with the only exception of ‘empoderamiento’. Therefore, as Cabré³⁹ states, the majority of neologisms score high in neologicity because they do not appear in lexicographic sources different from those used as exclusion corpus. Moreover, the use of certain punctuation marks in *La Vanguardia*, such as inverted commas, appears necessary to point out that a new use of a word is in place – when the new meaning is not considered in dictionaries – or to mark an ‘inexistent’ word (taken from another language, created for the occasion).

In addition, the frequency of neologisms based on data retrieved from Obneo can be considered. In this case, the starting assumption is what Cabré et al.⁴⁰ report, that an inverted relationship is established between frequency and neologicity: “the higher the frequency of appearance, the more stable the neologism is and, consequently, the more the perception of neologicity is lost”. Accordingly, the only word that appears with relevant frequency (more than 10 times) is *empoderamiento*, which underlines the fact that this word has a lesser degree of neologicity, being more stable in Spanish compared to other words. Instead, *interseccionalidad* and *doble jornada* do not appear among frequent terms.

However, an attempt has been made to highlight the attitudes of many different feminist groups that, in recent years, have helped not only to expand new concepts, but to give them strength to the point of stabilizing them in the general language.

³⁸ Laura Aragó, “Mujeres en el parlament. Una lucha para conquistar espacio político”, *La Vanguardia* (12 January 2018), <https://www.lavanguardia.com/politica/20180112/434222776548/mujeres-parlament-lucha-espacio-politico.html>, accessed 1 December 2018.

³⁹ Cabré, “Aspectes sobre la neologia”, 57-68.

⁴⁰ María Teresa Cabré et al., “Evaluación de la vitalidad de una lengua a través de la neología. A propósito de la neología espontánea y de la neología planificada”, in Cabré et al., eds., *Lèxic i neologia*, 291.

Emilia Di Martino, *Celebrity Accents and Public Identity Construction: Analyzing Geordie Stylizations*
(London and New York: Routledge, 2019), 159 pp., ISBN: 978-0-367-22680-0

Reviewed by Esterino Adami

In this volume, Emilia Di Martino investigates the dimension of Geordie dialect and identity by turning a lens on the linguistic strategies adopted (and adapted) by a number of public figures. The scope of this innovative study does not merely concern the exploration of a particular dialectal variety, commonly associated with the city of Newcastle upon Tyne and the north-east of England, but rather it extends to include and examine the efforts that the exponents of various domains, in particular music, make in order to forge, popularize and commodify identity traits and discursive practices. Here the author applies a range of different analytical tools and frameworks to the emergence of new linguistic repertoires produced and circulated by singers, actors and others, and successfully demonstrates how this type of analysis has a great deal of insight to offer to understand the multiple correlations between language and identity. Di Martino's goal is to map out the complex processes by which high performances of a Geordie identity, i.e. public and planned interactions, become sociocultural models of being and belonging, for example by constructing and disseminating sentiments of coolness, desirability and innovation.

The first chapter provides a general frame for the research, clearly defining objectives, materials and approaches and methods employed by the author for the investigation. Within the background of Bakhtinian stylistics, for example, the author stresses the dialogic nature of linguistic performance and specifies that "the perspective is constructionist (rather than constructivist) in the sense that the focus is on the peculiarity of each individual's (verbal and non-verbal) product rather than on the individual itself" (4). Such a premise fully justifies and reinforces the important analytical work applied, in particular, to the field of music, seen as a social and emotional dimension through which individuals interact with each other, construct narratives and appropriate linguistic forms to reshape their own identity.

Chapter 2 specifically focuses on high performance of Geordieness by considering the BBC children's show *Dick and Dom in da Bungalow* with its carnivalesque dimension, "a world upside-down where good manners and polite language were tested and contested, and bad manners and bad language demanded equal dialogic status" (21, emphasis in the original). A number of passages from the TV programme are subjected to close reading and scrutiny with the aim to trace the indexical power of language to mark meaning making and meaning breaking processes. But the chapter also introduces the singer Cheryl, whose marked Geordie accent has received much public attention over the years. The artist is here viewed as a characterological agent, namely a public figure that is capable of manipulating a regional dialect, originally considered in mere geographical terms, and of recasting it in a social guise that conveys coolness and attractiveness. Such an operation of endorsement is grounded upon a number of strategies and modes, of course also with regard to the use of American English as the typical voice in the world of pop music.

Detachability of Geordie elements constitutes the core of the following chapter, which illustrates how Cheryl has managed to creatively transform dialectal features and enregister new identity makers. In particular, the chapter takes into account lexical items such as vernacular personal pronoun 'me' replacing the Standard English form 'my', the spread of connoted epitaph 'chav' and the traditional key

reference to social class overlapping images of Geordie and working-class members. Before the emergence of Cheryl, the manifestations of this accent were frequently related to a few creative contexts and genres such as music, sitcom series and films. In more recent times, Cheryl's performances and appearances have opened up and disseminated debates about the representational nature of language, thus "generating a chain of popular metadiscourses on accent in the public sphere, in which Geordie and coolness seem to have slowly become binomial and gradually turned into a winning pair" (59). In this light, the singer's repertoire comes to the fore as a sort of linguistic bricolage through which the value of authenticity is rewritten and goes in tandem with the sense of coolness.

Naturally, the reshaping, circulation and innovation of accent, dialect and voice foreground inner techniques of commodification, a theme which is dealt with in chapter 4. After examining materials from fields and genres as diverse as the reality TV show *Geordie Shore*, a Royal Navy TV advert and music, Di Martino returns to the central notion of authenticity, and brings in the example of the term *Brown*, "the semi phonetic spelling reflecting monophthongal pronunciation of the word *brown* used to refer to Newcastle Brown Ale" (91, emphasis in the original). The local dimension of a specific community leads to the marketization of a product and the creation of a revised token of authenticity in spite of the inner dynamics of globalised industries and businesses.

Chapters 5 and 6 are respectively dedicated to public acceptance in the creation of Geordie identity and local meanings and politics of Geordie styling. The former highlights the characterological figure of Cheryl, and the mediatized public responses to her performance, for example the parodic staging of a spoof Cheryl Tweeter account, triggered by John Duff and replete with phonetic Geordie, or the matching between fake and real forms of Geordie that eventually signals the production of effective expressive means. As the author argues, "social affiliation is a continuous process of relating to stances and perspectives displayed by co-participants in interaction, and expressing one's affiliation or disaffiliation also becomes a locus for creating and negotiating one's own identity" (108). In chapter 6, the focus is still on Cheryl's linguistic and semiotic manoeuvres, but at the same time attention is paid to the figure of Sting, whose vocal quality has shifted between different accents and levels in a broader reflection on dialect, perception and imagination.

The last chapter recapitulates the main issues that have been investigated, suggesting how the metamorphosis of Geordie and the acts of appropriation and abrogation operated by various celebrity figures, Cheryl *in primis*, in reality may be compared and contrasted with other linguistic scenarios in the world. The cases tackled by the book exhibit "a break in the links between Geordie and its geographical coordinates" (144), thus demonstrating how the astute handling of dialect and other semiotic resources may generate a deep impact on society in terms of mobility, innovation and performance, metaphorically applying centrifugal and centripetal forces to a cultural context. Emilia Di Martino's volume, thus, skilfully unfolds a number of sociolinguistic complexities and illustrations of identity, and as such contributes to a better understanding of some of the aspects of the intricate world we live in.

Julian Wolfreys ed., *New Critical Thinking: Criticism to Come*
(Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2017), 208 pp., ISBN 978-0-7486-9964-3

Reviewed by Lellida Marinelli

For its very essence, it is unlikely that a definition of critical thinking will be equally accepted by all. One of the possible definitions sees critical thinking as a way of processing information “in a creative and logical manner, challenging it, analysing it and arriving at considered conclusions which can be defended and justified” (Jennifer Moon, *Critical Thinking: An Exploration of Theory and Practice*, Routledge, 2008, 21). “Is there, any more, new critical thinking?” (Wolfreys, “Introduction”, 1). Such is the question Julian Wolfreys, the editor of *New Critical Thinking: Criticism to Come* poses and challenges at the very beginning of his introduction to the volume. The word ‘new’, in fact, signals that complex temporality within the “just now, the modern”, which can never be determined ahead. ‘New’ entails futurity, as expressed by the subtitle Wolfreys has chosen – a “to come” to be understood as the Derridean *avenir*, the only real but unexpected, unpredictable future.

With a title that may seem pretentious, this work is not exempt from the open debate as to what are the possible futures of, and how they are to be interpreted by, the ever-changing humanities. And critical thinking is engaged not to find an answer, but as the daily work of the academia, by means of which the question keeps being posed.

Where would the claimed novelty lie, then? The twelve essays in this collection, which deal with a wide range of very specialised topics, all introduce and present new perspectives into the texts they discuss. In fact, the contributors address key concepts such as modernity and historicity by intertwining them with issues on identity and discussing the experientiality of reading through a range of texts belonging to different genres – poetry, novels, travel writing, historiographic metafiction, microhistory, and philosophy. Going beyond any mechanical application of literary theory, each text is presented as the critic’s personal reading which led to the necessity of a critical engagement. Therefore, these essays make an attempt at changing the perception of what may be known by finding a way of making it unfamiliar. They do so by means of close reading. It may be argued that close reading, as a method, has itself stemmed from a theoretical approach, that of New Criticism; however, any good reading is “like a true critical reading, an experience, an encounter” (Wolfreys, 13), and a search for something that is present within the text, intended in a Barthesian way, and that awaits to be found every time one is confronted with it.

Such is the case of Mary Ann Caws’s “Turnings and Re-turnings”; Caws begins her enquiry into what modernity and modernism are to her by engaging with the idea of ‘the turn’, be it a simple turn in the road as in Nicolas de Stael’s painting *The Road* (1954), the physical movement of the character of Tazio in Thomas Mann’s *Death in Venice*, who is on the beach and turns to look at the shore, or “a returning to memory” in some passages of Virginia Woolf’s *To the Lighthouse*. This key idea allows her to conclude that modernism is more about what something turns to and points to, and is therefore about “learning by turning” – inwards, one may add.

Modernity is also revisited in Monika Szuba’s analysis of some of the ekphrastic poems by the Scottish contemporary poet John Burnside (“‘Peering into the Dark Machinery’: Modernity, Perception and the Self in John Burnside’s Poetry”). Szuba’s work may be seen as a reading of a reading: the poet “reads” paintings and explores, by means of the senses, his attraction to surfaces, like

the pool of water in Caravaggio's *Narcissus*, as places and non-places of tension between the inside and the outside.

If the fine line between fact and fiction is a well-known thread in studies on literary texts, it is all the more interesting when such line is present in disciplines as history. In "Reading Microhistory: Three Layers of Meaning", Anton Froeyman claims that there are three layers to microhistory – a genre of historical writing made popular by Carlo Ginzburg's *The Cheese and the Worms* (1976): a cognitive layer, an experiential level and an ethical level. However, what is striking is Froeyman's use of close reading to show how microhistorical writing makes use of narrative techniques – which he signals are also used in anthropology – such as telling the story of "how I got there", introducing readers to the historical context by using a character with which they may identify, and/or making use of direct discourse taken from documentary sources like trial hearings.

Another perspective on history is offered through historiographic metafiction. "Writing Fiction, Making History: Historical Narrative and the Process of Creating History" by Christine Berberich is an interesting reminder of how historiographical writing is not an act of reconstruction, but rather of construction, of one out of many plausible hypotheses on a past event. By drawing upon the work of Frank Ankersmit, she analyses Patrick Modiano's *The Search Warrant* (1997) and Laurent Binet's *HHhH* (2009): two novels on the holocaust which challenge the perception of the past and whose self-reflexivity serves as a reminder of how any narrative of the past, and therefore history itself, is a construction.

As anticipated, another main motif in this collection is the act of reading seen as a process, which is addressed in the last two contributions. It is worth mentioning J. Hillis Miller's "On First Looking into Derrida's *Glas*", as it is a personal recollection or rather a comparison between the memory of the author's first time reading *Glas* and his second reading experience. Miller's personal engagement in the essay, shown in his use of the first person and in the expressivity of some passages, renders it a remarkable example of the different possible forms of writing to which critical thinking may lead.

Hence, at a moment in time where theoretical approaches to texts are said to have come to a stasis, this collection of essays questions key concepts such as modernity and historicity, it explores issues on identity through the reading process which leads to acts of thinking from which experiences emerge. The twelve contributions in *New Critical Thinking: Criticism to Come*, which focus on different authors, genres, and historical periods, may be a precious resource taken individually. The book may also be seen as performative of a way of proceeding, an example of how critical thinking is put into practice through interdisciplinarity and close reading; given the experiential nature of the act itself, the latter is the one method which will always let "something unexpected" arrive.

Emilio Amideo, Ph.D. in English, is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow in English Language and Translation at the University of Naples ‘L’Orientale’. He was a visiting scholar both at Northwestern University (USA, 2015) and at Goldsmiths University of London (UK, 2016). His research interests include English Language and Translation Studies, Gender Studies, Black Diaspora Studies and Ecocriticism. He co-edited the miscellaneous volume *The Image in the World, the World in the Image* (2016), and published articles on James Baldwin, Isaac Julien, Thomas Glave, Keith Jarrett and Dean Atta. His forthcoming monograph *Queer Tidalectics* (Northwestern University Press) is due to be published in 2020.

Nicolangelo Becce is an Assistant Professor in American Literature at Roma Tre University. He earned his Ph.D. in Comparative Literature from University of Naples “L’Orientale” in 2010, and he worked as an Assistant Professor in English Language and American Literature at the University of Fukui (Japan). He published essays on American literature, corpus linguistics, the CEFR, American TV series and graphic novels. He is the author of *Apparizioni spiritiche e fantasmi letterari. Il Modern Spiritualism e lo sviluppo della ghost story* (2016) and *Positive Outcomes: A Corpus-Based Analysis of a Placement Interview System for EFL Students in Higher Education* (2019).

Cristina Carrasco is a Ph.D. candidate in Translation Studies and Cultural Mediation in the Department of Translation and Interpreting at the University of Salamanca. She has a degree in Translation and Interpreting by the University of Salamanca (Spain) and an M.A. in English Teaching. Her Ph.D., supervised by Dr. África Vidal, focuses on the translation of hybrid literary works written by female authors. Her main areas of study are Migration and Translation, Feminist Translation Theory, Hybrid Literature and the confluence of the Social Studies of the Body and Translation Studies.

Marilicia Di Paolo holds a Ph.D. in “Eurolanguages and specialized terminologies” from the University of Naples “Parthenope”, where she worked on her thesis titled “Las implicaciones jurídicas y los desarrollos conceptuales y terminológicos relativos a la orientación sexual, identidad y expresión de género”, a terminological analysis of LGBT vocabulary. She teaches “Spanish language” at the E-Campus Telematic University and at the University of Naples “Parthenope”. Moreover, she is teaching assistant at the University of Naples “L’Orientale”. Her areas of interest are: terminology and gender issues.

Eleonora Federici (M.A. and Ph.D., University of Hull, UK) is Associate Professor of English Language and Translation Studies at the University of Ferrara, Italy. Her main areas of research are literary and LSP translation, LSP (especially the languages of tourism and advertising), Gender Studies and Feminist Utopias and Science Fiction. She has published widely on specialized translation, translation and gender, postcolonial translation, cultural representations in media, CDA in tourism and advertising texts. She has edited journals’ monographic issues, the latest one with A. De Marco and A. Magnan Park “Language and Translation in the Pacific” for the *Journal of New Zealand and Pacific Studies* (2019). Among her books: *The Translator as Intercultural Mediator* (2006), *Translating Gender*

(2011), *Bridging the Gap between Theory and Practice in Translation and Gender Studies* (2013 with V. Leonardi), *Quando la fantascienza è donna. Dalle utopie del XIX secolo all'età contemporanea* (2015), *Translation Theory and Practice: Cultural Differences in Tourism and Advertising* (2018). She is actually working on a volume on Translation and Transnational Literatures. She has worked as a specialized translator and as a literary translator.

Lellida Marinelli holds a Laurea Magistrale (Master's Degree) in European and American Literatures and Cultures from the University of Naples 'L'Orientale'. In March 2019 she discussed her dissertation, entitled "The personal essay between hybridity and self-reflexivity: Deborah Levy's *Things I Don't Want to Know*". As part of her thesis, she also translated into Italian excerpts of Levy's essay.

María-Isabel García-Pérez is Associate Lecturer in Italian language at the University of Salamanca (Spain). Member of the Research Group "Escritoras y personajes femeninos en la literatura" (EPERFLIT), her research interests involve women's and gender studies, literature on organized crime, Italian crime fiction and adaptation studies. Her recent publications include: "Teresa Forcades: la Teología Desde una Perspectiva Feminista" (2018), "Autoridad y Poder: *La Paranza dei Bambini* de Roberto Saviano" (2018).

Federico Pio Gentile holds a Ph.D. in Literary, Linguistic and Comparative Studies at the University of Napoli 'L'Orientale'. His main research interests involve Canadian Studies, Multimodality, Specialised Discourse and Communication, Translation Studies and Media Studies. He has recently authored *La linguistica del delitto. Maureen Jennings e il caso di 'Poor Tom Is Cold', tra formulaicità e traduzione* (2015) and translated China Miéville's science fiction *Embassytown* into Italian (2016).

Antonio Lérida Muñoz has a degree in Translation and Interpreting from the University Pablo de Olavide (Spain). As a graduate student, he's working on the integration of a gender perspective into German children's literature through a Ph.D. on Translation. After years of teaching at German universities, he currently teaches at his alma mater, University Pablo de Olavide, where he tries to bring gender perspective into every single subject he teaches.

Luisa Marino is a Ph.D. Student in English Language and Translation at the University of Naples 'L'Orientale'. She earned a Master's Degree in Comparative Literatures and Cultures from the University of Naples "L'Orientale" with a dissertation entitled 'Scrittura e Traduzione come pratiche liminari. La traduzione di *Days and Nights in Calcutta* di Clark Blaise e Bharati Mukherjee'. She is currently researching in the field of Translation Studies, dealing specifically with Nigerian female writers and the linguistic representations of feminine bodies in translation. Her interests range from Translation Studies to Gender Studies and Post-colonial Studies. She is a literary translator from English and Portuguese.

Eleonora Sasso is Associate Professor in English at the "G. D'Annunzio" University of Chieti-Pescara (Italy). Her major research fields include Victorian literature and culture, the Pre-Raphaelites, cognitive linguistics, intersemiotic and audio-visual translation, and Canadian studies. She has translated into Italian W. M. Rossetti's *Some Reminiscences* and is author of four monographs, the most recent being

The Pre-Raphaelites and Orientalism: Language and Cognition in Remediations of the East (Edinburgh University Press). She is the editor of a book series entitled “Universale” published by Biblion (advisory board members include Carlo Bajetta, Susan Bassnett, Frederic Chaume Varela, Delia Chiaro, Jorge Díaz-Cintas, Tim Parks, and Sherry Simon).

Maria del Pino Valero Cuadra is a Lecturer in Translation (German and Spanish) at the University of Alicante (Spain) since 1996. She worked before during several years as Assistant Professor at the University of Bielefeld (Germany). She specializes in Spanish-German translation in Spain and Latin America, Didactics of Translation (German-Spanish), German Phraseology, German intercultural Literature and its translations as well as Translation and Gender in Children’s and Young Adults’ Literature. She is Member of the Research Groups FRASYTRAM (Phraseology and Translation) and (M)HISTRAD (History of Translation in Spain and Latin America).